

A Conflict in Song: Whig and Jacobite Ballad
Culture in Eighteenth Century Scotland

Tim Elfring

S4192761

Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen

ENGELSE TAAL EN CULTUUR

Teacher who will receive this document: Marguerite Corporaal

Title of document: A Conflict in Song: Whig and Jacobite Ballad Culture in
Eighteenth Century Scotland

Name of course: BA Thesis

Date of submission: 15-6-2017

The work submitted here is the sole responsibility of the undersigned, who has
neither committed plagiarism nor colluded in its production.

Signed

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Tim Elfring', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Name of student: Tim Elfring

Student number: s4192761

Abstract

The purpose of this BA thesis is to look at Scottish Whig ballads from eighteenth century Scotland and compare them with more famous Jacobite ballads. A number of both Whig and Jacobite ballads were categorised and analysed, and then put into context using a Marxist critical theoretical framework, particularly based on the ideas of Lenin and Sidney Finkelstein. The results suggest that the Whig ballads copy the traits of the Jacobite ballads, react to them as a potential rebellious danger, and attempt to bring them down using styles and features from their own ballads.

Keywords: Whig, Jacobite, Marxist criticism, ballad

Table of Contents

Introduction	p. 5
Chapter One: Jacobites as Outlaws to the Whigs	p. 7
Chapter Two: Marxist Criticism and Marxism in Music	p. 11
Chapter Three: Jacobite Ballads and their Calls from Nostalgia	p. 15
Chapter Four: Whig Ballads and their Satirical Camouflage	p. 20
Conclusion	p. 25
Bibliography	p. 28

Introduction

Ralph Knight's introduction to the *Songs of Two Rebellions* album by Ewan MacColl remembers the Jacobites. It speaks of the two major Jacobite risings, known by Snyder as "the Fifteen and the Forty-Five", and glorifies the two. This introduction speaks of the two risings as a peak of nationality and spirit and portrays key figures in these risings as true heroes and masters of war and rebellion, like Lord George Murray, who is an "excellent strategist" (2). This all about the actual risings is one thing, but this introduction goes one step further when it mentions the ballads. Knight goes so far in his glorifying that he argues that even though the Jacobites never won the rebellions, they managed to win it in a broader historical sense: the Jacobite cause still lives in these songs and will be remembered as gloriously as they are sung about. This is all we have as these ballads are the only thing that is remembered of this time: "nothing remains of it except the songs." (2). According to this introduction, the Jacobite ballads are not only a document of heroic rebellion, but the cause of the Jacobite spirit is still alive today because these ballads have survived. This seems to be the image that survives today: a heroic group of rebels that partook in the most glorious battles.

These claims contain a lot of propositions that can be questioned and investigated. First of all, it suggests that these songs contain the spirit of a group of people in a nation throughout a long period of conflict: they are representative for a large group of rebels. Secondly, these rebels are supposed to be one of the most glorious and righteous group of people that have existed in a long time. The main problem that introductions like these pose is that they only present just one side of a conflict. The one central question that I would like to add to these claims revolves around the notion that the Jacobite must have had opponents. A rebel could not revolt against something that simply is not there. Who were the Jacobites revolting against, and how does that struggle surface in the ballad culture that seems to revolve around these Jacobites?

The Jacobite ballads had a practical function at the time, but they also still provide a great deal of knowledge about the Jacobites today. Ralph Knight writes, for example, that the Jacobite wars, as small as they can seem in comparison to the larger genocides and wars, are still a very important part of world history and he laments that "nothing remains of it except the songs." (Quoted in Knight, 2). In other words: these songs are the only primary gateway into this particular point in history. People like Dixon even argue that these songs not only portray a sense of Scottish identity of the time, but also helped shape this identity for the future. The Jacobites used the music, especially the ballads, to shape a nostalgic and strongly anti-English Scotland (110). The Jacobite songs, and thus the Jacobites themselves, are

remembered by what they sang about. These songs have also been discussed by critics and scholars alike. They are a cultural phenomenon.

