



RESOLUTION 1325 AND DDR: ENGENDERING DYSFUNCTIONALITIES

*A case study on gender-oriented dysfunctions in United Nations Security
Council Resolution 1325*

Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master in
Political Science (MSc)

Master Thesis
Department of Political Science
Specialization: Conflict, Power and Politics
Nijmegen School of Management
Radboud University, Nijmegen, the Netherlands
August 27th, 2020
Supervisor: Dr. Thomas R. Eimer
Word count: 24264

Author: Nicole C. Heijnis (1047380)

Abstract

By passing Resolution 1325 on Women and Peace and Security on the 31st of October 2000, the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) acknowledged that women's increased participation in conflict resolution and prevention, as well as their protection during conflicts, is highly required. Armed conflicts have serious implications on gender norms, identities and roles of both men and women. Despite the adoption of Resolution 1325 two decades ago, there are evident dysfunctionalities in the gender-oriented approach in Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration (DDR) programs. Peacebuilding literature focuses particularly on outcome-based findings. This thesis adopts a different approach and demonstrates that the dysfunctionalities of DDR programs can be traced back to the wording of Resolution 1325. The research incorporates the securitization theory and the subaltern theory to analyse the conceptualisations of peace and gender. It uses document-analysis to employ a process-tracing method by analysing the agenda-setting phase, the negotiation phase and the implementation phase and finds evidence for two arguments. First, UN Security Council actors' narrow definition of peace and gender has resulted in the ignoring of economic and humanitarian dimensions, which are of importance to understand female ex-combatants' special needs. Second, the dialogue on women in armed conflict used by actors dominant in the creation of Resolution 1325 shows a discourse of victimization because of a Western understanding of gender aspects.

Keywords: Gender, UNSCR 1325, DDR, securitization, subaltern, peacebuilding

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I wish to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor dr. Thomas Eimer, assistant professor IR at Radboud University. Even though we only had a couple of meetings in person because of the global pandemic, Thomas would always find time online to offer guidance and answer questions regarding my research and writing. From the beginning Thomas allowed this thesis to be my own creation, however he would steer me in the right direction when he deemed necessary. I can only thank him very much for his words of support and encouragement for this thesis as well as the understanding chats about my personal circumstances.

Furthermore I would like to thank Nicolai Schenke, a friend and fellow student at Radboud University. Nicolai provided me with valuable comments in the middle of his summer holiday and I am gratefully indebted to him.

Next to that, I would like to address a few words to my family and my friends for their continued support during my academic career. To my parents, Frans Heijnis and Grace Joseph, and my sister Marni Heijnis; they have set me off on the road to this MSc a long time ago and I count myself very lucky to always have my supporting and loving family. Brody Isaac, thank you for taking great care of my well-being during this process; Liban Khalif and Remi Kloos, thank you for providing me with an encouraging smile and valuable comments.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge dr. J.A. Verbeek, professor at Radboud University as the second reader of this thesis. Thank you for your time and flexibility. A big thank you also goes to all other professors and students at the Nijmegen School of Management for making this extraordinary year a challenging yet unforgettable experience.

Table of contents

Abstract	2
Acknowledgements	3
Table of contents	4
Acronyms	6
1. Introduction.....	- 9 -
1.1 Background.....	- 9 -
1.2 Research question and theoretical framework.....	- 10 -
1.3 Methods	- 11 -
1.4 Academic and societal relevance	- 12 -
1.5 Structure.....	- 13 -
2. Theoretical framework.....	- 13 -
2.1 Peacebuilding in the academic literature.....	- 14 -
2.1.1 Modern conflicts and conflict resolution.....	- 16 -
2.2 Peacebuilding and Disarmament, Demobilisation and Reintegration	- 18 -
2.2.1 Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration	- 18 -
2.2.2 Gender and Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration.....	- 20 -
2.2.3 Critiques on Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration.....	- 22 -
2.3 Securitization theory	- 25 -
2.3.1 Securitization theory and gender	- 28 -
2.4 Subaltern theory	- 29 -
2.4.1 Postcolonial theory	- 31 -
2.4.2 Subaltern theory and gender	- 32 -
2.5 Conclusion.....	- 33 -
3. Research Design.....	- 34 -
3.1 Hypotheses and operationalization.....	- 34 -
3.1.1 Dependent variable	- 34 -
3.1.2 Independent variables	- 35 -
3.2 Case design.....	- 36 -
3.3 Method of enquiry.....	- 38 -
3.3.1 Explaining-Outcome Process Tracing and Document Analysis.....	- 38 -
3.4 Sources.....	- 39 -
3.5 Strengths and weaknesses	- 39 -
4. Empirical analysis	- 41 -
4.2 Agenda-setting phase.....	- 42 -
4.2.1 Case description.....	- 42 -
4.2.2 Analysis	- 52 -
4.3 Negotiation phase	- 54 -
4.3.1 Case description.....	- 54 -
4.3.2 Analysis	- 58 -
4.4 Implementation deficits.....	- 59 -

4.4.1 Case description.....	- 59 -
4.4.2 Analysis.....	- 63 -
5. Conclusion	- 64 -
6. References.....	- 68 -

Acronyms

AI	Amnesty International
ANSA	Armed Non-State Actor
BPFA	Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women
CS	Copenhagen School
DDM	Disarm and Dismantle Militias
DDR	Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration
ECLA	Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean
EEC	European Economic Community
FARC	Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia
GBSV	Gender-based sexual violence
GBV	Gender-based violence
HAP	the Hague Appeal for Peace
IA	International Alert
IDDRS	Integrated DDR Standards
IGO	Intergovernmental Organization
IO	International Organization
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NGOWG	NGO Working Group on Women, Peace and Security
SCR	Security Council Resolution
SSR	Security Sector Reform
UCDP	Uppsala Conflict Data Program
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNSCR	United Nations Security Council Resolution
UNTAG	United Nations Transition Assistance Group
UN WOMEN	United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women

WAC	Women's Artillery Commandos
WCRWC	Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children
WHO	World Health Organization
WILPF	Women's International League for Peace and Freedom
WPS	Women, Peace and Security

*“We cannot succeed when half of us are held back” –
Malala Yousafzai, 2017*

1. Introduction

1.1 Background

By passing resolution 1325 on ‘Women and Peace and Security’ (WPS) on the 31st of October 2000, the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) acknowledged that women’s increased participation in conflict resolution and prevention as well as their protection during conflicts is highly required. For the first time in its history the UN also recognized that male and female ex-combatants require different needs in Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration (DDR) programmes. Armed conflicts have serious implications on gender norms, identities and roles of both men and women. Resolution 1325 develops an agenda for the interconnection and interdependency between women, peace and security and outlines that gender needs to be mainstreamed into peace and security policies. It is thus a landmark document, the adoption of a gender approach to women’s experiences in conflict and post-conflict situations within the resolution a historic milestone.

Before UNSC Resolution 1325 (UNSCR 1325), it wasn’t officially recognized that violence both in the conflict and post-conflict periods have different impacts on the experience of men and women, which implicates significant gender dimensions in UNSC resolutions. The Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, adopted in 1995, stressed the importance of ensuring that a gender perspective was reflected in all UN policies and programs, however the declaration was an agenda for women’s overall empowerment and aimed more at accelerating the implementation of gender-equality in general. The 1325 resolution specifically emphasized the relevance of the role of gender in DDR programmes and acknowledged that women are an important asset to peace and security in post-conflict environments. The lack of a gender-responsive DDR since before the passing of resolution 1325 meant that the main types and roles women and girls took part in during conflicts were ignored, which allowed vulnerable groups to go unprotected from structural violence and it thwarted women’s participation in post-conflict decision-making bodies.¹ The disproportionate and unique impact that conflict has on women was not addressed by the Council beforehand. The resolution has thus been ground-breaking both because of its in-depth commitment to change the norm on gender-dimensions within DDR programmes and because of its scope within UN operations itself.

Despite the passing of UNSCR 1325 two decades ago, there are still evident dysfunctionalities in the wording of the resolution, arguably resulting in dysfunctionalities in

¹ ‘[What is DDR],’ n.d.

the gender-oriented approach in DDR programs. This thesis will investigate said dysfunctionalities by examining the wording of the resolution itself. Firstly, the concept of peace as described within the resolution assumes a definition in which peace is the absence of violence. Consequently, ‘violence’ is conceptualized as gender-based and linked with armed conflict, which is problematized in this thesis as it allows to exclude the (political) agency of women, further alienating women’s needs. To elaborate, by defining peace as the absence of violence, it allows to ignore economic and humanitarian rights which are inherent to sustainable peace. Furthermore, women are regarded as victims rather than as combatants, neglecting female ex-combatants’ needs. Secondly, this thesis aims to analyse the implications of the conceptualization of ‘women’, specifically ‘gender’ in UNSCR 1325 in order to understand the lack of a clear definition of female ex-combatants special needs. Three main constructions on this concept are noted in UNSCR 1325. First, women are represented as actors in need of protection. Secondly, women are regarded as informal political organizers. Finally, women are constructed as formal political actors.² These constructions may be the base for the fundamental flaws in UNSCR 1325 and consequently dysfunctional gender-oriented DDR programs.

The existing policy literature on the dysfunctionalities in the gender-oriented DDR approach is focused on the continued marginalization of women within DDR programmes and the gap between policy guidelines and practical implementation. Most literature post-UNSCR 1325 aims to analyse the reasons why there exists a consistent dysfunctionality between enhancing women’s empowerment and gender equality in post-conflict programs and looks at the implementation gaps in these programs. This thesis aims to adopt a narrower approach and assumes that the dysfunctionalities of DDR programs can be traced back to the wording of UNSCR 1325. For this reason, the thesis attempts to explain the dynamics which led to these fundamental flaws.

1.2 Research question and theoretical framework

This thesis aims to answer the following research question:

What explains the gender-oriented dysfunctionalities in United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325?

² George & Shepherd, 2016, p. 116

To substantiate the above-mentioned argument, this thesis examines two theories. These two theories formulate the most dominant, different and plausible explanations to the research question. First of all, the securitization theory perspective will be examined and applied to study the gender-oriented approach in DDR programmes within UN gender policies. This theory challenges the traditional approaches to security in international relations by identifying issues as security issues, which constitutes of structuring the rhetoric of decision-makers and securitising actors framing issues in a way that lifts them above the political realm.³ Applied to the argument of this thesis, the core message of using this theory is to analyse whether public actors have framed the concept of gender from developmental to securitised and what effect this has had on the dysfunctionalities within the resolution. The theory assumes that public actors exclusively present political problems as security issues, and hereby ignore other underlying dimensions such as gender-related issues. Adopting the securitisation framework could limit the scope of gender-oriented DDR programs which is why there could be evident dysfunctionalities.

Second of all, the subaltern theory will be analysed to find an alternative explanation to the dysfunctionalities in gender-oriented DDR approaches. This theory studies the post-colonial, continued Western dominance over non-Western peoples.⁴ The subaltern theory assumes that predominantly Western societal actors have contributed to politicising the concept of gender in the UNSC which excludes the political agency of the marginalized and neglects the demands of the targeted communities in gender-oriented DDR programs.

1.3 Methods

To aim to understand and provide an answer to the research question, this thesis aims to bridge discussions in academic literature and policy literature on dysfunctionalities in gender-oriented DDR programs. To do so, an in-depth qualitative case study on UNSCR 1325 will be conducted. In order to examine this case, an interpretative case study will be operated as it lends theories to analyse and explain the case.⁵ The securitization theory (X1) and the subaltern theory (X2) will be used as independent variables, researching the empirical data and collecting evidence to test the two identified hypotheses. Through document-based process tracing, this thesis will focus on finding pathways and combinations of causal mechanisms that have an

³ Eroukhmanoff, 2017, p. 104

⁴ Spivak, 1988; Eimer, 2020

⁵ Odell, 2001

effect on the dependent variable: the dysfunctional wording of UNSCR 1325 (Y1), which entails

- a) vocabulary focusing on the absence of violence;
- b) the lack of a clear definition of what the special needs of female ex-combatants are.

Causal mechanisms are used to investigate the research question. Said mechanisms are “intervening processes through which causes exert their effects”.⁶ George & Bennett state that process-tracing is commonly used as a method to trace a sequence of events, leading up to an outcome and can therefore be considered a chronological account.⁷ This research method suits this thesis as primary and secondary sources will be analysed in order to find the explaining-outcome, backward looking approach⁸. To optimize the empirical evidence, the analysis in this thesis is structured over the three phases leading up to the creation of resolution 1325: the agenda-setting phase, the negotiation phase and the policy-output phase. In addition, the analysis relies on secondary data and uses a qualitative approach that draws from the UN, UN specialized agencies, governmental, non-governmental and academic literature and (news) databases. This diversity of sources gives a holistic understanding of the interconnectedness of socioeconomic and political factors underlying the dysfunctions in the creation of gender-sensitive policies and the structures and processes before the implementation of said policies.

1.4 Academic and societal relevance

The academic relevance of this Master’s thesis is to outline the shortcomings of gender-oriented actions in UNSCR 1325 that only recently have become a subject of interest amongst scholars. Existing literature on the dysfunctions of gender-responsive DDR programs is limited, as at the time of writing resolution 1325 has been the base for such policies for just two decades and so this study attempts to supplement existing literature and fill the gap in research. In addition, research on the dysfunctions in gender-responsive DDR programs focuses particularly on outcome-based findings, e.g. the results of programs and the shortcomings in hindsight. This thesis aims to provide an answer based on the procedures and structures before the implementation of DDR to explain its dysfunctions in the results. Accordingly, this approach in combination with two influential theories adds a new perspective to the existing literature.

⁶ George & Bennett, 2005

⁷ George & Bennett, 2005

⁸ Beach & Pedersen, 2013, p. 12

The societal relevance of this Master's thesis is to contribute to a more comprehensive understanding of peacebuilding that overcomes the prevailing eurocentrism. Gender-oriented DDR programmes aim to deal with security and stability and are intended to contribute to recovery and development of (female) ex-combatants in post-conflict environments.⁹ The development of frameworks and definitions of concepts within DDR programmes play a pivotal factor in the success or failure of inclusive DDR programmes and it is thus of the utmost importance to research this topic in order to address shortcomings and strengthen and achieve inclusive post-conflict, gender-oriented UN policies.¹⁰

1.5 Structure

This thesis is structured as follows. The following chapter will discuss the theoretical framework which provides an overview of peacebuilding literature, gender-oriented DDR programmes as well as the chosen theoretical approaches. A literature review of the securitization and of the subaltern theory will be incorporated. Thereafter, the third chapter will demonstrate the research design, describing the justifications for the chosen methods of enquiry, the sources that have been researched and the identified strengths and weaknesses. Chapter four demonstrates an overview of this thesis' case study, the empirical analysis of the collected data and tests the hypotheses. Finally, the last chapter will extensively discuss this thesis' findings focusing on the effect of the independent variables on the dependent one, initiating a discussion and making recommendations for further research.

2. Theoretical framework

This chapter lays the foundation for this thesis approach to understand and analyse the research puzzle as it describes the conceptual, empirical and practical contributions in literature. I aim to analyse the reasons why there are evident dysfunctionalities in gender-sensitive DDR policies, by focusing on literature that helps to discern the influence of procedures and structures in theories before they led to the creation of resolution 1325. It begins with an overview of contributions to peacebuilding literature in which I focus on the history of peacebuilding and the elements and concepts it compasses. Next, through a brief overview of conflict resolution, DDR and its relation to gender will be described to comprehend the components of DDR, the policies of DDR as well as the shortcomings and current challenges.

⁹ United Nations, 2000

¹⁰ United Nations Development Fund for Women, 2004

Then, an overview of the securitization theory and the subaltern theory is provided to form a base of which hypotheses are deduced to lay a foundation for the empirical analysis. This chapter ends with a conclusion.

2.1 Peacebuilding in the academic literature

International peacebuilding interventions in post-conflict environments has been an important issue to address ever since the end of the Cold War, when the UN made it the international community's concern to construct sustainable, long term peace in war-torn countries. One of the main reasons for the UN to actively pursue peacebuilding operations in the aftermath of the Cold War, was because there existed a stability between the US and the Soviet Union which resulted in a peacebuilding mandate under UN Chapter VI and VII of the UN Charter.¹¹ Resurgence of war in post-conflict is an urgent matter as societies are more prone to experience a reoccurrence of conflict and violence.¹² Peacebuilding became a new theoretical combination of international relations, public administration and comparative politics in the 1990s and a multidisciplinary post-conflict phenomenon to bridge human security and economic development in order to reduce the level of violence and support sustainable peace. Literature focused on when, how and why certain interventions were successful in bringing sustainable peace to post-conflict societies by studying the mechanisms through which the international community supported post-conflict states.¹³ This liberal institutionalist perspective in the literature measures success of peacebuilding initiatives through analyzing the implementation and scope of peacebuilding mandates. Researchers have found that peacekeeping operations are more successful and peace lasts longer when international assistance is present to support domestic parties.¹⁴ The focus in literature shifted towards analysis on methodological and theoretical accuracy to be able to make generalizations on systematic causal arguments across cases and to further study the factors enhancing and impeding sustainable peace. Other scholars used a sociological or constructivist-institutionalist approach by studying the legitimate norms of statehood, the mechanisms of international organizations and operative frames used in peacebuilding operations.¹⁵ A more ontological, rationalist perspective can be seen in

¹¹ Chapter VI authorizes the UN to issue recommendations and Chapter VII authorizes the Security Council to use forceful measures when deemed necessary. Charter of the United Nations 1945

¹² Collier et al., 2003; Quinn et al., 2007

¹³ Bellamy & Williams, 2004

¹⁴ Fortna, 2004; Walter, 2002

¹⁵ Autesserre, 2010; Barnett, 2006

peacebuilding literature focusing on the shortcomings and challenges of theories of international governance for strongly connecting political policy and peacebuilding practice.¹⁶

While the level playing field of international organizations and donor states is discussed extensively, it is evident that existing literature focuses too little on studying causal political structures. There is limited attention for the dynamics and effectiveness of cooperation between international organizational bodies and domestic structures and actors. Scholars argue that this is an evident theoretical shortcoming throughout most of the research on peacebuilding literature and aim to emphasize the importance of effective and sustainable peacebuilding operations by taking into account domestic factors such as persistent political instability, chronic underdevelopment and weak and corrupt governance.¹⁷ Other critiques of scholars read that the implementation of peacebuilding is done by predominantly external powers providing donor-driven assistance and implement a “Weberian bureaucracy, liberal democracy and neoliberal economics”¹⁸ in societies with no vote in the process as they are emerging from conflict.¹⁹ It is argued that local and indigenous practices are overlooked in establishing governance and that international norms get imposed on the recipient state which disregard factors that could enhance appropriate peacebuilding. To elaborate, in their book about the ongoing crisis in the Darfur region, Brosché & Rothbart (2013) examine four distinct but interconnected conflicts and the failed peace agreements. In their findings, the authors discuss the social identity theory which influences international perspectives and shapes thinking about ethnic tribes and local communities.²⁰ It is stated that the interaction between a collective identity and several (non)state-armed groups and domestic elites plays a much bigger part in the source of violence and conflict than what is discussed in peacebuilding literature. Moreover, the exclusion of tribal groups in mediation discussions hindered peacebuilding initiatives and successful implementation of it.