The main thing that this thesis is interested in is the fact that there is also a “less-discussed Whig song” (Harol, 584) in this equation. When diving into this field of research, small batches of Whig songs started to surface through the cracks of all of the Jacobite ballads. James Hogg’s *Jacobite Reliques*, for example, contains an appendix that features Whig songs. It is all the way at the back and just featured as an appendix, but they are there. These ballads must also contain a sound and a message about this period of conflict. The Jacobites had opponents and were the opponents to someone else. These two parties that seem to be on opposite sides here are Jacobites and Whigs. This is not only a historical issue, but apparently this issue also surfaced in the form of ballads. This other side of these ballads have not been given the attention that the Jacobite ballads have received, and this thesis will aim to give those Whig ballads an equal amount of attention.

My research question is as follows: how do Whig ballads relate to Jacobite ballads, and how is conflict between parties represented in these two types of ballads? This thesis will provide some historical context for the time in which these ballads were written, as well as a Marxist critical theoretical framework. The choice for Marxist criticism was especially made because of a certain Marxist theorist called Sidney Finkelstein, who is a music theorist primarily. His theories will prove to be of relevance to this thesis. Both the context and the theoretical framework will then be put to practice when both Jacobite and Whig ballads will be analysed. The goal here is to get a picture of two parties in conflict with one another that is represented and buried in these ballads.

Chapter One: Jacobites as Outlaws to the Whigs

This chapter will try to place the heroism of the Jacobites and their ballads in a societal and historical context. It will attempt to provide a framework that will later be used when reading and analysing Jacobite and Whig ballads.

A key term that keeps arising in this particular field of study is “ballad culture”. This chapter will try to paint a picture of what the ballad landscape looked like in the eighteenth century in Scotland, as well as identifying some key concepts that lie at the heart of both Jacobite and Whig ballads in this same period.

The Concise Cambridge History of English Literature gives this definition of “The Ballad”, and I would like to use it as a starting point for further discussion about ballad culture in eighteenth-century Scotland:

“(1) It is a narrative poem without any discernible indication of personal authorship; (2) it is strong, bare, objective and free from general sentiments or reflections; (3) it was meant originally for singing, and, as its name implies, was connected at some time with dancing; (4) it has been submitted to a process of oral tradition among unsophisticated people fairly homogenous in life, habit, and outlook, and below the level at which conscious literary art appears.” (Quoted in Steward, 134).

We see that the ballad was an art form that depended on anonymity and was free from fixed media: oral tradition kept it alive. The ballad was alive, but it needed not be set in writing. This is something that will be kept in mind in future discussion.

The Scottish run with ballads started taking shape in Scotland around 1688, when King James VII was dethroned and replaced. A select group of people were not in full agreement with this change and remained loyal to King James. They were called the Jacobites. “The Jacobites were not inclined to suffer defeat passively”, as Dixon put it (2), and their dissatisfaction and unrest led to two important moments of rebellion and violence known as the Jacobite Risings. These major risings are known as the Fifteen and the Forty-Five, and were unfortunately unsuccessful. An article by Franklyn Bliss Snyder says that the risings in 1715 were “feeble and unfortunate attempts to restore James Stuart to the throne.” (268). The Forty-Five, however, was larger and much more impressive, but also ultimately led to a defeat. Snyder notes that the help of James Stuart’s son, Charles, had a very positive impact on this rising. He says the following about Charles: “throughout his stay in Great Britain his personal popularity did far more to make the Forty-five, for a time at least, a formidable rebellion, than any claim his father may have had to the English throne.” (273). Dixon confirms that this rising was a military success, also partly because of Charles’ influence, but

that the ultimate defeat largely eclipses this success.

The Jacobites used media to propagate and maintain their ideas, and one of those was song: Jacobite ballads began to surface, and these lyrics represented sentiments felt by these Jacobites. It is what Corrinne Harol refers to as “ballad culture” (581). Ballad culture refers to the songs that were written during that time, about the things that were going on in Scotland. The two risings in particular caused a great deal of ballads to be written. Harol mentions, for example, that the period around 1714-16, the first Jacobite Rising, was a true “ballad epidemic” (588), and Dixon also notes that the period between 1745 and 1751 gave a large quantity of similar ballads (12).

As Dixon mentions, the songs themselves move with the way this period of conflict progresses. The first ballads started out as hopeful and rebellious, focusing on war, but as the conflict moved and the risings kept being unsuccessful, the ballads became more and more melancholic (110). Dixon mentions the following: “Over time, the Jacobite ballads shifted their focus, style, and approach, eventually coming to represent the idea of Scotland.” (110-11). This is an interesting question in itself, but this thesis will aim for a more comparative research.

The Jacobites were not without opposition: the Whigs were their enemies, as they tend to write in their own ballads. The Jacobites were altogether seen as a threat to the new government. Paul S. Fritz wrote an article that perhaps gives us the most extreme look at what was thought of Jacobites between the two risings. He talks about the Jacobites as a very serious threat to the Whig institutes and talks about how the new government used measures like postal control and espionage to maintain a sense of control and reduce the threat level. According to Fritz, the Jacobites had a very real chance to overthrow the new government, and they had to be contained and kept in check. If we look at the Jacobites through this perspective, we do not see a glorious group of a nation that has been done wrong, but rather a collective of outlaws who were a threat to an ordered and calm society. Another article talks about one thing in particular that is relevant, and that is the article by Margaret Steele about anti-Jacobite pamphleteering. She talks about Walter Herreis and William Selton, two Jacobite pamphleteers, who could face imprisonment for spreading Jacobite ideas publicly (140). Jacobitism was alive, as we see it survive today, but according to these articles, there seemed to have been a large amount of control from above that the Jacobites had to hide for. What this means is that Jacobitism lived, but apparently not in plain sight.

The status quo for Jacobites appeared to be one of hiding from authorities: they seemed to have been outlaws and perceived by some to be a threat to the new government.

This is an important framework for the contemporary perception of ballad culture. Harol talks about this in her article, and it rings true in the previous context: “Because fervent Jacobite political rhetoric was libellous and could not officially be printed in England, Jacobite ballads were more difficult and dangerous to print, to sell and to circulate.” (582). The same governmental surveillance seemed to have been hovering over the Jacobite ballads: they could not be spread publicly and thus lived under the radar. Harol talks about solutions that the Jacobites had for this situation, and that is either high secrecy regarding print and spread, a heavy coding of the lyrics, or both. There was also always a sense of ‘buyer beware’, according to Harol (582). This context makes the anonymity of the ballads also more understandable: high risk could have meant a lesser likelihood for an author to put his name on a rebellious piece. It also lines up with the definition of the ballad that has been given earlier: Jacobite material seemed to have existed underneath the layer where more conscious forms of literature appears. Oral tradition is also mentioned, both by Harol and by Steward, which is something that the existence and survival of the Jacobite ballads also seemed to have relied on.

There are multiple opinions about how these ballads serve, reflect, or even aided in the development of the Jacobite cause. James Hogg, bundler of over a hundred different songs from this period of time into the *Jacobite Reliques* in 1818, describes these songs in his introduction, stating that “They actually form a delightful though rude epitome of the history of our country during a period highly eventful, when every internal movement was decisive toward the establishment of the rights and liberties which we have since enjoyed.” (Hogg, 7). He means that these songs can be seen as a document of what the general zeitgeist was at that time. Some scholars, however, go even further in this argument and argue that these songs not only reflect the time and spirit, but also helped in shaping this. For example, Harol mentions that ballads “were a dominant form of Jacobite literary production, a key place where the ‘Jacobite’ was produced.” (583). It is argued that the cause was not only preserved in ballad culture, but also constructed. The creation of ballads about the sentiments reinforced the sentiments themselves and fired them back into the hearts of the people. Dixon has also argued that the ballads not only reflected, but produced the Jacobite cause (5-6).