However, it is evident that bringing (political) order to post-conflict states through state building and democratization helps post-conflict countries build effective and legitimate institutions and governments.²¹ Peacebuilding interventions help to normalize relations between parties in conflict, and is the most transformative type of peacekeeping. As defined by the UN, peacebuilding refers to the “efforts to assist countries and regions in their

¹⁶ Grant & Keohane, 2005; Krasner, 2004

¹⁷ Barma, 2016, p. 21

¹⁸ Barma, 2016, p. 2; Chandler, 1992; Pugh, 2004

¹⁹ Ginty & Richmond, 2013

²⁰ Brosché & Rothbart, 2013, p. 192

²¹ Barma, 2016, p. 10

transitions from war to peace and to reduce a country's risk of lapsing or relapsing into conflict by strengthening national capacities for conflict management, and laying the foundations for sustainable peace and development’’.²² Peacebuilding involves monitoring ceasefires; demobilizing and reinstating combatants; monitoring and helping to organize elections of a new government; supporting justice and security sector reforms (SSR); assisting the return of displaced persons and refugees; enhancing human rights protections and fostering reconciliation after atrocities. Sustainable peace is a process achieved not just at the diplomatic level but includes opposing sides both on the local and international level and it consists of domestic stakeholders and local people which is an approach that is unique for every conflict. Still, conflict resolution has universal elements which need to be considered. For example, the inclusion of different stakeholders needs to be present, as does the political will to allow for mediation and accommodation. Next to that, there needs to be a necessity of synergy at various levels within the process and confidence-building measures need to be implemented so settlements can be realized.²³

2.1.1 Modern conflicts and conflict resolution

To comprehend and analyse peacebuilding initiatives, one must look at conflict resolution. Conflict resolution is a main concept in the domain of conflict studies. In a broad definition, we can conceive of conflict resolution as ‘‘any marked reduction in social conflict as a result of a conscious settlement of issues in dispute’’ occurring through ‘‘self-conscious efforts to come to an agreement, or it may come by other means (environmental change, the influence of third parties, victory for one party, and so on.)’’.²⁴ To attempt to resolve conflicts, one must be able to approach conflicts with a neutral attitude. However, this is a difficult element of conflict resolution: conflict is present in everyone’s daily life and is inherently associated with the bad and the negative; the undesirable. Indeed, conflict is a social phenomenon which shapes relationships, stimulates change and can redefine personal identities. In conflict resolution, there are broadly four types of perspectives that are the foundation for all theories that have developed in conflict studies.²⁵ The first approach is the individual characteristics theories which analyses the natures of the individuals involved in the conflict. Secondly, social process theories study the social interaction between actors involved in conflict with the aim to make

²² ‘‘[Maintain International Peace and Security],’’ n.d.

²³ ‘‘[Maintain International Peace and Security],’’ n.d.

²⁴ Schellenberg, 1996, p. 9

²⁵ Schellenberg, 1996, p. 12

generalizations about the process of resolution. Third, social structural theories see conflict as a product of societal structures and the organized nature of societies. Lastly, formal theories examine social conflicts in logical, empirical terms.

Since the 1990s, scholars have emphasized the changed nature of conflicts.²⁶ Interstate wars have declined sharply since the end of the Second World War as the founding of the UN made sure a collaborative international community would strive towards peace and address every threat to peace with appropriate measures. The development of modern technology, the increasing importance of international, NGOs and governmental organizations and the establishment of international agencies cooperating on the base of international agreements has led to a decreasing likelihood of interstate wars. However, nuclear proliferation and abuse of high-technology systems have added new threats to international security, and more specifically, have increased the likelihood of intrastate conflicts. Intrastate conflicts are mainly conflicts in which nonstate, warlike organizations or actors oppose the state and want to defeat the national sovereignty. Examples of those organizations are guerillas, terrorist organizations and organized-crime syndicates such as the Afghan Taliban and the Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia (FARC). In intrastate conflicts, totalitarian methods are used to conquer attributes of the state and set up political, legal, social and military institutions through violence, corruption, elections, political compromise or ideological cogency.

Furthermore, hybrid and proxy warfare are new approaches to conventional warfare. Conflict resolution since the 1990s has responded to re-orient itself from managing conflict between big powers to focusing on fragile states which are prone to intrastate conflicts and warfare. However, scholars argue that this shift is not necessarily effective as large-scale organized conflict extends beyond the borders of fragile states. ‘Violent democracies’²⁷ such as Mexico, Israel and the Philippines, violent autocracies such as in Central Asia and the Gulf and rising populism in Western societies poses a threat to security on a scale that is inadequately addressed by current conflict resolution initiatives.²⁸ The Uppsala Conflict Data Program (UCDP) has noted a substantial increase in the number of intrastate and internationalized intrastate conflicts since 2011, disrupting power balances and threatening sovereignty.²⁹ This calls for the UN to keep adopting a renewed focus on conflict resolution which is more adaptable to a more holistic approach to sustainable peace and security.

²⁶ Kaldor, 1999; Berdal, 1996, p. 7

²⁷ Arias & Goldstein in Taylor, 2011

²⁸ Clingendael, 2017, p. 2

²⁹ Melander, Pettersson & Themnér, 2016, pp. 727-742

2.2 Peacebuilding and Disarmament, Demobilisation and Reintegration

Generally, disarmament, demobilisation and reintegration (DDR) is called for in three main situations, namely to assist governments in downsizing state armies and armed groups; the disbanding of armed groups and militias and lastly to support (local) law enforcement.³⁰ DDR lays the foundations for building long-term peace, security and development in post-conflict areas. It is part of the UN peacebuilding and reconstruction effort and it contributes to security and stability by disarming, demobilizing and reintegrating male and female ex-combatants in communities in which they can be self-sustaining and actively involved in peacebuilding efforts.³¹ In DDR, disarmament is focused on the collection, control, documentation and disposal of arms, ammunition, explosives, and weapons in the possession of ex-combatants and the local population. Demobilization aims to formally discharge combatants from armed forces by placing said combatants in temporary facilities and starting a process of reinsertion. During the reinsertion phase the ex-combatants get short-term, transitional assistance which is necessary prior to the reintegration phase. This last process transforms ex-combatants to civilians, and is an economic and social process directly at the local level which requires long-term external assistance.³²

2.2.1 Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration

DDR programs have played increasingly important roles in peacekeeping and post-conflict resolution processes. It is an instrument to the peacebuilding framework, and can be regarded as the cornerstone of peacebuilding. Yet, DDR simultaneously is a complex program as it is implemented in complex contexts. Armed groups, conflict mediators, and the international community are actors involved in peace negotiations, with the task to address security dilemmas in post-conflict environments in order to transition from conflict to peace. From the late 1980s onwards, DDR programmes have facilitated this transition process and focused on the most vulnerable actors involved in violent conflicts to become active participants in the peace process. DDR designs context-specific programmes and mandates to help and support people who have participated in armed groups in conflict.³³ In addition, DDR programmes ultimately reduce the risk of recurrence of conflict and support combatants transition into civilian life. To recognize and bridge the different definitions of what exactly entails DDR, the

³⁰ UNDDR Report, 2006

³¹ UNDDR Report, 2006

³² UNDDR Report ,2006

³³ “[What is DDR],” n.d.

UN initiated the drafting of the Integrated DDR Standards (IDDRS) in 2004 to outline “a set of policies, guidelines and procedures for UN-sponsored DDR programs in a peacekeeping context”.³⁴

As the IDDRS outlined the policies, consensus had to be reached over the DDR definition. IDDRS provides the most recent and broadly accepted definition of DDR. IDDRS defines disarmament as “the collection, documentation, control and disposal of small arms, ammunition, explosives and light and heavy weapons of combatants and often also of the civilian population. Disarmament also includes the development of responsible arms management programs”.³⁵ The disarmament phase of DDR aims at providing ex-combatants the means to hand over their arms and prevent future hostilities. Disarmament programs for instance include incentives to combatants for turning in weapons such as cash payments. Partial disarmament has proven to risk an increase in violence and conflict and it is thus of importance that this phase is carried out effectively.³⁶ The demobilisation phase focuses on decreasing the numbers of participants in armed groups in order to begin their transition into civilian life. IDDRS defines it as follows:

Demobilization is the formal and controlled discharge of active combatants from armed forces or other armed groups. The first stage of demobilization may extend from the processing of individual combatants in individual centres to the massing of troops in camps designated for this purpose (cantonment sites, encampments, assembly areas, or barracks). The second stage of demobilization encompasses the support package provided to the demobilised, which is called reinsertion³⁷

IDDRS’ definition of demobilization emphasizes the discharge of individual combatants and military structures in a broader context compared to earlier UN definitions of demobilization. It is a strategy to accumulate personal information on ex-combatants through cantonment to be able to create specific reintegration programs. Furthermore, it is a political tool to demonstrate willingness and effectiveness of the peace process.³⁸ A longer-term process of reintegration follows. Reintegration is defined separately by IDDRS as the following:

Reintegration is the process by which ex-combatants acquire civilian status and gain sustainable employment and income. Reintegration is essentially a social and economic process with an open time-frame, primarily taking place in communities at the local

³⁴ United Nations IDDR, 2006, p. 4

³⁵ United Nations IDDR, 2006, p. 6

³⁶ Kingma, 1999, p. 9

³⁷ United Nations IDDR, 2006, p. 6

³⁸ Knight & Özerdem, 2004, p. 508

level. It is part of the general development of a country and a national responsibility, and often necessitates long-term external assistance³⁹

In the reintegration process, an assistance system aids ex-combatants transition fully into civilian life. Prior to this process, assistance in the form of reinsertion is offered. The amount of reinsertion assistance offered to combatants varies as the programmes collect individual needs assessments, a rank, and the number of years with an armed group of a certain individual. IDDRS' definition of reinsertion is regarded as a short-term process, and therefore making it different from long term reintegration. Reinsertion is defined as:

The assistance offered to ex-combatants during demobilization but prior to the longer-term process of reintegration. Reinsertion is a form of transitional assistance to help cover the basic needs of ex-combatants and their families and can include transitional safety allowances, food, clothes, shelter, medical services, short-term education, training, employment and tools. While reintegration is a long-term, continuous social and economic process of development, reinsertion is a short-term material and/or financial assistance to meet immediate needs, and can last up to one year⁴⁰

The DDR process has received much academic attention and the review of the current literature shows an increase in focus on women, gender and DDR.⁴¹ DDR has shifted from a minimalist security-focused intervention to a holistic, developmental maximalist programme with the aim to support transitional justice and state-building. Within this transition, UNSCR 1325 has posed a framework as the final stage of DDR conceptualizations by narrowing down the gender lens in DDR processes. This means that using international humanitarian law, international human rights law and international criminal law, women's basic human rights in transitional justice and criminal justice as part of post-conflict programmes are finally taken into account as well as protected.

2.2.2 Gender and Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration

The inclusion of women in peace processes and the positive effects this brings has been researched extensively by the Graduate Institute in Geneva over a timespan of four years. It found a positive correlation in the chance that a peace agreement in a post-conflict setting would be reached when women's groups had had a strong effect and influence on the negotiation processes. Next to that, it also correlated with a higher chance of the agreement

³⁹ United Nations IDDR, 2006, p. 7

⁴⁰ United Nations IDDR, 2006, p. 7

⁴¹ Muggah, 2009

actually being implemented.⁴² Similar evidence was found stating that when women are present, peace agreements are 64% less likely to fail.⁴³ Furthermore, statistical analysis conducted on 181 peace agreements between 1989 and 2011 showed that women included in peace processes increase the durability of the peace agreement lasting for at least two years by twenty percent.⁴⁴ The gender-dimension in DDR programmes contributes to the overall effectiveness of post-conflict economic activities and economic growth, and it increases the social outcomes of economic recovery measures which influence long-term sustainable development. Complementing this argument, the UN Women Global study found that women are more likely to spend their income on education and healthcare and in that way proportionally contribute more to post-conflict social recovery.⁴⁵ Furthermore, food security is a vital point to be addressed in post-conflicts environments and as women are traditionally the managers of natural resources, including them in DDR processes leads to positive results for food security and increasing women's status within the community. Moreover, the study found that in Rwanda female farmers who were targeted by DDR specifically helped increase the potential for the agriculture sector as an engine for economic growth as their inclusion resulted in an increase in production yield.⁴⁶

Similarly, it is argued that to both strengthen long-term and short-term commitments and targets, respectively the restoration of physical security and development, women have to play their part too.⁴⁷ Focusing on women who not only have been ex-combatants but enlarging the scope to women who have been support workers, dependants of male combatants or wives, will contribute to restoring human security and establish the path for a more sustainable development process. Additionally, adopting a gender-oriented approach reduces the chance of re-recruiting women.⁴⁸

Next to that, scholars note that specifically women are quick to recognize when ‘‘the local language changes in favour of extremism’’.⁴⁹ Women have a different social positioning as men have and are therefore important agents to notice extremism and to organize appropriate action.⁵⁰ This complements the argument that women have a unique awareness of communal needs and can therefore help develop better bottom-up strategies or communicate post-conflict

⁴² UN Women, 2015, p. 41

⁴³ Gbowee, 2015, p. 10; Prash, 2015

⁴⁴ UN Women, 2015, p. 45

⁴⁵ UN Women, 2015, p. 171

⁴⁶ UN Women, 2015, pp. 171-172

⁴⁷ Bouta, 2005, p. 12

⁴⁸ Bouta, 2005, p. 13

⁴⁹ Sandole & Staroste, 2015, p. 127

⁵⁰ Hunt, 2012

necessities within communities. The UN recognizes the gender dimension in DDR and stresses the importance of designing programmes “to encourage gender equality based on gender-sensitive assessments that take into account these different experiences, roles and responsibilities during and after conflict”⁵¹ and “encourages all those involved in the planning for disarmament, demobilisation and reintegration to consider the different needs of female and male ex-combatants and to take into account the needs of their dependants”.⁵² This multidimensional approach to creating security and stability in post-conflict environments is a politically driven process and is highly dependent on both the willingness of recipient states to cooperate as well as the involved parties in conflict to demilitarize. The role of the UN is to demobilize part of the state armies or regular armed forces to be able to transition to peacetime and allow for reconstruction and development. In addition, the UN disbands of irregular or informal armed groups by restructuring existing armed forces and re-establishing legislation controlling arms. This comprehensive process in which the UN takes a leading role is at the core of peacebuilding and affects various dimensions of which gender is an increasingly more important one.