The production of what it means to be a Jacobite seems arguably contained in these ballads, but in light of what we have seen so far about the Jacobites, Dixon makes a very interesting point. “The balladeers made careful use of language and music to promote this sentimental nostalgia for a Scotland which had never really existed, but which came to represent the nation nonetheless.” (111). The Jacobites seemed to have believed in a myth that

they created themselves: the ideal of Scotland that is represented in the ballads was is an overstated ideal. Nevertheless, as the introduction to this thesis also suggests, the Jacobites promoted this image passionately. This overstated and idealistic reality will come back in following chapters, and is something to be aware of when reading the Jacobite ballads.

According to Harol, and to many others in this field of research, the Whig party knew about the Jacobite ballad culture and the lively spirit contained in them, which comes as no surprise if we look at the surveillance that was apparently going on at the time. Harol mentions something interesting: instead of trying to control, contain, or even eradicate the Jacobite ballads, the Whigs gave their counter with ballads of their own. These ballads were made to satirise the image that the Jacobites made for themselves. The following statement from Harol can be seen as proof of how successful the Whigs were in recreating the vocabulary of the Jacobite ballads: “So skilful were the Whigs at ventriloquising the Jacobite that the most important collector of loyalist song, James Hogg, was deceived in at least one case, the song he uses to conclude his volume of Jacobite song being, in fact, a Whig satire of Jacobite song.” (587). What seemed to be the case was that this passionate Jacobite song that is remembered to this day by so many was also met with another voice.

The way in which this ventriloquism took place is something that will be looked at in chapter four, but now this thesis shall continue with a Marxist critical theoretical framework. The ideas that will be brought to the table in the following chapter will add to the research in the chapters after that.

Chapter Two: Marxist Criticism and Marxism in Music

The Jacobite wars, as we have seen in the previous chapter, can largely be seen as a struggle between the oppressing class of the Whigs and the rebelling class of the Jacobites. The Jacobites seem to take the role of the oppressed class that revolts against the newly established dominant government, and the Whigs seem to have that role of the oppressing government. The theoretical framework that will be used here to look at ballad culture is Marxist criticism, for what seems to be at play here is a party struggle. Although the Jacobite ballad culture far preceded Marxist criticism, it still lends itself to Marxist theory. The theory can be used as a theoretical framework to look at ballad culture and to attempt to show the underlying social and political struggles. Key points in Marxist criticism will be looked at first, and some selected Marxist pieces of theory that are especially useful will be looked at after that. Reading of ballads in relation to this theory, and also the history from the previous chapter, will then commence in the following chapter.

As a small reference, Peter Barry's overview of Marxist critics' practices will be used for this paragraph (161), as well as George Steiner's chapter on Marxist criticism from his work *Language and Silence*. First of all, Marxist criticism seeks to uncover a covert meaning in a text that relates to the societal context of that text. A text can contain hints to social struggles, struggles of classes, or otherwise societal problems or phenomena that were at play. In case of the Jacobite ballads, the most obvious social struggle that could be related to them is the one between the Jacobites and the Whigs. Marxist criticism also attempts to relate both genre and form back to their social context: a rise of a certain literary form is related to a rise of people using this format, and this emergence can then be traced back to a social struggle or movement. Lastly, this theory seeks to include the author into the equation: an author's social class and background shines through in the work. As for the Jacobites in this case: Jacobite ballads are largely anonymous and written not from an author's perspective but a general, collective perspective. A summary of all of these points is given in Steiner's chapter, when he mentions the following: "beneath the complex structure of the lyric impulse lie specific historical and social foundations." (322). Steiner sums up that a work of art is rooted in its spatio-temporal context, and that it carries that context with it.

More theories about art's relation to society surface when Marxist criticism in literature is looked at in more detail. This next piece of theory, for example, relates back to the paragraph about the circulation of Jacobite ballads from the previous chapter. It comes from Terry Eagleton, and he relates the tangible presence of literature, in physical, printed form, to Marxist theory.

“...art is first of all a social practice rather than an object to be academically dissected. We may see literature as a text, but we may also see it as a social activity, a form of social and economic production which exists alongside, and interrelates with, other such forms.” (60).

Eagleton discusses not only literature and text itself as being part of a social construct, but also the physical, tangible production of literature as part of a socio-politically moving society. We have seen in the previous chapter that the Jacobite ballads circulated in secrecy: they were hard to come by and were largely anonymous. The Whig ballads, on the other hand, were printed and distributed overtly. They were part of a social and economic printing circuit, and thus integrated into Scottish society. The physical presence of these ballads can also be seen as a representation of the social struggle between Jacobites and Whigs. This is a smaller part of Marxism that relates to this thesis, but it does serve as a small confirmation that this theoretical framework is useful in this field of research.

Now this thesis shall move on to one specific theorist in Marxism who came up with ideas that can really support and aid this thesis. One passage in Steiner’s *Language and Silence* is especially interesting for analyzing Jacobite ballad culture, and opened up a very useful wall of theory for this thesis. Steiner talks about Sidney Finkelstein, who brings a piece of Marxist theory to the table about music and older folk traditions, both of which lie at the heart of Jacobite ballad culture. Finkelstein argues that the musical form is a societal product and that its power lies within the ease with which it can be used to communicate ideas (quoted in Steiner, 315). Music is looked at through this theory and seen as a societal product that conveys ideas and thoughts. Finkelstein also has affinity with the older folk format and tradition. According to Maynard Solomon, Finkelstein had the idea that all art “finds its nourishment and regenerative power in folk art” (276). When I looked into Finkelstein's work in more detail, I found the phrase “Art serves social needs” (quoted in Solomon, 277), in his essay called *Art as Humanization*. This phrase seems quintessential for linking Marxist criticism to research on Jacobite ballad culture.

Finkelstein's essay further explores these Marxist ideas about art. He mentions, for example, that one of the basic principles and functions of art the laborious act of “changing the world to fit to human needs” (quoted in Solomon, 278). This understanding that comes from Marxist criticism may be applicable in the context of Jacobite balladry. As for balladry specifically, Dixon mentions the same power of the song in a society: “affective and useful as both political propaganda and the expression of popular sentiment, the ballad was an extraordinarily powerful tool in the hands of skillful craftsmen.” (4). Finkelstein's notions

seem to fall in line with this particular field of scholarly research: the ballads were able to aid in the process of reshaping the physical world. They were an incentive for the hearts of humans.

George Steiner's *Language and Silence*'s chapter also provides a quintessential piece of theory that lies at the heart of Leninist Marxist criticism. It comes from a letter written by Lenin himself where he opens up about his views on literature in relation to class and the state:

“Literature must become a part of the general cause of the proletariat, "a small cog and a small screw" in the social-democratic mechanism, one and indivisible—a mechanism set in motion by the entire conscious vanguard of the whole working class. Literature must become an integral part of the organised, methodical, and unified labours of the social-democratic Party.” (Quoted in Steiner, 306).

Lenin also uses the phrase “Party literature” (Quoted in Steiner, 306) in relation to this theory. Peter Barry also discusses this theory and sums up that Lenin argues that literature should be used to support and be committed to a political cause (153). These ideas correlate with what we have seen in the paragraph about Whig ballads in the previous chapter. Harol argued that those ballads were part of a “Whig strategy”, and that Whig ballads “often have an explicitly political or didactic function” (583). The Whigs ballads were written with a political cause and goal in mind: to propagate their ideas and to keep their own authority intact. They were overtly displayed as opposed to the Jacobite ballads that lived underground, and served a political and social purpose in this struggle between parties. The Whig ballads might, in light of this theory, be perceived as party literature.