2.2.3 Critiques on Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration

However, there are numerous challenges DDR programmes are faced with. In policy and research, the continued changing concepts in DDR have led to a ‘second generation DDR’.⁵³ Policies in the renewed DDR are focused on disarming and dismantling militias (DDM), developing alternative approaches to disarmament and aim to provide more support for at-risk youth. Related to the issue of concepts is making the distinction between civilians and combatants both in and post warfare to decide eligibility for DDR benefits. Similarly, the difference between armed non-state actors (ANSAs) and armed non-statutory actors is hard to determine, and this adds to the complexity of interventions and scope of DDR programs.⁵⁴ Muggah (2007) suggests that the assumption that DDR is causally related to the prevention of the resurgence of war and a reduction in violence is empirically unfounded as DDR programs are said to be mismatched to reality. Next to that, scholars argue that the assumptions of what work in the field of DDR entails, are not explicitly stated.⁵⁵ Equivalently within policy literature, the role of the UN and the terminologies in individual DDR programmes is stated to

⁵¹ UN DDR, 2006

⁵² UN DDR, 2006

⁵³ Coletta & Muggah, 2009

⁵⁴ Jensen & Stepputat, 2001

⁵⁵ De Vries & Wiegnikk, 2011

differ for every context, specifically the meaning of ‘R’ in DDR; it is used for example as rehabilitation, reunification, repatriation and resettlement.⁵⁶

Similarly, the complexity of the process is not the only challenge scholars identify in DDR. It is argued that disarmament is the main political focus and scholars view DDR as a military-centred perspective, unable to effectively coordinate with peacebuilding initiatives and disregarding socioeconomic needs. Security and military objectives in DDR are said to be prioritized over social development, making DDR a short-term security blueprint. Moreover, DDR cannot produce or guarantee development of participants or beneficiaries nor can it combat the proliferation of small arms and light weapons on a long-term base. Ex-combatants might or might not successfully reintegrate into civilian society and unsuccessful monitoring of the collected weapons (often absorbed into the states military) can result in trade on illegal markets.⁵⁷

To elaborate, gender-specific problems are of special interest to this thesis’ argument, namely the problems of DDR implementation with regards to gender questions can be traced back to the resolution itself. Literature on gender-oriented DDR programmes show an extensive list of shortcomings.⁵⁸ The passing of United Nations (UN) resolution 1325 meant that the topic of gender in relation to armed conflict and post-conflict had been put on the agenda of the UN. Paragraph 13 of the resolution reads: ‘‘encourages all those involved in the planning for disarmament, demobilization and reintegration to consider the different needs of female and male ex-combatants and to take into account the needs of their dependants’’.⁵⁹ The acknowledgement of the upsurge of women’s participation in armed groups⁶⁰ and the development of gender-sensitive post-conflict policies does not translate into the successful inclusion of women in DDR. More particularly, scholars find that women in DDR programs overwhelmingly do not participate at all.⁶¹ In post-conflict settings, female ex-combatants are a particularly high-risk group prone to different types of violence and general aggression. However, the gendered nature of the reintegration process excludes women’s necessities in demobilisation programs and their participation in disarmament often is discouraged because of its association with masculinity.⁶² Traditionally, women have been characterized as victims

⁵⁶ Rufer, 2005

⁵⁷ Ball & Van De Goor, 2006

⁵⁸ The following four paragraphs are my own work previously handed in to successfully complete the course 1920 Gender, Conflict and International Institution (3 V) MAN-MGEM001-2019-3-V, semester 2019/2020, lecturer dr. J.M. Joachim, followed at Radboud University, Nijmegen, the Netherlands

⁵⁹ United Nations Security Council, 2000, Article 13

⁶⁰ Throughout this thesis, I will use the terms ‘‘armed groups’’ to denote irregular armed groups and armed forces

⁶¹ Arnett, 2015, p. 4

⁶² Arnett, 2015, p. 4

of warfare and armed conflict rather than perpetrators of violence.⁶³ Women are mothers, caregivers, nurturers and wives and lovers; supporting men who are fighting the battle and taking care of the domestic spheres. Women are seen as peaceful, whereas men are regarded as violent aggressors. The problematic masculine association is that the common portrayal of women and girls is as victims in conflict, suffering at the hands of violent male combatants.⁶⁴ An ex-combatant, as such, is often seen as a man rather than as a woman, whilst women play a significant role in conflicts and can constitute up to 30% of the armed forces.⁶⁵ Women's increased participation is due to voluntary action, conscription, but also abduction and forcible recruitment. This increased participation challenges the institutionalized gender roles of women and girls in conflict. As a result, female ex-combatants are often overlooked despite the member states of the UN recognizing that in order to achieve sustainable and durable peace, the full participation and involvement and equal participation of women in post-conflict resolution and peace-building is required. Moreover, scholars identify the continuation of international organizations (IOs), government departments, international charities and social movements confirming existing gender stereotypes in regards to the training in skills and education.⁶⁶ Because funds are allocated for traditionally feminine field trainings that will provide women with the skills to develop a sustainable livelihood in a post-conflict environment, the skills women develop during their time in combat are disregarded. Next to that, women tend to hide their identity as they fear negative stigmatization and they tend to disappear after the war as the post-conflict situation often expects women to go back to their traditional roles as caring, peaceful wives.⁶⁷ Their (economic) position in society is stigmatized which possibly worsens their development. Similarly, scholars state that pushing women back into traditional gender roles discourages them from participating in DDR programmes, as these roles do not prepare them to provide for themselves independently and thus have not been thought through.

As extensively (one could argue, exhaustively) covered in literature on the role of women in combat, women are often regarded as the victims of war and violence, rather than them being their own agents.⁶⁸ The consequences that follow from this notion are that female ex-combatants are overlooked, ignored, and excluded. Moreover, the narrow definition of only

⁶³ Jacques & Taylor, 2009, p. 505

⁶⁴ Coulter et al., 2008

⁶⁵ Arnett, 2015, p. 2

⁶⁶ MacKenzie, 2012

⁶⁷ Barth, 2002

⁶⁸ Jacques & Taylor, 2009, p. 505

those carrying weapons are considered to be ex-combatants means that women have to prove that they were active agents in war and often rely on male superiors to confirm their status in order to be eligible to participate in DDR programmes.⁶⁹ Putting men at the responsibility or decisive position as to whether female ex-combatants can get access to resources through DDR programs marginalizes women's positions and possibly depoliticizes them after conflict.⁷⁰ Women are victimized in narratives on war and violence and regarded as passive participants. Female ex-combatants often experience because of this stigmatization and marginalization a belief that they carry (sexual) diseases and have been abused, even it is not true. Often the focus in literature is on women's forced recruitment, sexual abuse, slavery and marriages to combatants. The feminized victimhood is extended by stating that women's participation is either in stereotypical gender roles or as extraordinary combatants (as opposed to men being ordinary combatants).⁷¹ By broadening the concept, it is argued that determinations about conceptualization should be made on a country-by-country basis instead of a universal one.⁷² DDR is not a complete, comprehensive program but rather a pillar or base to move forward to post-war recovery.

The prevailing literature helps to carve out the issues within gender-oriented DDR programmes but focuses on implementation processes. To be able to comprehend the conceptual errors, however, one must understand the dynamics which led to the adoption of UNSCR 1325, as the fundament of gender-specific DDR programmes. In order to grasp said dynamics and for the purpose of this thesis, the securitization theory and subaltern theory will be used.

2.3 Securitization theory

The following two chapters examine two theories which lay the foundation to research the main question in this thesis. In order to analyse and explain the dysfunctionalities in the gender-oriented approach in DDR programmes within UN gender policies, this thesis seeks to formulate an answer based on adopting a securitisation and subaltern framework to test the hypotheses and possibly find correlation in the process leading up to the creation of UNSCR 1325 and its evident dysfunctionalities. The securitization theory is chosen as a theory as it combines security issues as a result of leader's (political) agendas with threat management

⁶⁹ Bouta, 2005, p. 11

⁷⁰ MacKenzie, 2009, p. 201

⁷¹ Meertens & Zambrano, 2010, p. 448

⁷² Mazurana & Cole, 2018, p. 4

rhetoric. Applied to this thesis' research, the securitization theory regards the conceptualization of peace as broader than just an absence of war. Critiques exist of perspectives defining physical violence as conflict, and argue it is more important that actors employ a broader definition. Consequently, implicitly it is stated that in existing theories, the dimension of a broader definition is not taken into account. In the political realm public actors employ a narrow definition. It is of importance to acknowledge that in literature, disagreements persist over the conceptualisations and approaches in security studies. Essentially associated with Barry Buzan, Ole Waever and Jaap de Wilde (1998), distinctions are made between the 'Aberystwyth School', the 'Copenhagen School' (CS) and the 'Paris School'. The traditional view of security centres around military-based studies, focusing on domestic and foreign defence policies and the settlement of military disputes. The most common definition of securitization used in literature on securitization theory reads "when a securitizing actor uses a rhetoric of existential threat and thereby takes an issue out of what under those conditions is "normal politics," we have a case of securitization".⁷³ The separation between normal politics and exceptional politics is not endorsed by all scholars. Some academics regard securitization as an approach within politics itself. An additional definition to the abovementioned follows:

an articulated assemblage of practices whereby heuristic artefacts (metaphors, policy tools, image repertoires, analogies, stereotypes, emotions, etc.) are contextually mobilised by a securitizing actor, who works to prompt an audience to build a coherent network of implications (feelings, sensations, thoughts, and intuitions) about the critical vulnerability of a referent object, that concurs with the securitizing actor's reasons for choices and actions, by investing the referent subject with such an aura of unprecedented threatening complexion that a customised policy must be immediately undertaken to block it⁷⁴

Although different in political aspect, five concepts are debatably at the core of these definitions. In securitization, a certain agent declares an issue as a threat and performs a securitizing move. This agent is the securitizing actor. The identified move is part of a speech act: the rhetorical structure of actors framing issues in a certain way to an audience. In this sense, words construct reality and not merely describe it. Also, the issue which is deemed a threat is the referent subject. Next, a referent object is the object being threatened. Furthermore, an audience is identified as including an intersubjective status to the issue which is securitized and lastly, the adoption and context of policies whether normal or exceptional are key in

⁷³ Buzan, Wæver & De Wilde, 1998, p. 24; Buzan & Wæver, 2003, p. 491

⁷⁴ Balzacq, 2011, p. 3

securitization.⁷⁵ Additionally, literature puts securitization theory as a collective approach of three IR theories – constructivism, realism and poststructuralism. Amongst these theories, disagreements on securitization can be decreased to whether threats are perceived as having material or institutional quality. However, similarities are based on the collective acceptance that a threat is not decided to be a threat solely based on the relation between discourse and reality, but that an audience assent adds an intersubjectivity to the process and thereby accepts that the issue is securitized. The notion of the audience is a rather important one, however scholars argue it is understudied which means possible securitizing moves go undetected, raising problems for establishing power relations among securitizing actors. As noted by Wæver; ‘by definition, something is a security problem when the elites declare it to be so’ and ‘power holders can always try to use the instrument of securitization of an issue to gain control over it’.⁷⁶ Power relations as the second important concept within securitization theory are key in deciding whether securitizing moves are successful. Successful in this sense means whether specific issues are declared to be security threats – in which elites (re)focus on said issues in a particular way.

Consequently, and of special important to this thesis, actors securitizing concepts can have significant influence on whether issues are put on the (international) political agenda as well as on power relations within the political arena and desired results of the securitized conceptualization. Securitization can undermine or wholly ignore underlying dimensions of why an issue needed to be put on the agenda in the first place. Moreover, the context is of vital importance to securitizing moves. At the ontological level, the layers of context are of significance. These layers include historical conditions which are linked to the threat itself but can also be synonymous with military or political sectors. Of special interest to this thesis is the issue pointed out in Wilkinsons’ argument, noting that in the CS’s securitization study, security articulations are edited in a way that they revolve around a universalist and state-centric understanding of security. Peace and war need a broader definition, so implicitly the academic states that the definition of understanding peace as an absence of war is insufficient. This is because as a result, local knowledge, interpretations and comprehensions are removed and dominated by Western experiences of security. Moreover, scholars regard it as a traditional approach to security instead of a critical project and point out that securitization theory is

⁷⁵ Balzacq et al., 2016, p. 496

⁷⁶Wæver as cited in Lipschutz, 1995, p. 46

unable to relate to real people in real places. As formulated by Balzacq et al., “the way in which security is understood locally is a crucial factor for uncovering the concrete practices of security.”⁷⁷ In addition, the Paris School notes that securitization can consist of certain practices and instruments used by governments to overcome the challenges of audience acceptance. Mainly inspired by Bourdieu and Foucault, these scholars emphasize the practical side of securitization; identifying a field in which agents operate using resources, interests and strategies. Evident in this literature is the way in which academics create a bridge between linguistic and practical approaches to securitization theory in order to characterize certain security situations which are most often developed to serve government purposes.

2.3.1 Securitization theory and gender

There is a changing nature of the agenda of security and securitization. Newly emerging topics enter world politics as security issues and are adopted in the realm of international security. Scholars argue that the topic of women’s rights and gender-equality have been introduced by the UN and gender-related NGOs and agencies, such as the Interagency Taskforce on Women, Peace and Security, the NGO Working Group on Women, Peace and Security (NGOWG) and the UN Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM).⁷⁸ The adoption of UNSCR 1325 recognizing the key role gender has in international peace and security, the involvement of women in peace negotiations and reconstructing post-conflict societies, was a milestone to incorporate gender equality in every UNSC resolution. Human security provides the link between securitization, the UN and gender as it is used as a conceptualization to include women’s issues in the security discourse as well as framework for action that changed the international community to approach security issues.⁷⁹ Within the securitization theory a process of securitizing gender is performed as follows:

By working from the inside of the classical discussion, we can take the concepts of national security, threat, and sovereignty, and show how, on the collective level, they take on new forms under new conditions. We can then strip the classical discussion of its preoccupation with military matters by applying the same logic to other sectors, and we can de-link the discussion from the state by applying similar moves to society⁸⁰

⁷⁷ Balzacq et al., 2016, p. 503

⁷⁸ Hudson, 2009, p. 55

⁷⁹ Hudson, 2009, p. 56

⁸⁰ Waever, 1995, p. 51

As argued by CS, gender is framed as an existential threat to survival, prioritizing the need for action. In literature, the absence of gender in security studies can be explained in twofold. Firstly, scholars argue this absence can be imputed to the presupposition that in securitization, a speech act is possible. This act of verbal communication is problematic as it supposes a substantial amount of presence of women in international politics, as well as it neglects the notion that communication is more than verbal. Secondly, gender as a referent object of security is a complex subject given the fact that intrinsically linked to gender are nationality, religion, economic status and so forth. This interlinkage and multidimensionality of identities that gender is linked with, causes great ambiguity.⁸¹

Likewise, the securitization framework for gender includes gaps in security language and rhetoric. Scholars conducting interviews with UN officials on the topic noted that in order to gain access to the circles of power, issues needed to be framed by reinforcing cultural values of men in order to establish security and effectively change policies.⁸² Bias in rhetoric associated with traditional security actors hinders progress on the local level. All arguments above describe the issues related to securitizing gender and applied to this thesis' research, securitizing theorists would argue that dysfunctional wordings in UNSCR 1325 can be explained because actors employ a too narrow definition of peace and gender. The next chapter will focus on the dynamics between the international and the local, and more specifically, the Western and the non-Western.

2.4 Subaltern theory

The second theory discussed in this thesis focuses on the post-colonial, continued Western dominance over non-Western peoples.⁸³ Applied to this thesis, the subaltern theory will formulate a base to research whether and how predominantly Western societal actors have contributed to politicizing the concept of gender in the UNSC. This notion sees an exclusion of the political agency of those at the margins and disregards the needs and wants of the communities that are focused on in gender-oriented DDR programs. The marginalization of subalterns in public discourses poses as a major thwart to their development and security. Academics disagree on whether subalterns can or cannot speak, however in the case they could it is possible they cannot be heard. This theory also contributes to this thesis' research as it demonstrates the misrepresentation of subaltern interests by (Western) civil society actors and

⁸¹ Hudson, 2009, p. 58

⁸² Hudson, 2009, p. 60

⁸³ Spivak, 1988; Eimer, 2020

intellectuals which is well-intended yet all too common in contemporary politics. Applied to this thesis' case study, this misrepresentation of subalterns in public discourse results in internationally adopted policies neglecting the needs of said subalterns.

In postcolonial studies, the subaltern designates the politically and socially marginalized and colonized populations in third world nations. The formation of subaltern studies appeared in the work of Italian Marxist Antonio Gramsci in his article 'Notes on Italian History', written between 1929 and 1935. It is stated that subaltern was used as a way to describe the proletariat. In the 1980s the Subaltern Studies Collective was introduced, consisting of a group of Indian scholars and academics. It is most essentially associated with the works of Ranajit Guha, Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak and Dipesh Chakrabarty and regarded as a subdivision of post-colonial theory. The subaltern indicated the colonized Indian population, and is believed to be applied in academic literature as a Eurocentric method to comprehend and study non-Western people. In a 2011 interview, Spivak elaborated on the definition of subaltern, and Spivak's famous work on her statement that the subaltern cannot speak:

everybody thinks the subaltern is just a classy word for oppressed, for Other, for somebody who's not getting a piece of the pie ... everything that has limited or no access to the cultural imperialism is subaltern—a space of difference. Now, who would say that's just the oppressed? ... When you say cannot speak, it means that if speaking involves speaking and listening, this possibility of response, responsibility, does not exist in the subaltern's sphere ... The third thing, which is the worst, that is, you don't give the subaltern voice. You work for the bloody subaltern, you work against subalternity. The penultimate thing is (I want to say something about the work of the subalternist historians), many people want to claim subalternity. They are the least interesting and the most dangerous⁸⁴

Spivak points out that of concern are subaltern claims made by groups within society which have, unlike the subaltern, the ability to be heard. The subaltern political agency is at stake, and indeed literature shows a continues discourse about the agency of the subaltern. Scholars argue that the subaltern theory develops as an academic practice in which relations between dominant groups and an increasingly heterogenous subalternity changes constantly.⁸⁵ By arguing the subaltern cannot speak, one states that the subaltern does not have meaning or

⁸⁴ Spivak, 1992, pp. 45-46

⁸⁵ Beverley, 1998, p. 306

authority to change the relations of knowledge and power, confirming the status and influence of the elite groups both international and national. In addition, and of special importance to this thesis, the notion that in the case of the subaltern being given the ability to speak, the dominant groups would have to forget their prejudices and interests involved in their own authority. In other words, to speak for the subaltern, and to claim representation for the subaltern, is contradictory. Moreover, the Westernized understanding of conceptualizations is thus understood as an inherent given. In this theory, 'Western' vs. 'the other' therefore makes a distinction between industrialized countries reaping the (economic) benefits and the countries which did not.

Rather, the construction of knowledge including the absence of representation of the subaltern must be recognized, as well as "the fundamental inadequacy of this knowledge and of the institutions that contain it, and therefore the need for general social change in the direction of a more radically democratic and non-hierarchical social order".⁸⁶ The effect of discourse in locating subordination is apparent in Partha Chatterjee's influential study on how Indian nationalism achieved dominance after the achievement of Indian independence in 1947. In his works, he speaks of a change in nationalist thought which allowed for subaltern agency. The dominant discourse was under pressure, and elite groups marginalized specific manners of mass action to be able to secure the elite dominance.⁸⁷ This however also meant that hegemony over subaltern politics was not secured. Subaltern political agency, access to the political arena and social order is further elaborated on by postcolonial scholars who turned subaltern studies into a post-colonial critique.

2.4.1 Postcolonial theory

To comprehend approaches of the subaltern studies outside the realm of its mainly Indian origins, the postcolonial theory adds different perspectives on the concept. From the 1960s onwards, scholars in postcolonial theory tended focus on the people affected most by the national liberation struggle during decolonization, such as the peasants, the sub-proletariat, women, and so on. In this literature, the subaltern is seen as 'the other', the 'remainder' of categorized classes. The subaltern is beyond the possibility of representation as with representation, it emerges from the character of subalternity. In this sense, the subaltern in this era of globalisation is "functionally obsolete"⁸⁸ as the power of the nation state and political

⁸⁶ Beverley, 1998, p. 306

⁸⁷ Chatterjee, 2012

⁸⁸ Beverley, 1998, p. 310

hegemony do not allow for representation. Grassroot resistance in new social movements do not alter politics. However, academics argue that a new form of hegemony could be realized by reconstituting critical resources provided by postcolonial and subaltern theory. Indeed, a transformation might generate changes in power structures. Subaltern claims linked to broadly often Westernized acceptable discourses can make that change happen. Said discourses are hybrid frameworks yet have not refrained from functioning after decolonization. Postcolonial scholars state that subalternity is a relative notion, dependent on the social and historic conditions. Subaltern political agency is subject to scepticism, as misinterpretation of the claims is deemed inevitable.⁸⁹ Domestic powers, international dominant groups and elites from both industrialised and developing countries have an inevitable way of integrating their own interests, perceptions and perspectives into global discourses which ultimately affects subaltern claims.

Furthermore, academics state that obtaining subaltern political agency is thwarted by the hegemonic, neoliberalist structure of the global arena and its capitalist institutions. In addition, super- and subordination present in contemporary global political economy dates back to the structures of Western dominance and colonisation, hindering access to the global political arena or acquiring domestic or international political agency. This western dominance stems from the (artificial) difference of knowledge, ideologies, resources and power between the West and ‘the others’.⁹⁰

2.4.2 Subaltern theory and gender

The abovementioned division is identified in literature on women’s invisibility and absence as actors and authors of history. In research, the transition of (Indian) society from traditional to modernity allows women to transition to other structures as well, however it is stated that this transitioning is depicted through male discourses. As a result, the object of discourse is not the acting agent but part of a system of representations. It can therefore be stated that colonialism not merely determines territories but also is a “subject-constituting project”.⁹¹ Spivak demonstrates the position of gender and the subaltern, and evidence for her claim that the subaltern cannot speak, by describing widow sacrifice in India.⁹² Widows would perform acts of self-immolation (*sati/suttee*).⁹³ Three perspectives dominate the discourse on this historical

⁸⁹ Eimer, 2020, p. 99

⁹⁰ Ayoob, 2002, pp. 27-48

⁹¹ Spivak, 1985, pp. 93-103

⁹² Spivak, 1985, pp. 93-103

⁹³ Spivak, 1985, pp. 101

narrative, starting with that of the British colonial powers. The British would regard widow self-immolation as a justification for them to use imperialism as a civilizing mission. Territorial expansionism was seen as necessary to bring about civilization in India, and females needed to act within the perspective of British reasonable humanity. Another perspective comes from a more conservative, independent discourse. Conservative elites would consider the act as a cultural practice used as resistance against the British. Simply put, instead of regarding it as unjust, illogical and inhumane, it was a practice to be proud of. Spivak points out the lack of discourse from the widows themselves: “between patriarchy and imperialism, subject-constitution and object-formation, the figure of the woman disappears, not into pristine nothingness, but into a violent shuttling which is the displaced figuration of the ‘third-world woman’ caught between tradition and modernization”.⁹⁴ The subalterns do not speak as they do not have a voice. Their perspective is left out even though the focus of the discourse is the subjects being spoken about. This theory related to gender thus demonstrates that even though intellectuals use their own perspectives to help subalterns, their perspective is included within a Western intellectual’s practices causing an inherent gap between intentions and results.

Scholars emphasize the problematic globally dominant discourse of the colonialist (Orientalist), the Marxist (Western) and the nationalist (elitist). In addition, subaltern groups tend to be regarded as predominantly male and rural by contemporary Western anthropologists, politicians and historians. Applied to this thesis, subaltern scholars would answer the research question by stating UNSCR 1325 is a creation of Western actors discussing peoples they do not know and possibly do not want to know, using a Western perspective on security and gender issues which leads to dysfunctionalities. The scarcity of subaltern literature on gender and especially of female contributions to subaltern studies and gender portrays the ironic shortage of endorsing gender as a significant theme within this study.

2.5 Conclusion

In this chapter, substantive theoretical elaborations were given on peacebuilding literature, DDR and the role of gender within DDR. This theoretical knowledge aims to serve as part of the foundation to research UNSCR 1325. Next to that, two theoretical perspectives that might explain the gender-oriented dysfunctionalities in UNSCR 1325, the securitization and the subaltern theory, were provided in order to contribute to adding a new perspective to contemporary literature on the matter. The next chapter will show the hypotheses in this thesis

⁹⁴ Spivak, 1985, p. 102

which are deduced from the theoretical chapter and it discusses the employed methods. The empirical analysis follows after and will demonstrate whether the theories are complementary in explaining the dysfunctionalities in UNSCR 1325.

3. Research Design

The following chapter will demonstrate the research design used to answer the research question ‘‘what explains the gender-oriented dysfunctionalities in United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325?’’ Firstly, the hypotheses will be discussed, based on the theoretical framework and its operationalizations. Secondly, the case design will be demonstrated. Third, the methods of explaining-outcome process tracing and document analysis will be explained to argue how it contributes to this thesis and how they are executed. Next, the sources will be discussed. The strengths and weaknesses of this research design follow after.

3.1 Hypotheses and operationalization

In this thesis, two hypotheses will be tested. A hypothesis is a statement on the reality as it is perceived by the researcher, based on observations and data. It shows the relationship between two variables in which one has a cause that leads to an effect. Additionally, there are two independent variables; the securitization theory (X1) and the subaltern theory (X2). For every independent variable, one hypothesis will be tested. In this research, I do not perceive the hypotheses as mutually exclusive but rather expect that they can be connected to each other and can be confirmed simultaneously. They are heuristic. A possible linkage can exist between the two independent variables which can be researched in this abstract research design.

3.1.1 Dependent variable

In order to answer the research question, this research examines the developments and negotiations prior to the creation of resolution 1325, in order to understand the dynamics that led to the first official resolution incorporating gender within DDR programmes. In UNSCR 1325, peace is conceptualized as the absence of violence. In this case, it is not about human and economic rights and their interconnectedness with peace, but rather about defining peace in a way that works for all actors involved in the creation of UNSCR 1325. Furthermore, the special focus on female ex-combatants and their needs are conceptualized in a way that remains ambiguous. The definition does not take the needs into account but rather victimize women. So, the issue in UNSCR 1325 and the dependent variable in this research are as follows. The

dependent variable in this thesis is constituted by the dysfunctional wording of UNSCR 1325. This entails a) vocabulary focusing on the absence of violence and b) the lack of a clear definition of what the special needs of female ex-combatants are.

3.1.2 Independent variables

Securitization theory

The securitization theory examines whether during the negotiation processes the issues were framed as security issues and thus were securitized, which implies employing a narrow definition of security, ignoring underlying assumptions such as gender and therefore resulting in a dysfunctional program. Likewise, government representatives could have been dominating the negotiation process, framing issues as security issues. Therefore, the hypothesis for X1 is as follows:

Hypothesis 1: Dysfunctionalities in gender-related UN resolutions are more likely, if negotiators predominantly emphasize geopolitical and military aspects of security.

Applied to this thesis to consider hypothesis 1 to be confirmed, the data would demonstrate negotiations to be predominantly framed in geopolitical and military security terms. Such terms can include concepts of ‘war’, ‘arms’, ‘geopolitics’, ‘physical violence’, ‘sanctions’, ‘jailing’, ‘truth commissions’ and ‘reconciliation’. The researched data relates to the debates that led to the adoption of UNSCR 1325. To consider the hypothesis to be disconfirmed, the data would show substantial discussions on gender aspects such as the mentioning of ‘women’, ‘gender-oriented’, ‘women empowerment’ and ‘equality’.

Subaltern theory

In addition, applied to the research question the subaltern theory examines whether the negotiations may have been dominated by Western NGOs originating from industrialized countries which has resulted in a lack of influence from the targeted community in DDR programmes. Western actors present in negotiations may adhere to a specific image of female ex-combatants, which has more to do with their perspective than the women in post-conflict zones. Negotiation processes could have been based on Western interpretations which can have substantially different definitions of concepts which therefore may have led to a dysfunctional

understanding of concepts significant to this thesis' research question. Therefore, the following hypothesis has been formulated:

Hypothesis 2: Dysfunctionalities in gender-related UN resolutions are more likely, if the negotiations are based on a 'western' understanding of gender questions.

In similar fashion, hypothesis 2 can be considered to be confirmed if the gender-aspect is discussed from a Western perspective in which the narrative would predominantly portray women as victims and the discourse would show a stereo-typical demonstration of women as care-givers and supporters of men. The hypothesis can be considered to be disconfirmed if the gender-aspect is discussed from the perspective of the actors of the targeted communities who incorporate different perspectives of women in post-conflict environments.

3.2 Case design

Since the focus of this thesis is on explaining dysfunctionalities within UNSC resolution 1325, a single disciplined interpretive case study will be operated. Before elaborating on this chosen approach, the role of case study research in the discipline of political science and its philosophical basis will be investigated. Over the past centuries, methodological debates within political science have centred around the role of observational evidence in relation to randomized experimental evidence, the latter meeting the status of "the gold standard" whilst the former doesn't.⁹⁵ This debate can be placed within a discussion on the epistemological role of case study research and the evidence it provides. Academics agree that a mixed method research, a combination of quantitative and qualitative methodologies, will provide better results than any of the methodologies by itself. In political science, positivism has been the philosophical pillar in conducting research which entails an ontological assumption of an objective reality. This positivist approach can be categorised within the behavioural approach, which emphasizes the objective and scientific methods of research and the observable behavioural responses. Within political science, this approach aims at explaining political phenomena by creating law-governed causes.⁹⁶ It is qualitative research, characterized by researchers "routinely relying on rich, dense information concerning specific cases".⁹⁷ The thick description in this qualitative research method allows for a holistic analysis, including

⁹⁵ Crasnow, 2012, p. 656

⁹⁶ Halperin & Heath, 2012, p. 27

⁹⁷ Collier & Elman, 2008, p. 781

looking at the mechanisms within existing theories and taking into account the diversity of the characteristics, as compared to quantitative analysis.⁹⁸ When applying case studies to explain political phenomena, the focus shifts towards a ‘causes-of-effects’ approach, aiming at explaining particular outcomes. The abstract level at which concepts are used need to be transformed into systematized concepts.⁹⁹ Such concepts define what is concluded and what is not in research. A definition of conceptualization is “‘defining the constitutive dimensions of a concept and how they relate to each other’”.¹⁰⁰ The explaining-outcome process tracing method conceptualizes the outcome as a historical event that needs explanation. A minimally sufficient explanation includes a non-systematic, case-specific part. However, these parts do not suffice on their own; social reality consists out of mechanisms that operate more generally not just to a specific case but often across various cases within a given population. Therefore, this thesis will treat the mechanisms as ideational mechanisms¹⁰¹ in which outcomes can be partially the product of how actors interpret their world through ideational elements. Ideas are not reduced to the objective position of an actor and are not constrained by manifestations of structures. To acquire the optimal comprehension of the internal mechanisms leading to the dependent variable in this research, this thesis operates an interpretive approach. As opposed to political positivism, said approach is based on a social ontology separating objectivity from subjectivity and perceiving the social world as a construction of subjectivity.¹⁰²

In order to comprehend the causal mechanism, this research aims at finding it and explaining the reason why there are evident flaws in UNSCR 1325 that led to dysfunctional gender-oriented DDR programmes. To be able to do so, it conducts an inductive case study approach. The inductive approach is incorporated in this research design as it begins with observing a social phenomenon followed by finding explanations which serve as guiding principles.¹⁰³ The induction will be used in a single case study design as this thesis focuses on UNSCR 1325. The case study selected is the disciplined interpretive case study, applying an existing theory to the unique case.¹⁰⁴ Applied to this thesis, the existing theories are the securitization theory and the subaltern theory. By focusing on characteristics, concepts and elements of the theories which are relevant to answering the research question, the hypotheses will be deduced. The hypotheses are used as a heuristic in examining the research question.

⁹⁸ Gerring, 2006, p. 49; Della Porta & Keating, 2008, p. 207

⁹⁹ Adcock & Collier, 2001, p. 532

¹⁰⁰ Mahoney, 2008

¹⁰¹ Parsons, 2007, p. 96

¹⁰² Halperin & Heath, 2012, p. 40

¹⁰³ Blanche et al., 2006, p. 47

¹⁰⁴ Odell, 2001, p. 163

The last step in the disciplined interpretive case study is to make a more general conclusion in regards to applying the theoretical application.¹⁰⁵

3.3 Method of enquiry

Methods are used to systematically display and represent statistical data and aim to collect data to analyse. In this thesis, explaining-outcome process tracing and document analysis will be the research methods in order to answer the thesis question.

3.3.1 Explaining-Outcome Process Tracing and Document Analysis

Process tracing is a research method commonly used in the social sciences. The method seeks to trace causal mechanisms, and thus goes beyond finding correlations between dependent and independent variables.¹⁰⁶ It is a method often used to trace a sequence of events that result in a particular outcome.¹⁰⁷ Therefore, process tracing fits this thesis' research question as it allows one to analyse combinations of causal mechanisms and pathways that explain the dependent variable. Causal mechanisms will be based on the foundations of the independent variables securitization theory (X1) and subaltern theory (X2). This type of causal relationship shows where and increase in X raises the probability of outcome Y in any given case. ¹⁰⁸A causal mechanism is a process in which a cause exerts its result and effect it has. Process tracing “attempts to identify the intervening causal process—the causal chain and causal mechanism—between an independent variable (or variables) and the outcome of the dependent variable”¹⁰⁹ and in this way expands the research on causal relationships to in-depth tracing of causal mechanisms.

Within social science, three variations of process tracing can be found, namely theory-testing, theory-building and explaining-outcome process tracing. The variations are based on the different methodological implications they have. Next to that, the distinctions guide research into building theoretical mechanisms, testing theoretical mechanisms and finding explanatory mechanisms in unique outcomes. This thesis will adopt the explaining-outcome variant, as it seeks to build a minimally sufficient explanation for a unique, historically specific case. It is, indeed, more case-focused than theory-oriented.¹¹⁰ Within the case-centric process-

¹⁰⁵ Odell, 2001, p. 163

¹⁰⁶ George & Bennett, 2005, p. 206

¹⁰⁷ George & Bennett, 2005, p. 206

¹⁰⁸ Gerring, 2005, p. 167

¹⁰⁹ George & Bennett, 2005, p. 206

¹¹⁰ Beach & Pedersen, 2013, p. 3

tracing method, different paths are expected to be displayed when researching particular cases. It makes ontological assumptions about the nature of causal relationships and mechanisms in which causal cycles produce an outcome. The use of a theory within this case of process tracing is as “heuristic instruments that have analytical utility in providing the best possible explanation of a given phenomenon.”¹¹¹ It is important to note that by identifying a causal mechanism, its definition is meant to be taken in a broader sense as opposed to the theory-centric variants.

To employ the process-tracing method, document analysis is used. Document analysis in this thesis is an indispensable method as it allows for thorough research of relevant studies and provides the possibility to structure and verify knowledge, making it a resourceful method.

3.4 Sources

This thesis relies heavily on archival research of UN documents which are internal and public and textual analyses. The documents used as sources for this research are primary sources and secondary sources.¹¹² Primary resources refer to documents that are written by the actors who witnessed the event described. A large range of primary sources were analysed for this research. These documents consist of and are not limited to convention and conference reports, relevant UNSC and UNGA resolutions and declarations, Secretary-General statements, annual reports, committee reports and minutes and notes from participants and government representatives present at the meetings. The secondary sources are sources that are produced after the event has happened. The function of secondary sources is to interpret the event using different approaches.¹¹³ The secondary sources used as data in this analysis are for example academic literature, online articles from newspapers and articles from websites and databases such as but not limited to the UN digital library, the UNSCR search engine and LexisNexis newspapers database.

3.5 Strengths and weaknesses

This research has its strengths and its weaknesses. Process tracing is a strong method as it is arguably the only method which allows studying causal mechanisms.¹¹⁴ Moreover, it enables one to make inferences about the causal process and can increase the level of validity of its

¹¹¹ Peirce, 1955

¹¹² Halperin & Heath, 2012, p. 329

¹¹³ Halperin & Heath, 2012, p. 329

¹¹⁴ Beach & Pedersen, 2013, p. 2

findings. However, as literature on explaining-outcome process tracing shows, a theory can never be confirmed with a 100 percent certainty as the researcher assesses whether the explanation is (minimally) sufficient. Moreover, the theoretical implications of this inductive y-centred case study cannot be generalized. There is still not a clear and coherent framework for how and when valid inferences can be made using process-tracing. Next to that, there is a lack of concrete guidelines for using the methods in practice. This deficiency has prevented process-tracing from fulfilling its potential of enabling scientists to open up the black box of causality using in-depth case study methods to make strong within-case inferences about causal mechanisms. The resulting lack of coherent foundations and concrete guidelines has prevented the method from fulfilling its potential. On the other hand, process tracing enables one to get in-depth insights into the dynamics of a specific case and allows to gain speculative insights with regard to the question whether particular theoretical approaches can be connected to each other.

Furthermore, it is argued that case study research in social sciences lacks representativeness as it is based on only a small number of cases of a general phenomenon.¹¹⁵ This means that the conclusions found in this thesis are not by definition representative to other general cases. However, case study research is argued to have strong internal validity which is why it is a good fit with unfolding this thesis' unique yet complex question.

Finally, document analysis is a highly efficient and effective way to conduct research as it is an accessible and reliable source of data easily manageable because of the variety of forms it comes in. However, document analysis can be subject to selection bias, as a document can be cherry-picked to back a pre-fixed argument.¹¹⁶ As there is a plentiful, even abundant amount of provided documents on the dynamics before, during and after UNSCR 1325, it is highly likely relevant documents went by unnoticed. In spite of the abovementioned, by carefully selecting an empirical timeline of the used sources and gathering as much relevant evidence as possible, it can be concluded that these limitations do not necessarily weaken the empirical findings in this thesis.

¹¹⁵ Gerring, 2007, p. 43

¹¹⁶ Heath & Halperin, 2012, p. 330

4. Empirical analysis

In this chapter, the empirical findings are presented in types of phases. These phases are based on cycles of policymaking as described thoroughly by Jann & Wegrich.¹¹⁷ The first phase of policymaking start with an agenda-setting phase, in which issues transfer to the political agenda. Various actors have influence on what issues make it to said agenda and which don't, including but not limited to the (social) media, legislative officers, policy officers, demonstrators and interest groups. Next to that, the negotiation phase will be described. In this phase, the policy issue is transferred to the political agenda and formal UN discussions, negotiations and actions are being discussed. Lastly, the policy cycle ends with an implementation phase. In the implementation phase, theoretical policy is being realized into practical action. Ideally, implementation processes consist of how agreements are translated into practical actions, how and what resources will be used, what interpretations exist, who will be assigned to executing the agreement and who or what part of an organization has final responsibility for the implementation.¹¹⁸ The gathered data is interpreted to research this thesis' main question.

First of all, the agenda-setting phase will be discussed as the first phase in this empirical analysis. This phase will describe the negotiation processes, the societal discussions and internal developments both inside and outside of the UN. The empirical evidence will start with the adoption of the Beijing Platform for Action at the Fourth World Conference on Women in 1995. This Platform highlighted the need to incorporate women's contributions and thus a gender perspective for sustainable peacebuilding. This part will describe the social debates, the input of scientists and journalists and the broader debate on the topic before it reached official channels and institutions. The agenda-setting phase ends when the first official discussion on WPS on the 24th of October 2000 commences and when the aim to realize such a resolution in the UNSC officially became apparent.

Secondly, as described, the negotiation phase will show evidence from the first UNSC discussion, UNSC meeting 4208, and ends when UNSCR is adopted on the 31st of October, 2000. In this phase, the formal negotiations which led to the creation of UNSCR 1325 will be analysed and evidence to test the hypotheses will be gathered. In order to do so, meeting minutes of the UNSC, briefs, speeches, resolutions and other official documents will be

¹¹⁷ Jann & Wegrich, 2007

¹¹⁸ Jann & Wegrich, 2007

researched. the content of UNSCR 1325 will be discussed to get an overview of the case at hand.

Lastly, the empirical evidence will demonstrate examples of implementation deficits in Sri Lanka, Sierra Leone, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Uganda, Indonesia, Liberia and Mozambique which can be traced back to the dysfunctional wordings. A description of the dysfunctional wordings is also incorporated in this phase as it is the foundation to find evidence for the effect of the independent variables on the dependent one. This phase starts after the adoption of UNSCR 1325.

4.2 Agenda-setting phase

This section will review the informal phase of agenda-setting prior to the creation of UNSCR 1325. The evidence will be gathered from decisive and extensive resolutions and declarations on the WPS theme, starting with the Beijing Declaration and Plan of Action in 1995. After, the chapter will demonstrate the findings in relation to the hypotheses.

4.2.1 Case description

The roots of the adoption of UNSCR 1325 can be traced back to the UN Charter in 1945 which emphasized the need for equal rights of men and women. Another effort in 1969 was the Report of the Commission on the Status of Women (CSW Report) to address the question of protection of women and children during emergency situations. Furthermore, in 1974 the UNGA adopted the Declaration on the Protection of Women and Children in Emergency and Armed Conflict, and a year later it proclaimed the year 1975 International Women's Year. The UNGA then adopted a UN Decade for Women, a big step towards gaining international recognition for women in conflict, in December 1975 to focus on raising awareness for women's global issues. International and regional meetings were met with the presence of specialized UN agencies: UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO); World Health Organization (WHO), UN Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLA) and the then European Economic Community (EEC). The increasing attention for women's issues became gradually securitized and viewed as inherently linked to international peace and security. A milestone in the Decade for Women was the UNGA adopting the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), striving for not just de jure but also de facto equality between men and women on multiple aspects such as economic and social rights. Despite CEDAW drawing attention to women's needs, it did not directly address the needs of women in environments in conflict.

BEIJING DECLARATION AND PLAN OF ACTION

The Beijing Declaration and Plan of Action did address equality, development and peace for women.¹¹⁹ It is an agenda for women's empowerment. On the 15th of September 1995 it was adopted by all governments participating in the Conference. It built on three previous conferences on women, respectively in 1975, 1980 and 1985 and was a UN initiative. Over 17000 participants attended the Conference, of which 106 states, 6000 government delegates at the negotiations, over 4000 media representatives and over 4000 accredited NGO representatives.¹²⁰ Regional commissions from all continents attended, as well as sixteen UN bodies and programs. Twelve UN specialized agencies were present as well as 26 intergovernmental organizations (IGO). The president of the Conference was the Vice-Chairperson of the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress of the People's Republic of China, Chen Muhua. Opening statements were made by representatives of the governments of Pakistan, Iceland, Bangladesh and Viet Nam. A statement was also made by the Vice-President and Minister of Gender and Community Development from Uganda. Vice-Presidents got elected from five regional groups, of which seven from African States, six from Asian States, three from Eastern European States, five from Latin American and Caribbean States and six Vice-Presidents from Western European and other States.¹²¹ The Declaration was thus constructed by an international initiative with inputs from all regions.

While negotiations centred around the theme of gender, several representatives submitted reservations about definitions and interpretations of wordings in the Declaration. Concerns were raised on the definition of the word 'gender'.¹²² Although the Declaration was centred around this term, representatives found misunderstanding amongst each other and within the drafted policies. For some states, gender is referred to as either of two sexes, male and female, based on biological differences. Other states use the term to denote a range of social and cultural differences that do not necessarily align with traditional/established concepts of male and female. The Declaration mentions gender in a series of combinations. 'Gender-sensitive' programs and policies are mentioned to demonstrate willingness of the states to implement programs and construct policy to socially and economically empower the participation of women and girls in training, education, health programmes and human

¹¹⁹ Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, Article 3

¹²⁰ UN Women, 1995

¹²¹ UN Women, 1995

¹²² Academic debates on the definition of the term 'gender' is beyond the scope of this thesis, however it demands attention in contemporary literature

settlements.¹²³ The combination of ‘gender perspective’ is used 51 times in the Declaration, with the majority of the time focusing on mainstreaming a gender perspective into policies and programs specifically when addressing issues concerning ‘youth’, ‘children’, or ‘girls’, or in combination with the words ‘generally’, ‘all levels’ and ‘all spheres of society’.¹²⁴ ‘Gender equality’ is mentioned to address the importance of improving the status of women and integrating a gender perspective by excluding stereotyped gender roles in political discourse.¹²⁵ The President of the Conference gave a statement on the consensus over the term gender. In order to better the understanding of the term, a special Commission based in New York, led by the Chairperson Selma Ashipala from Namibia was formed to seek an agreement on the definition of the term. Two statements were reported. First of all, “the word "gender" had been commonly used and understood in its ordinary, generally accepted usage in numerous other United Nations forums and conferences”. And secondly, “there was no indication that any new meaning or connotation of the term, different from accepted prior usage, was intended in the Platform for Action”.¹²⁶ The group thus reported to all delegations that the word gender should be employed “in its ordinary, generally accepted usage”.¹²⁷ It is evident that the wordings used in the Declaration both regarding the use of ‘gender’ as well as combining gender with ‘perspective’ or ‘mainstreaming’ remains vague and ambiguous language is purposefully maintained throughout the report.

Within the Declaration, peace and security are said to be “inextricably linked with equality between women and men and development.”¹²⁸ Peace is mentioned as a goal to work towards, and women are portrayed as outsiders in the process to peace. The Declaration thus stresses the importance of women’s presence. A clear definition of what this goal exactly entails is not present in the Declaration. Armed conflict, however, is mentioned as an obstacle hindering the process.¹²⁹ Armed conflict is regarded as especially “affecting women, children, the elderly and the disabled”. Moreover, women are mentioned as victims of conflict, the majority of the time paired with ‘adolescent girls and children’: “women often become caregivers for injured combatants and find themselves, as a result of conflict, unexpectedly cast as sole manager of household, sole parent, and caretaker of elderly relatives”.¹³⁰ Political and

¹²³ Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, paragraph 19; 59; 80; 83; 108-110; 125; 165; 195; 207; 232; 243; 258

¹²⁴ Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, paragraph 38; 57; 58; 79; 80g; 105; 123; 124g

¹²⁵ Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, paragraph 57; 81; 175; 180; 193; 245a; 258

¹²⁶ Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, Annex IV (1)

¹²⁷ Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, Annex IV (2)

¹²⁸ Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, E.131

¹²⁹ Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, paragraph 15

¹³⁰ Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, E.133

economic empowerment of women is at the basis of the Declaration's approach to protect women in armed conflict. However, women are categorized with the youth and children, and no important distinctions or needs between the groups are mentioned. Paragraphs 136-141 address how many women's NGOs call for reduction in military expenditures worldwide as they link the proliferation of weapons to gender-based sexual violence (GBSV). The paragraphs demonstrate that women and children constitute some 80 percent of the world's refugees and internally displaced persons. Women affected by GBSV are said to "often experience difficulty in some countries of asylum in being recognized as refugees when the claim is based on such persecution".¹³¹ The role of the woman regarded not as a victim is mentioned briefly at the end of this paragraph on women in armed conflict. It is stated that the role of women is crucial as "women make an important but often unrecognized contribution as peace educators both in their families and in their societies".¹³² A woman's role in armed conflict in linguistic terms is thus limited to the demonstrations in the Declaration as mentioned.

PRESIDENTIAL STATEMENT

On Women's Day on the 8th of March 2000, the male UNSC President Anwarul Karim Chowdhury (Bangladesh) issued a Presidential Statement recognizing the link between gender equality and peace. The statement is seen as one of the most important precursors to UNSCR 1325 as the UNSC mentioned on the record the importance of adopting a gender-perspective in its post-conflict policies. The role of women in post-conflict environments is described as follows:

Members of the Council also note that during times of armed conflict and the collapse of communities, the role of women is crucial in preserving social order, and as peace educators both in their families and in their societies, thereby playing an important role in fostering a culture of peace in strife-torn communities and societies¹³³

Similar to the Beijing Declaration, women are portrayed as solely a vulnerable group and are mentioned to be particularly affected by the consequences of armed conflict, as are girls. It is specifically stated that "the impact of violence against women and violation of the human rights of women in conflict situations is experienced by women of all ages".¹³⁴ Also, it is stated that

¹³¹ Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, E.136,

¹³² Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, E.139

¹³³ United Nations Security Council Press Statement, 2000

¹³⁴ United Nations Security Council Press Statement, 2000

to maintain and promote peace, women should fully participate in power structures and fully be involved in all efforts for the resolution and prevention of conflict. There is no elaboration on how they can achieve full involvement and participation.

WINDHOEK DECLARATION AND NAMIBIA PLAN OF ACTION

From the 29th to the 31st of May 2000, the Government of Namibia hosted a seminar on ‘Mainstreaming a Gender Perspective in Multidimensional Peace Support Operations’, organized by the Lessons Learned Unit of the UN Department of Peacekeeping Operations. The seminar constructed a plan of action, urging the UN Secretary-General to implement the recommendations. This became the Windhoek Declaration and Namibia Plan of Action, a plan on the interconnectedness of WPS five months prior to the adoption of UNSCR 1325. This Declaration aimed to adopt a gender dimension in peace processes and international and national efforts to incorporate women in multidimensional peace support operations. The Windhoek Declaration contrary to the Beijing Declaration was more focused on including gender equality in every level of a peace support operation, from DDR to women’s involvement in decision-making processes in economic and social development programs.

Windhoek was a symbolically meaningful venue for the Seminar because it marked the tenth anniversary of Namibia’s independence after 24 years of conflict. The peace process was monitored and helped by a special UN Transition Assistance Group (UNTAG). UNTAG pioneered the process to expand to multidimensional missions that included civilian participation, but did not yet incorporate a gender component. Many academics, however, considered it to be a milestone for women:

it offered significantly increased opportunities for them to participate in substantive positions in the Mission’s various offices and to carry out mandated activities to provide much-needed support for Namibia’s oppressed women and men – both crucial if the UN’s goals regarding gender equality and non-discrimination were to be realized¹³⁵

Leading representatives in the Seminar believed that UNTAG left “an indelible mark on Namibian society by facilitating attitudinal changes regarding the so-called ‘proper role’ of women in society”.¹³⁶ 62 representatives participated in the Seminar, of which 52 women, of which 11 Namibian. Data about the participants show that UN officials with ‘substantial’ experience in field peacekeeping matters were present, such as former Force Commanders,

¹³⁵ Lahoud, 2020, p. 12

¹³⁶ United Nations Department of Peacekeeping Operations, 1999, p. 10

UNTAG personnel and program managers from UN entities such as UN Development Program (UNDP) and UN Refugee Agency (UNHCR). Furthermore, diplomats and officials from Ministries (Foreign Affairs, Defence, Women Affairs) were present, as were National Military Advisers and Police Inspectors, Directors of regional and international peacekeeping training centres and NGOs and professors and researches from academic institutions and research institutes attended. The majority of the participants were thus relevant actors highly known within the UN apparatus or their national government.

Next to that, the majority of the statements and presentations were made by the Seminar's Chairwoman Dame Margaret Anstee (UK) and Discussant Elisabeth Rehn (Sweden). Other statements were mainly made by Western representatives and out of three African speakers, one was female. Throughout this research, it becomes evident that discussants participating in the Seminar wrote that the Official Opening Statement was "a rousing one", "setting the bar high for the Seminar ... to make progress on gender mainstreaming".¹³⁷ The finalizing of the discussions and the decision to have the Government of Namibia transmit the Declaration and Plan of Action to the UNSG (Namibia was serving both in the UNGA and the UNSC at the time) led the plenary to feel "overjoyed that our three days of intense discussions and strategizing had reached such a climax".¹³⁸ Within just three days, the stepping stone for UNSCR 1325 was created. The documents show influence from government officials and known representatives within the UN through leading debates on bringing gender issues to the international political agenda.

During the Seminar, discourse strategies were used to ensure full support of the UN and UN agencies to implement policies:

Peacekeeping missions are often both large and complex ... The Department of Peacekeeping Operations (DPKO) manages the work of the military, the civilian police and the administrative and substantive civilian the political affairs of a mission ... Member States that contribute troops retain significant control over the training and deployment of their personnel. States also exercise authority over the selection of civilian police. Each of these many participants has a contribution to make to gender balance, mainstreaming and equality¹³⁹

By emphasizing state sovereignty on decisions and distribution of resources such as personnel, states would maintain control over their own contributions. These political and military affairs

¹³⁷ Lahoud, 2020, p. 20

¹³⁸ Lahoud, 2020, p. 32

¹³⁹ United Nations, 2000, p. 6

are stated to be linked to contribute to gender balance and gender mainstreaming. The gender perspective in multidimensional peace support operations was researched during the Seminar by collecting data on gender balance and gender mainstreaming from five cases in Namibia, Cambodia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, El Salvador and on the civilian UN Observer Mission in South Africa. Gender balance is defined as “the degree to which men and women hold the full range of positions in a society or organization. The United Nations has a goal of achieving a balance of 50-50 in all professional posts”, and gender mainstreaming refers to

the process of assessing the implications for men and for women of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in all areas and at all levels. It is a strategy for making women’s as well as men’s concerns and experiences an integral dimension of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and societal spheres so that women and men benefit equally and inequality is not perpetuated. The ultimate goal is to achieve gender equality¹⁴⁰

The role of women in the post-conflict phase is numerous times regarded as establishing the role and voices of women in political parties at the formal level and helping define what peace and security is at the informal, community level.¹⁴¹ This indicates that a definition of peace and security from a gender-perspective is not yet formulated. The urgent call for evaluation and accountability to implement the Plan of Action particularly speaks to this notion. It is mentioned that:

it is true that organizations have an awkward and often subduing relationship with inspectors and whistle-blowers within an organization, but individuals and groups outside an organization are far less hesitant to call for accountability. In a peacekeeping environment, outsiders such as members of local and international non-governmental organizations and the media have high expectations for the behaviour of UN personnel. Outsiders will be less reluctant to publicize outrageous or just inappropriate behaviour. Bad publicity will stain the reputation of the UN¹⁴²

To elaborate, there are pressures from outside the UN on the UN itself to set a good example in the peacekeeping environment. This statement in the Windhoek Declaration emphasizes the need for urgent changes in behaviour and policy and speaks to the fast pace in which negotiations happened and the Plan of Action was formulated.

¹⁴⁰ United Nations, 2000, p. 6

¹⁴¹ Windhoek Declaration and Namibia Plan of Action, 2000, Paragraph 9a

¹⁴² Windhoek Declaration and Namibia Plan of Action, 2000, Paragraph 31

ARRIA FORMULA

Arria formulas are informal meetings or arrangements that allow the UNSCR to be briefed about international peace and security matters in a more flexible manner. These meetings first came into existence in 1992. They are considered to be of special importance as all members of the UNSC can invite other Council members to such a meeting, whereas in the UNSC only delegations, UN officials and high government officials of UNSC members are able to raise issues and make statements. Although not common practice, NGOs, civil society actors, representatives of NSAs and heads of IOs can get invited to Arria Formulas. Because of the informal nature, minutes, records and outcomes of the meetings are not published in UN databases. They are chronicled by references in official UN documents. From the references made in those documents as well as reports from NGOs and newspapers, it became apparent that on the 23rd of October 2000, the delegation of Jamaica organized an Arria Formula, inviting ten NGOs. The main speakers at the meeting were all women: Inonge Mbikusita from Africa Women's Peace Movements, Eugenia Piza Lopes from International Alert, Isha Dyfan from Women's International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF), Luz Mendez from Natinal Union of Guatemalan Women, Faize Jama Mohamed from Africa Office of Equality Now, Mary Diaz from the Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children, Anne Burke from Amnesty International, Betty Reardon from International Peace Research Association and Cora Weiss from the Hague Appeal for Peace. Hundreds of human rights movements and women's organizations had been pressing for this meeting, on behalf of local grassroots groups struggling to end war.

To form a strong lobby and platform which linked NGOs to the UNSC, International Alert, WILPF and the Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children formed the NGO Working Group on Women and International Peace and Security. The NGOWG provided a unique forum for many different NGOs to access the UNSC. In recent years it has grown to a platform of 38 organizations, holding between 40 to 45 meetings with UNSC members annually. This Group sent a letter prior to the Arria Formula, outlining that they hope the UNSC will make sure "gender issues" are "fully mainstreamed into the actions and operations resulting from the Council's decisions".¹⁴³ The Group encourages the UNSC "to ensure that women play a greater role, at all levels, in peace support operations, conflict prevention and peace building" and to "afford women and girls greater protection and assistance in situations

¹⁴³ NGO WG, 2000a

of armed conflict’’, hereby transcending the conceptualization of gender from victimized to representative to all roles women have before, during and after armed conflict.¹⁴⁴ In addition, the minutes of the Arria formula meeting demonstrate that the discussions are centred around the term ‘women’ rather than ‘gender’, and imply a sole focus on the positive role that women can fulfil as well as the need to protect them as they are the victims of armed conflict. Representatives present at the Arria formula stated that “women are neither simply victims, nor are they passive in the face of war. Even in the worst and most dangerous of circumstances, women have shown their courage and leadership’’.¹⁴⁵ The victimized narrative of women, although empirically verifiable, was highly endorsed throughout the meeting. After the Arria formula meeting, a press statement was given emphasizing the need for urgent change and condemning all actors in the international community who are “silent witnesses to these abuses,” and who are promoting that a “culture of silence and impunity prevails’’.¹⁴⁶ The activism of the NGOs resulted in one of the most historic Arria formula meetings to date, pressuring the UNSC to adopt a resolution on WPS rather sooner than later.

PRESS RELEASES

Before the adoption of UNSCR 1325, news websites, papers, reports and other documents from all over the world reported on “the unprecedented session on the impact of war on women’’.¹⁴⁷ Press releases refrain from defining gender aspects or the role of women in conflict but rather report on the agenda-setting phase by UN officials and civil society actors. A thorough search in universal databases produced data not reported in the previous minutes of the declarations and statements. A US paper highlighted a closed-door meeting before the adoption of UNSCR 1325 during which UNSC members listened to the call of women of Sierra Leone, Somalia and other war zones to incorporate a gender perspective in all peace efforts. This closed-door meeting is not mentioned in UN databases, however it is mentioned numerous times in newspapers. In a Chinese article dated a week before the adoption of UNSCR 1325, it is stated that the UNSC was willing to have an open debate on WPS which can be regarded as a move as it was pressured to address the urgency of the situation after it heard of the informal testimony about GBSV and other crimes committed against women during the closed meeting.¹⁴⁸ Another different approach was the reporting of a British newspaper, stating that

¹⁴⁴ NGO WG, 2000a

¹⁴⁵ NGO WG, 2000a

¹⁴⁶ NGO WG, 2000c

¹⁴⁷ Lederer, 2000

¹⁴⁸ Xinhua News, 2000

in a news briefing on the day of the UNSC meeting only female representatives of Guatemala, Somalia and Zambia were leading the briefing and participating on behalf of the UNSC instead of UN representatives.¹⁴⁹ Furthermore, the Toronto Star reported that the female Ambassador of Liechtenstein told the UNSC that a handful of women ambassadors at the United Nations have been collecting names since 1996 of women available for decision-making positions, including those involved in war and peace situations¹⁵⁰. Female representatives within the UN had thus been striving informally for an improved position of women within UN bodies four years before it got on the agenda of the UNSC.

CIVIL SOCIETY

The main leading organization in the agenda-setting phase was UNIFEM, merged into UN WOMEN in 2011. UNIFEM was the women's fund at the UN, mandated to promote gender equality and women's empowerment in the agendas and operations within the UN apparatus and established as the Voluntary Fund for the UN Decade for Women in the International Women's year in 1976. UN WOMEN is a highly influential UN gender entity as it had considerable impact in advancing gender equality through their lobbying during the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action and CEDAW. Within their mandate, UN WOMEN supports inter-governmental bodies by helping them with policy formulation; secondly UN WOMEN provides financial support to inter-governmental bodies and helps forge partnerships with civil society and lastly it leads and coordinates the UN system's work on gender equality.¹⁵¹ UN WOMEN has partnerships with UNHCR, UNICEF, UNDP and UN Population Fund. Next to that, the partnerships with civil society were of special importance during the agenda-setting phase of UNSCR 1325. Within the UN WOMEN Global Civil Society Advisory Group there are 22 members, of whom 19 female. The following countries have representatives in the UN WOMEN civil society group: Nicaragua, Spain, Peru, Trinidad & Tobago, Argentina, US (two representatives), Canada, Somalia, Egypt, Morocco, Kenya (three representatives), South Africa, Philippines, Pakistan, Nepal, Fiji, Denmark, Turkey, France, Uganda, Libya and Sri Lanka. The representatives are leaders of grass-roots, rural and community-based groups, indigenous peoples' organizations, scholars, activists and male advocates for gender equality and human rights. The aim of this group is to build close relationships with civil society actors, and increase a dialogue at all levels to recognize the

¹⁴⁹ Presswire, 2000

¹⁵⁰ The Toronto Star, 2000

¹⁵¹ UN Women, 1995

importance of the input of these actors. The vital political role of the group is to advance shared objectives of the WPS agenda and discuss the diverse perspectives during web platforms.

On the path towards the adoption of UNSCR 1325, civil society has shown its influence through UN WOMEN (or, back then, through UNIFEM). Ms. Noeleen Heyzer, then Executive Director of UNIFEM gave a statement during the Open Debate on WPS by the UNSC on behalf of the civil society actors. In the statement, it is said that women continue to be the victims of war and conflict, going unprotected by the international community and suffering from gender inequality which threatens international peace and security.¹⁵² Furthermore, before demonstrating a five point agenda “relating to specific actions the Council could take to improve women’s protection and support their peacebuilding efforts”, it was highlighted that these plans created by the group needed to be “acted upon with urgency”.¹⁵³

While UN Women bases its impact on the partnership with sister funds and programmes at the UN, civil society organizations outside of the UN also played a critical role in advocating for the creation of UNSCR 1325. All civil society organizations present at the informal Arria formula were influential during the agenda-setting phase. These are the Women’s Commission for Refugee Women and Children (WCRWC); African Women’s Committee on Peace and Democratization and Federation of Africa Women’s Peace Movements; Women’s International League for Peace and Freedom; Africa Office of Equality Now; Amnesty International; International Peace Research Association; Hague Appeal for Peace; National Union of Guatemalan Women and International Alert and CARE International. From these civil society actors, Amnesty International, the Hague Appeal for Peace. The founding members of the NGOWG highlighted the necessity and the potential of civil society activism to influence changes at the state and supra-state level. Despite its influential role in contemporary debates, civil society actors have dedicated many years long before the creation of UNSCR 1325 to improving the WPS agenda, and even though UN agencies mostly speak on their behalf, the roots of the NGOs are traced back through decades of feminist approaches and activism long before the UN officially recognized the matter.

4.2.2 Analysis

The empirical evidence shows that hypothesis 1 on emphasizing geopolitical and military aspects of security can be partially confirmed. On the one hand, it can be disconfirmed as the

¹⁵² Heyzer, 2000, 2

¹⁵³ Heyzer, 2000, 2

documents researched in the agenda-setting phase have shown almost no geopolitical and military wordings to describe international security. Moreover, the Beijing Declaration specifically advocated to enhance women's empowerment, and negotiated thoroughly on how to define gender. A special commission was even set up to discuss how to proceed when using the term 'gender' in declarations – and concluded that it did not need clarification at all. In addition, both the Windhoek Declaration and delegates in the Arria formula endorsed the perspective of looking at underlying dimensions of long-term peace and security.

On the other hand, hypothesis 1 can be considered to be indirectly confirmed as there is simply not sufficient data on the what security entails in the documents. Concrete examples of underlying dimensions that hinder international peace and security and specifically security for women, are not mentioned in any of the researched data. The empirical evidence can indeed be interpreted in the sense that this lack of consensus on conceptualisations which are at the centre of the discussions indirectly confirms the hypothesis. Western actors refrain from specifically defining peace, however by focusing on the absence of war, violence against women and focusing solely on the effect of conflict on women, it can be argued that geopolitical and military aspects of security are inherent to discussing peace.

Furthermore, the empirical evidence shows that hypothesis 2 can be confirmed. Firstly, the dialogue between civil society actors, UN entities and inter-governmental bodies was stronger for UN entities. The Beijing Declaration saw the biggest presence of NGOs, in contrast with the Windhoek Declaration that was, admittedly, a lot smaller. During the Windhoek Declaration, discussions were led by both female and male representatives, however these representatives were mostly Western actors. The empirical evidence shows the willingness of various delegations to rephrase discourse on the impact of war and armed conflict on women but they remain vague on concrete formulations of how the discourse should change. The influence of civil society on the documents leading to UNSCR 1325 is not as impactful as that of UN entities, endorsing the rather small role of civil society actors within the UN system at the time. Despite pressure from NGO lobbying groups before, during and after the Arria formula meeting such as the UN Working Group, the UNSC maintains institutional control over the negotiations and the resolution. Secondly, the data shows that women in fact were victimized in discussions. The evidence shows how the actors outline the horrors done to women during war and conflict, and the impact it has on this gender as a whole. By emphasizing the representation by NGOs of the targeted women in the policies of the WPS agenda, women are assumed to be apolitical, "inhabiting and apolitical space", and 'civil society actors' are defined as their translators who are informal and not connected to the state

or UN actors.¹⁵⁴ The voice of the targeted women is thus not heard, and moreover it is not given the chance to speak as NGOs alter definitions to fit UNSC discourse.

4.3 Negotiation phase

4.3.1 Case description

The second phase begins with UNSC debate on the 24th of October 2000, the first official debate within the UNSC on WPS. The debate commences twice on the 24th and resumes on the 25th of October 2000. On the 31st of October 2000, UNSCR 1325 is adopted which ends this phase.

SECURITY COUNCIL MEETING 4208

The first official meeting on WPS by the UNSC was chaired by the President of the UNGA Theo-Ben Gurirab from the Namibian Delegation. The attending members were the delegations of Argentina, Bangladesh, Canada, China, France, Jamaica, Malaysia, Mali, Netherlands, Russian Federation, Tunisia, Ukraine, United Kingdom of the Great Britain and Northern Ireland (UK) and the United States of America (USA). Out of fifteen delegates, two were female representatives: the delegation of Jamaica and the delegation of the US. Furthermore, 24 representatives from other states were invited to participate in the negotiations. Two key actors, Assistant Secretary-General and Special Advisor on Gender Issues and Advancement of Women, Ms. Angela King (Jamaica) as well as the female Executive Director of the UN Development Fund for Women, Noeleen Heyzer (Singapore) were also invited.¹⁵⁵

The content of the meeting is based on the commitment to gender equality and its policy of securing the rights and status of women in all areas. Similar to the Windhoek Declaration, the gender perspective in this sense is focused more on the roles that women have within the UN system and the aim to improve these roles, rather than on the role of women in post-conflict environments. Statements of all delegations include a paragraph on the urge to appoint more women in high decision-making ranks both inside and outside the UN apparatus and to take account of the gender perspective in policy formulating and negotiating processes. The delegation of Bangladesh stated that in order to achieve long-term security, a peace culture needs to be created, “with women at its helm”.¹⁵⁶ The Russian Federation expressed the

¹⁵⁴ George & Shepherd, 2016, p. 116

¹⁵⁵ United Nations Security Council, 2000a

¹⁵⁶ United Nations Security Council, 2000a, p. 20

urgency to look at all dimensions in order to strengthen strategic stability and international security:

There is no more reliable way to protect women from the horrors of war than eliminating conflicts from people's lives. This was the thrust of Russia's proposal to strengthen strategic stability, which calls for unity of action by the international community in the military, political, socio-economic, human rights and environmental-protection areas¹⁵⁷

Underlying causes of conflict including social and economic issues which are particularly harmful to women, were highlighted to discuss the development of a culture of crisis prevention and indirectly the protection of women in post-conflict zones.

While the participants agreed on adopting an increased focus on underlying dimensions of conflict, the focus on how to understand the role of women in conflict and implement the gender perspective on conflict was debated about. Different formulations were employed by various delegations which came to the fore during the meeting. Ms King, being the first participant to make a statement, described that in discussions on the experience of women and girls in armed conflict, the discussion concentrated on their role as victims. She noted that "today's debate will show that we have come a long way in a relatively short time", implying that the delegations will discuss the role of women not as victims but as something else.¹⁵⁸ The delegation of the US expressed a similar point: "the 1993 World Conference on Human Rights focused on women solely as victims of armed conflict. While the issue of protection of women cannot be ignored, I hope that Security Council action will emphasize the leadership role women can and should play in restoring peace".¹⁵⁹ Similarly, the delegation of the UK states that women should not solely be seen as the victims of armed conflict, but need to be seen as key actors in peace negotiations.¹⁶⁰ The delegation of South Africa expressed a similar view: "It is true that, in today's conflicts, it is civilians, and women and children in particular, who bear the brunt of gross abuses of human rights. There is another dimension, however, and we need to move beyond the limited approach of portraying women solely as victims in conflicts".¹⁶¹ However, there was no mention of role of women as (political) agents but rather a stereotypical statement: "women play a key role in sustaining both the family and the wider community ... More often than not, it is the working women who must quite literally put bread

¹⁵⁷ United Nations Security Council, 2000a, p. 22

¹⁵⁸ United Nations Security Council, 2000a, p. 3

¹⁵⁹ United Nations Security Council, 2000a, p. 12

¹⁶⁰ United Nations Security Council, 2000a, p. 19

¹⁶¹ United Nations Security Council, 2000a, p. 21

on the table and hold families together”¹⁶² The delegations of France, Singapore, Indonesia, Australia, Ukraine, Norway, Namibia and Canada expressed similar statements on the victimization of women. A striking statement of the delegation of India made by Mrs. Bose showed that because women are not combatants, they became the favoured victims of modern war. The delegation asks the Council if the answer to not victimize women then lies in “giving women the dubious right to fight alongside their menfolk in modern armies?”¹⁶³ The Indian delegation continues:

Throughout history, women have taken up arms when the need has been desperate ... We need to consider the impact on our societies, and on their tendency to war, if women become part of and glorify the military culture ... In every culture, the organized violence of war and conflict has been a male preserve. That is a steel purdah in which we can leave our men¹⁶⁴

Females as ex-combatants is stigmatized as women only being needed in desperate times, and that the male preserve of violence and conflict should stay a male preserve. The perspective of the delegations on the victimization of women in armed conflict is mentioned 61 times throughout the meeting, of which eleven times delegations expressed the urgency to adopt a different discourse on the role of women. However, other than mentioning the necessity for more female representatives in peace negotiations, a concrete idea of what these different roles entail for all women living both in peace as well as in conflict and what actions need to be taken to change the discourse, remains unclear.

SECURITY COUNCIL RESOLUTION 1325

Unanimously adopted on the 31st of October 2000, UNSCR 1325 consists of five key provisions. First of all, it focuses on an increased participation and representation of women at all levels of decision-making. Second, it emphasizes the importance of a gender perspective in post-conflict processes. Third, special attention is paid to specific protection needs for women and girls in conflict. Furthermore, it zooms in on the need for a gender perspective in UN programming, reporting, and in SC missions as well as, lastly, a gender perspective and training in UN peace missions. These provisions are outlined in four main categories: participation, prevention, protection and relief and recovery. At the negotiation table, the UNSC permanent five were present (China, France, Russia, UK and US) along with the non-permanent members:

¹⁶² United Nations Security Council, 2000b, p. 19

¹⁶³ United Nations Security Council, 2000b, p. 19

¹⁶⁴ United Nations Security Council, 2000b, p. 19

Argentina, Bangladesh, Canada, Jamaica, Malaysia, Mali, Namibia, the Netherlands, Tunisia and Ukraine. Out of the fifteen delegations, two were female (Jamaica and the US).

The theoretical concepts in UNSCR 1325 are the most relevant in this thesis' case study. The study looks at the conceptualizations of peace and gender. In UNSCR 1325, peace is defined as the absence of violence.¹⁶⁵ Violence as a concept is mentioned three times in the resolution. In article 10, it reads: "calls on all parties to armed conflict to take special measures to protect women and girls from gender-based violence, particularly rape and other forms of sexual abuse, and all other forms of violence in situations of armed conflict".¹⁶⁶ The third time violence is used is in Article 11 of the resolution, stating:

Emphasizes the responsibility of all States to put an end to impunity and to prosecute those responsible for genocide, crimes against humanity, and war crimes including those relating to sexual and other violence against women and girls, and in this regard stresses the need to exclude these crimes, where feasible from amnesty provisions¹⁶⁷

The representation of violence in UNSCR 1325 is given as a matter of conflict, differentiated as armed conflict. In other words, to achieve sustainable peace, there must be absence of armed conflict. And conflict in UNSCR 1325 is regarded as violence. Consequently, humanitarian and economic rights which are inherent to sustainable peace are disregarded by the conceptualization. UNSCR 1325 sees peace as the absence of conflict, as conflict creates 'refugees and internally displaced persons', and 'combatants and armed elements' thwart the way to 'durable peace and reconciliation'.¹⁶⁸ Next to that, the effect of violence on women is regarded as violence that overcomes women. Article 10 reads: "calls on all parties to armed conflict to take special measures to protect women and girls from gender-based violence, particularly rape and other forms of sexual abuse, and all other forms of violence in situations of armed conflict".¹⁶⁹

Furthermore, an apparent lack of a clear definition of female ex-combatants (special) needs is being looked at from a gender perspective. By incorporating a gender perspective into future UN (DDR) programs, UNSCR 1325 acknowledges 'special needs' of women and girls: "Emphasizing the need for all parties to ensure that mine clearance and mine awareness programmes take into account the special needs of women and girls;"¹⁷⁰ "Recognizing also

¹⁶⁵ United Nations Security Council, 2000c, Preamble

¹⁶⁶ United Nations Security Council, 2000c, Article 10

¹⁶⁷ United Nations Security Council, 2000c, Article 11

¹⁶⁸ United Nations Security Council, 2000c, Preamble

¹⁶⁹ United Nations Security Council, 2000c, Article 10

¹⁷⁰ United Nations Security Council, 2000c, Preamble

the importance of the recommendation contained in the statement of its President to the press of 8 March 2000 for specialized training for all peacekeeping personnel on the protection, special needs and human rights of women and children in conflict situations;”¹⁷¹ “The special needs of women and girls during repatriation and resettlement and for rehabilitation, reintegration and post-conflict reconstruction;”¹⁷² “Calls on all parties to armed conflict to take special measures to protect women and girls from gender-based violence, particularly rape and other forms of sexual abuse, and all other forms of violence in situations of armed conflict”¹⁷³ and “Reaffirms its readiness, whenever measures are adopted under Article 41 of the Charter of the United Nations, to give consideration to their potential impact on the civilian population, bearing in mind the special needs of women and girls, in order to consider appropriate humanitarian exemptions”.¹⁷⁴ It is evident the UN regards the needs of women to be ‘special’ ones, which as defined by the Oxford Dictionary is “not ordinary or usual; different from what is normal”.¹⁷⁵ This is problematic, as women’s issues are inherently considered to be not mainstream and secondly because nowhere in the resolution is it defined what exactly the definition of special needs is. Furthermore, women are associated with children, which pairs two distinctive groups with distinctive needs into one category. The lack of clear definitions, goals and responsibility results in a lack of political pressure. Gender, and in particular women, are concepts open to different interpretations which consequently leads to dysfunctionalities in gender-oriented DDR programs.

4.3.2 Analysis

The empirical evidence shows support for hypothesis 1. Although the first debates on WPS demonstrated a strong focus on gender empowerment and incorporating a gender-perspective and the Russian delegation mentioned looking at the root causes of conflict such as economic and social dimensions, the Member States refrained from specifically formulating a definition or consensus on conflict and security. Resolution 1325 demonstrates particularly strong evidence as in the Resolution alone, the concept of violence is mentioned three times. Furthermore, Member States call for prosecution for those responsible for committing (war) crimes particularly against women and girls, using direct language which is refrained from in prior negotiations. One can interpret this notion to indicate a process of securitization in order

¹⁷¹ United Nations Security Council, 2000c, Preamble

¹⁷² United Nations Security Council, 2000c, Article 8a

¹⁷³ United Nations Security Council, 2000c, Article 10

¹⁷⁴ United Nations Security Council, 2000c, Article 14

¹⁷⁵ Special, 2020

to pass this ground-breaking resolution. However, the securitization of the vital concepts has resulted in employing a too narrow definition which thwarts effective DDR policies. In other words, the wording in the Resolution is perceived as problematic as it allows important underlying dimensions such as economic and human rights to be ignored, confirming hypothesis 1.

In addition, the empirical data shows strong evidence to confirm hypothesis 2. Despite instructions of eleven delegations in the UNSC debates to adopt a broader perspective on the role of women in conflict, the data shows that actors during the negotiation phase structurally depicted women as victims of violence. Moreover, the Indian delegation noted that ‘organized violence of war and conflict has been a male preserve, in every culture’. The stereotypical conceptualization does not allow for any other roles women have during and after armed conflict. Furthermore, within the Resolution, incorporating a gender perspective in DDR programs focuses on the special needs of women and girls and female and male ex-combatants. The Member States indirectly show that because women deserve ‘special’ attention, gender is not mainstreamed and in order to do so, concrete goals must be decided upon to realize a gender-oriented program. Defining gender as women with special needs ignores the fact that women apart from victims can be leading figures or combatants in conflict zones too. The Western understanding of gender questions is thus evident in the negotiation phase.

Finally, the data shows relatively short and small meetings in comparison to the agenda-setting phase. Within two days, the draft for UNSCR 1325 was constructed, implying that without a broad, extensive debate in the UNSC the Resolution passed. Five years prior to the adoption of the Resolution, the concept of gender had not yet been formulated in official UN documents. This emphasizes the urgent nature of the draft of the content of UNSCR 1325. Similarly, societal debates prior to the negotiations in the UN led to a pressure on the UNSC to adopt a resolution on WPS. And because it did so in the time frame presented, the used definitions by the Member States on peace, security and gender included a too narrow definition resulting in dysfunctional programs.

4.4 Implementation deficits

4.4.1 Case description

To find evidence for the hypotheses confirmed during the empirical research, this phase looks at the consequences of the dysfunctional wordings in UNSCR 1325 in regards to implementation deficits of gender-oriented DDR programs. Examples of disparities between gender-oriented policies and practical implementation will focus on the narrow definition of

peace and security that is adopted as well as the result of adopting a Western understanding of gender questions.

NARROW DEFINITION OF PEACE

As evident in the empirical analysis of this research, the narrow approach to defining peace as the absence of war results in a gendered, economic impact of war that is not incorporated in the wordings of UNSCR 1325. Extensive research on the implementation deficits in gender-oriented DDR programs demonstrates a lot of attention in literature on case studies in Sri Lanka, Sierra Leone, Democratic Republic of the Congo and Uganda. Findings in the research of Annan et al. (2011) on testing the theories of the gendered impacts of war and the determinants of reintegration success concluded that females in post-war zones have very few civil opportunities as their own rights are not included in UN policies, and suggests a major shift in gender and DDR policy.¹⁷⁶ One of the most striking examples of this notion is in Sri Lanka, where the lack of understanding, or as one might argue the decision to ignore the underlying factors to armed conflict such as economic dimensions led to a paradox in results. The evidence in the Sri Lankan case study showed that even when female ex-combatants are included in DDR processes and have completed them, they find themselves unable to find employment and reintegrate in society fully.¹⁷⁷ Female ex-combatants in Sri Lanka fully participated in the DDR program but found themselves unemployed as the fastest-growing sectors (such as real estate, construction, banking, etc.) which received the most development funds were male dominated and discriminating against hiring women employees. Similarly, in a case study on the DDR programme in Sierra Leone, neoliberal influences on the reintegration process in DDR are identified as this step of the process is focusing “mainly on economic productivity”.¹⁷⁸ Income generation activities are argued to be at the centre of the programmes with the aim of ex-combatants using their skills, energies and talents to productive pursuits and results, not taking into account the employment gap female ex-combatants face after completing the DDR programme. Humanitarian as well as economic aspects are not defined within the gender-oriented policies, however the focus in the policies is on eliminating the threat of violence. Because as argued in this thesis, that is how peace is defined. As a result, female ex-combatants find themselves in deplorable economic situations they cannot get out of. Moreover, there is evidence that DDR program coordinators in Sierra Leone received

¹⁷⁶ Annan et al., 2011, p. 897

¹⁷⁷ Hauge, 2020, p. 211

¹⁷⁸ MacKenzie, 2009, p. 204

funding from the World Bank, UNICEF and other international organizations without making a local market assessment, and were told to specifically offer certain trades, which resulted in an overabundance of these trades.¹⁷⁹ Female ex-combatants, possessing incredible fight skills, would find themselves knitting clothes and selling them in markets already overwhelmed with similar products. In addition, some of the interviewees in the Sierra Leone case study expressed that programme resources were directed only at certain political groups and discriminated against the economically and socially challenged females. Furthermore, numerous cases in Sierra Leone, the DR Congo and Uganda have shown that a lack of long-term reintegration measures such as focusing on employment or education, pressured (young) female ex-combatants to go back into the army or armed groups as they felt frustrated, angry and disillusioned without a clear vision of a future or a stable income.¹⁸⁰ Next to that, as DDR programmes assist specifically male ex-combatants carrying weapons, the impression is that males and especially females without a weapon are being punished for not having one. Besides, in that sense ‘favouring’ armed ex-combatants over non-armed ex-combatants directly places them in a disadvantaged civilian position.¹⁸¹ Finally, these findings illustrate the shortcomings within DDR which requires research not solely at the level of implementation but arguably even more so at the decision-making level prior to the creation of gendered DDR policies. Hence, there exists a striking disparity between gender-oriented DDR commitments and the disconnected and fragmented implementation of it.

WESTERN UNDERSTANDING OF GENDER QUESTIONS

In addition, the Western, often victimized approach to comprehending and defining gender questions has enormous effects on the effectiveness of DDR programs. That DDR programmes fail to address and assist female ex-combatants can be clearly explained through the Aceh case. In 1976, armed conflict in Aceh began because of human rights violations and exploitation of the natural resources in the region by the Indonesian government.¹⁸² In 2005, a Peace Agreement was signed giving Aceh more autonomy and ending violence between the armed groups. One of these groups had a female wing consisting of 500 women who all had had combat training.¹⁸³ The group that this female battalion belonged to did not officially recognize the group and so did not include them in the peace negotiations. They were

¹⁷⁹ MacKenzie, 2009, p. 209

¹⁸⁰ Brett & Specht, 2004, pp. 129-134

¹⁸¹ Bouta, 2005, p. 13

¹⁸² Hauge, 2020, p. 209

¹⁸³ Marhaban, 2012, p. 197

not recognized as combatants because they did not all carry weapons, and as such they did not receive financial reintegration packages or participated in DDR programmes. Women who did receive assistance and financial compensation in the Aceh case were civilian groups, including the widows of killed men.¹⁸⁴

Research of UN WOMEN on gender-sensitive DDR in Liberia showed a different perspective on women participating in atrocities. Some women became combatants and joined ANSAs only because it was the only way to protect and feed their families. However, one group of female combatants called the Women's Artillery Commandos (WAC), was regarded as an elite team as, in the words of a Liberian health minister, they "took their mission very seriously" and "did not get drunk".¹⁸⁵ Furthermore, female combatants in the WAC told an interviewer of the Human Rights Watch that they would purposefully capture female soldiers to provide women for male soldiers to have sexual relationships with. GBSV was not feared by these women, rather it was provided by them for the men.¹⁸⁶

Moreover, the lack of space and understanding in DDR programs for the needs of female ex-combatants can also be traced back to UNSCR 1325. Although recent developments and processes in DDR practices aim to target all women as equally to men, research on DDR programmes in Mozambique and Sierra Leone show that female ex-combatants who served in the army were deliberately excluded as they were not regarded as a serious security threat.¹⁸⁷ Focusing on those women was considered to be of secondary consideration, as DDR programmes aim to first and foremost restoring security and thus disarm direct threats. Also, due to conceptual and implementation obstacles, DDR programmes often are inaccessible to female ex-combatants.¹⁸⁸ Even when local grassroots movements approach female ex-combatants to hear the difficulties they are experiencing, the grassroots movements are dependent on international consultants to translate their message in a way that it gets noticed by the UN Member States. Next to that, various reasons are identified why women themselves do not want to participate in DDR programmes. It is argued that there are logistic challenges such as the distance to the site of the program, lack of child-care options or lack of transportation. These challenges have a big impact on the successful participation of women, however their concerns are not heard. Secondly, there are safety concerns about the demobilization centers and when armed conflict has not come to an end yet, women are

¹⁸⁴ Hauge, 2020, p. 209

¹⁸⁵ United Nations Development Fund for Women, 2004, p. 10

¹⁸⁶ United Nations Development Fund for Women, 2004, p. 10

¹⁸⁷ Arthy, 2003

¹⁸⁸ Gizelis, 2011, p. 527

inclined to hold on to their weapons. Also, women have found to prefer to anonymize themselves to not face threats and abuses from the community. The violation of hegemonic femininity by stigmatizing female ex-combatants and the gendered concept of women being peaceful and men being violent is a thwart to the reintegration process of said women in post-conflict communities.¹⁸⁹

4.4.2 Analysis

The research of literature on dysfunctionalities in gender-oriented DDR programs show the consequences of the narrow approaches used in the Resolution as well as the adoption of a Western understanding of gender aspects. The data show that by focusing on peace as the absence of war, there is no attention for other dimensions which are of importance to implement a successful gender-oriented DDR program.¹⁹⁰ Furthermore, DDR programmes assist women in developing skills which at times are considered useless when they return to their communities and funding resources often do not impact the targeted female ex-combatants but rather strengthen actors discriminating against these women. As a consequence, female ex-combatants find no civil or employment opportunities and end up worse than before participating in DDR programs. In addition, literature demonstrates evidence for the neoliberal perspective on resource allocations and funding and argues that economic productivity is at the heart of the programmes, putting women at a disadvantage. The underlying dimensions outside of the UN definitions are not considered during the implementation phase.

Furthermore, the status of a female ex-combatant is often ignored or disregarded as they do not fall under the generalized definition of combatants being (armed) men. The Aceh case is one of many which perfectly emphasizes the problem of excluding females in peace negotiations and excluding females from participating in DDR programmes. Other results include that female ex-combatants also experience stigmatization and marginalization and therefore have reasons to decide to not participate in DDR programmes. Also, the agency of women as combatants has specific (political) salience in the case of Liberia. The evidence shows that women are capable of participating in absolute atrocities and committing crimes against humanity. This discourse is not used at all in UNSCR 1325. Similarly, the example of grassroots movements being dependent on international actors to get their issues translated to

¹⁸⁹ Mazurana & Cole, 2013, p. 7

¹⁹⁰ The following paragraph is my own work previously handed in to complete the course 1920 Gender, Conflict and International Institution (3 V) MAN-MGEM001-2019-3-V, semester 2019/2020, lecturer dr. J.M. Joachim, followed at Radboud University, Nijmegen, the Netherlands

the political agenda shows that the women in the targeted communities can be seen as the subalterns. All actors involved in the agenda-setting, negotiations and implementation processes act and behave from their own perspectives, demonstrating the enormous disparity between the subaltern's needs and the subaltern's possibilities, despite good intentions.

5. Conclusion

In this concluding chapter the answer to the research question will be presented as well as a discussion of the hypotheses. This is followed by demonstrating the broader implications of the empirical evidence and after it shows a reflection on the chosen methodology. This chapter will end with recommendations for future research and a discussion on its societal relevance.

In this thesis, a case study on dysfunctional wordings in UNSCR 1325 was conducted to research gender-oriented DDR programs. These dysfunctionalities were empirically investigated by examining the implications of the conceptualizations of 'peace' and 'gender' in the Resolution.

Answering the research question:

What explains the gender-oriented dysfunctionalities in United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325?

The answer is in twofold. The UN Security Council's narrow definition of peace and gender has resulted in the ignoring of economic and humanitarian dimensions which are of importance to understand women's special needs in DDR programs. Consequently, there is a lack of a definition of the special needs of female ex-combatants which results in implementation deficits. In addition, extensive lobbying of civil society actors has resulted in the creation of UNSCR 1325, yet they were absent from negotiation talks which consequently led to a securitized approach to peace and gender. Secondly, the discourse on women in conflict used by actors dominant in the creation of UNSCR 1325 shows a dialogue of victimization because of a Western understanding of gender aspects. As a result, gender-oriented DDR programs prove to be dysfunctional to female ex-combatants. Furthermore, the lack of a consensus between UNSC Member States over the definition of 'gender' evidently results in unclear DDR policies.

To find empirical evidence to test the hypotheses, extensive document analysis has resulted in various empirical findings. In order to test the first hypothesis, this thesis' research has analysed geopolitical and military aspects of security. It finds evidence that allows the hypothesis to be partially confirmed. On the one hand, data from the agenda-setting phase show a lack of geopolitical and military approaches to security. Negotiators both from civil society as well as UN officials use gender-related terms in abundance to emphasize the willingness to adopt a gender-oriented perspective in the UN and its policies. Likewise, negotiation actors showed no securitization of security in gender as delegations mentioned adopting a more holistic understanding of long-term peace and security by focusing on the roots of armed conflict. Despite these findings, the hypothesis can be confirmed as empirical evidence also shows the dominance of UN Member States over the discourse adopted in the construction of UNSCR 1325. Refraining from incorporating specific conceptualisations of peace and gender but using the absence of violence as a definition of peace shows that geopolitical and military aspects are inherent to these negotiations in the UNSC.

Furthermore, the empirical findings demonstrate that hypothesis 2 can be confirmed. A Western understanding of gender questions has resulted in a discourse of gender victimization. This framing has stigmatized women's roles in armed conflict and in post-conflict environments, leading to dysfunctionalities in gender-related UN resolutions. All analysed phases show a dominance of Western actors over civil society actors on the creation of the resolution as the UNSC maintains institutional control which consequently has led to dysfunctional wordings. The data shows that civil society actors have been influential in the agenda-setting phase, however the suggestions on WPS issues needed to fit UNSC discourse which resulted in the lack of a subaltern perspective. Also, the data shows that the strong pressure from civil society actors on the UNSC to adopt a resolution on WPS consequently led to a relatively (too) quick construction of UNSCR 1325.

It is evident that the hypotheses are not mutually exclusive. They are heuristic and can be confirmed simultaneously, although hypothesis 1 is confirmed partially. Even though the mechanisms that were proposed in hypothesis 1 did not all function as expected, the chosen concepts in the hypotheses did allow for alternative mechanisms to be exposed. The partial confirmation is based on data gathered over different phases showing different outcomes. Consequently, it can be argued that hypothesis 2 has more explanatory power. There are theoretical implications related to this notion. The empirical findings demonstrate that non-Western actors were present at negotiations, representing the needs of subaltern actors in the international political system. Still, it is evident that dysfunctionalities persisted even when

non-Western actors were involved in the phases. Postcolonial theorists can thus focus more on domestic actors and national structures afore analysing the influence of international actors on the position of the subaltern. In regards to the securitization theory, scholars can focus more on the advantages of employing a narrow definition as it allows for concrete research which narrows the scope of resolutions in a way that is clear and concise.

One of the most recognizable weaknesses in this research is the selection of the amount of data researched in the empirical analysis. Because of an almost unlimited number of available documents on the agenda-setting, negotiations and implementation phase, the analysis is subject to possible bias. This weakness is particularly visible in the data gathered to test hypothesis 1 in the analysis of the agenda-setting phase. There is no sufficient data on the definitions of security and gender and this lack of data has implications for finding the causal mechanisms in that part of the case study. The lack of substantial evidence may result in causal mechanisms operating undetected. This research has traced back the sequence of events that resulted in the adoption of UNSCR 1325. However, it is possible that certain pathways in the forms of closed-door meetings, informal meetings or advisors and consultants have securitized important aspects that ultimately led to the outcome. Furthermore, the role of the author needs to be regarded as a weakness too. In qualitative research, the perspective of the researcher has influence on how data is interpreted. Consequently, the thesis' findings are inherently biased because factors such as gender, ethnicity and age influenced the interpretation of the evidence. Finally, primary sources of the UN database were often translated which has similar implications for biased interpretations of discourses.

In regards to this case study, there are various recommendations. In order to strengthen the validity of the findings significantly, interviews should be conducted in order to analyse the motivations and intentions of Western actors in the UNSC. These interviews would improve understanding of why Western actors adopted the narrow approach of peace and security. Similarly, interviews should be held with non-Western delegations and leading NGOs to comprehend why these actors agreed with a narrow definition of peace and security. These interviews can collect a deeper understanding of the causal mechanisms prior to the events that led to UNSCR 1325. They can help clarify whether these actors were merely present to gain recognition for their country, government, or themselves, or because it was evident that without adopting the narrow definition, the UNSC would not have passed the resolution. With regards to the subaltern theory, experiencing cognitive dissonance when studying, formulating and comprehending subaltern theory can be an abstract notion that deserves attention in literature. One's own perspective, even when observing and objectively discussing the subaltern theory,

always has an influence on how knowledge is perceived. To give up one's own identity is to change one's perception. Applied to the subaltern actors, the theory might discover pathways to find the voice of the subaltern and listen to it.

Despite its limitations, this thesis has significant scientific and societal relevance. Academically, the research has provided a unique answer to the thesis' question based on structures and procedures that led to the creation of UNSCR 1325 by incorporating two important theories as independent variables. The shortcomings of gender-oriented DDR programs are relatively new in contemporary academic literature and this thesis has supplemented existing literature and provides a new approach to the debate.

The societal relevance of this thesis is the new contribution it provides to understanding peacebuilding outside of the prevailing Western scope. It has enabled a more comprehensive understanding of the process of peacebuilding from agenda-setting to implementation in which it has focused specifically on gender. The findings of the thesis have enabled us to comprehend the mechanisms affecting gender-oriented DDR policies by demonstrating the implications of adopting one prevailing approach. The results indicate that incorporating a more bottom-up approach to DDR negotiation processes can make dysfunctionalities in the programs less likely as the political agency of women in post-conflict is taken into account. Therefore, the insights of this thesis should help delegations within the UN as well as civil society actors develop more functional gender-oriented policies.

6. References

- Adcock, R., & Collier, D. (2001). Measurement Validity: A Shared Standard for Qualitative and Quantitative Research. *The American Political Science Review*, 95(3), 529-546.
- Annan, J., Blattman, C., Mazurana, D., & Carlson, K. (2011). Civil War, Reintegration, and Gender in Northern Uganda. *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 55(6), 877–908.
- Arnett, J. (2015). *Emerging adulthood: The winding road from the late teens through the twenties* (2nd ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Arthy, S. (2003). Ex Combatant Reintegration: Key Issues for Policy Makers and Practitioners, Based on Lessons from Sierra Leone. London: DfID, unprocessed draft.
- Autesserre, S. (2010). *The Trouble with the Congo: Local Violence and the Failure of International Peacebuilding*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Ayoob, M. (2002). Inequality and Theorizing International Relations: The Case for Subaltern Realism. *International Studies Review*, 4(3), 27-48.
- Ball, N., & Van De Goor, L. (2006). *Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration: Mapping Issues, Dilemmas and Guiding Principles*. The Hague: Netherlands Institute of International Relations, Clingendael.
- Balzacq, T. (2011). A Theory of Securitization: Origins, Core Assumptions, and Variants, in Thierry Balzacq (ed.) *Securitization Theory: How Security Problems Emerge and Dissolve*. London: Routledge.
- Balzacq, T., Léonard, S., & Ruzicka, J. (2016). ‘Securitization’ revisited: theory and cases. *International Relations*, 30(4), 494–531.
- Barma, N. (2016). *The Peacebuilding Puzzle: Political Order in Post-Conflict States*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Barnett, M. (2006). *Eyewitness to a genocide: The United Nations and Rwanda*. New York: Cornell University Press.
- Barth, E. (2002). Peace as Disappointment: The Reintegration of Female Soldiers in Post-Conflict Societies. *A Comparative Study from Africa*. Oslo: PRIO.
- Beach, D., & Pedersen, R. (2013). *Process-Tracing Methods: Foundations and Guidelines*. Michigan: University of Michigan Press.
- Bellamy, A. & Williams, P. (2004). Introduction: Thinking Anew about Peace Operations. *International Peacekeeping*, 11(1), 1-15.
- Berdal, M. (1996). *Disarmament and demobilization after civil wars: arms, soldiers, and the termination of conflict*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Beverley, J. (1998). Theses on subalternity, representation, and politics. *Postcolonial Studies: Culture, Politics, Economy*, 1(3).
- Blanche, M., Durkheim, T., & Painter, D. (2006). *Research in practice: Applied methods for the social sciences*. Juta and company.
- Bouta, T. (2005). Gender and Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration. *Conflict Research Unit, Netherlands Institute of International Relations 'Clingendael'*.
- Brett, R., & Specht, I. (2004). *Young Soldiers: Why They Choose To Fight*. Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers.
- Brosche, J. & Rothbart, D. (2013). Violent Conflict and Peacebuilding: The Continuing Crisis in Darfur. *African Studies Quarterly*, 14(3), 122-198.
- Buzan, B., Wæver, O. & De Wilde, J. (2003). *Regions and Power: The Structure of International Security*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Buzan, B., Wæver, O. & De Wilde, J. (1998). *Security: A New Framework for Analysis*.

Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers.

Chandler, D. (1992). *A history of Cambodia*. Oxford: Westview Press.

Chatterjee, P. (2012). After Subaltern Studies. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 47(35), 44-49.

Clingendael. (2017). The state and the future of conflict. Retrieved from https://www.clingendael.org/sites/default/files/201710/The_State_and_The_Future_of_Conflict.pdf.

Coletta, N. & Muggah, R. (2009). Context matters: interim stabilization and second generation approaches to security promotion. *Conflict, Security & Development* 9(4), 425–453.

Collier, D. & Elman, C. (2008). *Qualitative and Multi-Method Research: Organizations, Publication, and Reflections on Integration*. Oxford Handbook of Political Methodology.

Collier, P., Elliot, V., Hegre, H., Hoeffler, A., Querol, M., & Sambanis. (2003). *Breaking the Conflict Trap: Civil War and Development Policy*. A World Bank policy research report. Washington, DC: World Bank and Oxford University Press.

Coulter, C., Persson, M., & Utas, M. (2008). *Young female fighters in African wars: Conflict and its consequences (Policy dialogue no. 3)*. Stockholm: The Nordic Africa Institute.

Crasnow, S. (2012). The Role of Case Study Research in Political Science: Evidence for Causal Claims. *Philosophy of Science* 79(5), 655-666.

Della Porta D., & Keating M. (2008). *Comparative analysis: case-oriented versus variable-oriented research, Approaches and Methodologies in the Social Sciences: A Pluralist Perspective*. Cambridge University Press.

De Vries, H. & Wiegink, N. (2011). Breaking up and Going Home? Contesting Two Assumptions in the Demobilization and Reintegration of Former Combatants. *International*

Peacekeeping 18(1), 38–51.

- Eimer, T. R. (2020). What if the subaltern speaks? *Traditional knowledge policies in Brazil and India, Third World Quarterly*, 41(1), 96-112.
- Eroukmanhoff, C. (2017). Securitization theory. In S. McGlinchey (Ed.), *International Relations Theory*, 1-161. Retrieved from <https://www.e-ir.info/pdf/72393>.
- Fortna, V. (2004). Does Peacekeeping Keep Peace? International Intervention and the Duration of Peace after Civil War. *International Studies Quarterly*, 48(2), 269-292.
- Gbowee, L. (2015). “*The Voice of South Sudan’s Women Must Be Heard to Give Peace a Chance.*” Guardian, February 23. <http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2015/feb/23/south-sudan-women-peace-talks-leymah-gbowee>.
- George, A., and Bennett, A. (2005). *Case studies and theory development in the social sciences*. Mit Press.
- George, N., & Shepherd, L. (2016). Women, Peace and Security: Exploring the implementation and integration of UNSCR 1325. *International Political Science Review*, 37(3), 297–306.
- Gerring, J. (2007). *Case study research: principles and practices*. Cambridge University Press.
- Ginty, R., & Richmond, O. P. (2013). The Local Turn in Peace Building: a critical agenda for peace. *Third World Quarterly*, 34(5), 763-783.
- Gizelis, T. (2011). A Country of their Own. *Conflict Management and Peace Science* 28(2), pp. 522-542.
- Grant, R., & Keohane, R. (2005). Accountability and Abuses of Power in World Politics. *American Political Science Review*, 99(1), 29-43.

- Halperin, S., & Heath, O. (2012). *Political Research: Methods and practical skills*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Hauge, W. (2020). Gender Dimensions of DDR – beyond victimization and dehumanization: tracking the thematic. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 22(2), pp. 206-226.
- Heyzer, N. (2000). ‘*Stronger decision-making role for women in peace processes*’, UN Doc. SC/6937.
- Hudson, N. (2009). Securitizing Women's Rights and Gender Equality. *Journal of Human Rights*, 8(1), 53-70.
- Hunt, S. (2012). “*Peace Activist Mossarat Qadeem Enlists Mothers to Fight Terrorism in Pakistan.*” Daily Beast, May 27. <http://www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2012/05/27/peace-activist-mossarat-qadeem-enlists-mothers-to-fight-terrorism-in-pakistan.html>.
- Jacques, K., & Taylor, P. (2009). Female terrorism: a review. *Terrorism and Political Violence*, 21(3), 499-515.
- Jann, W. & Wegrich, K. (2007). Theories of the policy cycle. *Handbook of public policy analysis: Theory, politics and methods*, 43-62.
- Jensen, S. & Steputat, F. (2001). *Demobilizing Armed Civilians*. Copenhagen: Center for Development Research. Available at: http://www.dcism.dk/graphics/_Staff/fst/demobilizing%20armed%20civilians.pdf
- Kaldor, M. (1999). *New and Old Wars: Organized Violence in a Global Era*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Kingma, K. (1999). Post-war Demobilization, Reintegration and Peace-building. *Conference paper presented at the international conference and expert-group meeting at the Bonn International Center for Conversion*.

- Knight, M., & Özerdem, A. (2004). Guns, Camps and Cash: Disarmament, Demobilization and Reinsertion of Former Combatants in Transitions from War to Peace. *Journal of Peace Research*, 41(4), 499-516.
- Krasner, S. (2004). Sharing Sovereignty: New Institutions for Collapsed and Failing States. *International Security* 29(2), 85-120.
- Lahoud, N. (2020). What Fueled the Far-Reaching Impact of the Windhoek Declaration and Namibia Plan of Action as a Milestone for Gender Mainstreaming in UN Peace Support Operations and Where Is Implementation 20 Years Later? *Journal of International Peacekeeping*, 1-52.
- Lederer, E. (2000, 24 October). Women's groups urge equal role for women in peace negotiations. *Associated Press International*. Retrieved from <https://advance.lexis-com.ru.idm.oclc.org/api/document?collection=news&id=urn:contentItem:41H1-FCJ0-00BT-M53W-00000-00&context=1516831>.
- MacKenzie, M. (2009). "Securitization and Desecuritization: Female Soldiers and the Reconstruction of Women in Post-Conflict Sierra Leone." *Security Studies* 18(2), 241– 61.
- Mahoney, J. (2008). Toward a Unified Theory of Causality. *Comparative Political Studies*, 41(4–5), 412–436.
- [Maintain International Peace and Security]. (n.d.). Retrieved 2020, April 2, from <https://www.un.org/en/sections/what-we-do/maintain-international-peace-and-security/index.html>.
- Marhaban, S. (2012). "The Reintegration of Ex-Combatants in Post-War Aceh: Remaining Challenges to a Gender-Blind Planning and Implementation Process." *Post-War Security Transitions: Participatory Peacebuilding After Asymmetric Conflicts*, edited by Veronique Dudouet, Hans Giessmann, and Karin Planta, 192– 207. London and New York: Routledge.

- Mazurana, D., & Cole, L. (2013). "Women, Girls, and Disarmament, Demobilization, and Reintegration (DDR)." *Women and Wars*, 194– 214. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Meertens, D., & Zambrano, M. (2010). "Citizenship Deferred: The Politics of Victimhood, Land Restitution and Gender Justice in the Colombian Post (?) Conflict." *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 4(2), pp. 189–206.
- Melander, E., Pettersson, T., & Themnér, L. (2016). Organized violence: 1989-2015. *Journal of Peace Research*, 53(5), 727-742.
- Muggah, R. (2009). *Security and Post-Conflict Reconstruction. Dealing with fighters in the aftermath of war*. New York: Routledge.
- [NGO Working Group on Women, Peace and Security]. (2000). "Arria Formula and Other UN Proceedings". Retrieved 2020, July 2nd from <https://www.globalpolicy.org/security-council/ngos-and-the-council/arria-formula-and-other-un-proceedings.html>.
- Odell, J. (2001). Case Study Methods in International Political Economy. *International Studies Perspectives*, 2. University of Southern California. 161-176.
- Parsons, B. A. (2007). The state of methods and tools for social systems change. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 39, 405–409.
- Peirce, C. (1955). *Philosophical Writings of Peirce*. New York: Dover Publications.
- Prasch, A. (2015). Maternal Bodies in Militant Protest: Leymah Gbowee and the Rhetorical Agency of African Motherhood. *Women's Studies in Communication*, 38(2), 187-205.
- Presswire. (2000, October 25). *UN Security Council set to discuss situation and role of women in peacemaking and peace-building operations*, Retrieved from <https://advance.lexis->

com.ru.idm.oclc.org/api/document?collection=news&id=urn:contentItem:41H2-
DTT0-003Y-R2BV-00000-00&context=1516831.

Pugh, M. (2004). Peacekeeping and Critical Theory. *International Peacekeeping*, 11(1), 39 – 58.

Quinn J., Mason, T., & Gurses, M. (2007). Sustaining the Peace: Determinants of Civil War Recurrence. *International Interactions*, 33(2), 167-193.

Rufer, R. (2005). *Disarmament, Demobilisation and Reintegration (DDR): Conceptual Approaches, Specific Settings, Practical Experiences*. Geneva: Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces.

Sandole, J., & Staroste, I. (2015). Making the Case for Systematic, Gender-Based Analysis in Sustainable Peace Building. *Conflict Resolution Quarterly*, 33(2).

Schellenberg, J. A. (1996). *Conflict Resolution: Theory, Research, and Practice*. SUNY Press.

Shepherd, L. (2008). Power and Authority in the Production of United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325. *International Studies Quarterly*, 52(2), 383-404.

Special. (2020). In *Oxford Online Dictionary*. Retrieved from <https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/special>.

Spivak, G. (1988). Can the Subaltern Speak? In P. Williams and L. Chrisman (Ed.), *Colonial Discourse and Post-Colonial Theory*. New York: Columbia University Press, 66-111.

Taylor, S. (2011). Violent Democracies in Latin America. Edited by Enrique Desmond Arias and Daniel M. Goldstein. *Perspectives on Politics*, 9(4), 892-893.

[United Nations]. (2000). ‘Report of the secretary general: *The role of United Nations*

peacekeeping in disarmament, demobilization, and reintegration,''UN Doc. /2000/101.

[United Nations Department of Peacekeeping Operations]. (1999). *Lessons Learned Unit Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration of Ex-Combatants in a Peacekeeping Environment. Principles and Guidelines.* New York.

[United Nations Development Fund for Women]. (2004). *Women, Peace and Security: UNIFEM Supporting Implementation of Security Council Resolution 1325.*

[United Nations Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration Resource Centre]. (2006). Accessed on April 19th, 2020 at https://www.unddr.org/what-is-ddr/introduction_1.aspx.

[United Nations General Assembly]. (2000). ''*Windhoek Declaration and Namibia Plan of Action*'' , UN Doc. A/55/138-S/2000/693.

[United Nations General Assembly]. (2005). *Secretary-General, note to the General Assembly,* UN Doc. A/C.5/59/31.

[United Nations Press Statement]. (2000). ''*Peace inextricably linked with equality between women and men.*'' UN Doc. SC/6816.

[United Nations Security Council]. (2000). ''*Resolution 1325,*'' UN Doc. S/RES/1325.

[United Nations Security Council.] (2000a/b/c). ''*Women and Peace and Security,*'' UN Doc. S/PV.4208.

[United Nations Security Council]. (2014). ''*Report of the Secretary-General: Women and Peace and Security,*'' UN Doc. S/2014/693.

[United Nations Security Council]. (2019). ''*Report of the Secretary General on Women, Peace and Security,*'' UN Doc. S/20/2019/800.

[United Nations Women]. (1995). *Beijing Declaration and Platform of Action, adopted at the Fourth World Conference on Women*.

[United Nations Women]. (2015). Preventing Conflict Transforming Justice Securing the Peace: A Global Study on the Implementation of United Nations Security Council resolution 1325.

Wæver, O. (1995). Securitization and Desecuritization. In Ronnie D. Lipschutz (Ed.), *On Security*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Walter, B. F. (2002). *Committing to Peace: The Successful Settlement of Civil Wars*. Princeton University Press.

[What is DDR]. (n.d.). Retrieved 2020, April 10, from https://www.unddr.org/what-is-ddr/introduction_1.aspx.

Xinhua News Agency. (2000, October 24). U.N. Security Council to Debate Linkage Between Women's Equality, World Peace. Retrieved from <https://advance-lexiscom.ru.idm.oclc.org/api/document?collection=news&id=urn:contentItem:41H1-CJD0-00RC-91SM-00000-00&context=1516831>.