The last thing that I would like to point out is a detail in Steiner's chapter on Marxist criticism. He notices that Leninist views and other Marxist views are in sharp contrast with one another at times. He notices Lukàcs observation that Engelsian ideals about how an author has no implied intention in the work clash with Leninist desires for an author to serve a political party and purpose with his work (306-307). Leninist criticism seems to be of an extreme variety and is often in opposition with other forms of Marxist criticism. Steiner confirms it later in his own words when he notices that there is a contrast between Leninism's “militant partiality” (307) and other general forms of Marxism (307). Finkelstein's ideas are also placed along the lines of these more general Marxist ideas in Steiner's chapter.

Marxist criticism places a work in its social context: in terms of content, genre, and form. This may be fitting for the Jacobite and Whig ballads as a principle, but Marxist music theorist Sidney Finkelstein has more to offer when it comes to this field of research. He

considers a song to be of great importance in conveying ideas and believes that art has its roots in the folk tradition. Moreover, he argues that art is a document of humans trying to shape the world to their needs, and he makes this case strongest for music as he is a music theorist. Dixon's notion that the Jacobite ballads helped shape a Scottish identity can be understood differently in light of this theory: Marxist criticism argues that texts and literary works covertly contain struggles of classes and parties, and Marxist critic Sidney Finkelstein argues that songs are a product of its society and that they are a powerful tool for shaping and spreading ideas in the minds of audiences. We will use this framework of thinking when looking at both the Jacobite and Whig songs in more detail in the following chapters. Hopefully it will become clear what these ballads contain in terms of social context and ideas.

Chapter Three: Jacobite Ballads and their Calls from Nostalgia

This chapter will consist of the examination of Jacobite ballads and linking them to Marxist critical ideas, specifically those of Sidney Finkelstein, in order to paint a fuller picture of Jacobite sentiment.

Finding a useful and trustworthy source of Jacobite ballads that is both complete and largely untainted was a difficult task. As Jacobite ballads were not overtly displayed and available in the eighteenth century, full collections of them only appeared a century later. Some of these also get edited and revised after years or even centuries. James Hogg's *Jacobite Reliques*, for example, came in 1818, and seems to be the first collection of its kind. Hogg's *Jacobite Reliques* seemed to be a sufficient work to take the songs from at first, but the preface to a different Jacobite ballad collection, the *Jacobite Songs and Ballads of Scotland*, points out that Hogg had inserted his own writings into his work, labeled as old and authentic. The song "Donald MacGillavry", for example, was written by Hogg under his alias 'the Ettrick Shepherd', was added to the *Jacobite Reliques*, and was labeled by Hogg himself as "one of the best songs that was ever made" (5-7). This story was also confirmed in an anonymous blog post, the title of which actually sparked an interest for the topic of this thesis (reasonable conversation). Hogg's collection is therefore not completely reliable or trustworthy and I have dismissed it for that reason. Instead I have opted for *Jacobite Songs and Ballads of Scotland* edited by Charles MacKay: it features notes, both historical and explanatory, and it also features a cohesive introduction to the topic.

The Jacobite wars was a long period of conflict and many songs have been written throughout this period. The style of them generally changes with the events that were taking place, and to analyse works in relation to every single event in this period is an arduous task. The collections of Jacobite ballads are also large and plentiful: analysing all of them is also an arduous task, and just picking and choosing some of them at random will not really suffice for a detailed picture of Jacobite ballads. Instead, I would like to use the work of Megyn Dixon to select different songs for close reading in order to attempt to avoid missing out on certain important aspects of the ballad culture. Dixon's work provides a number of characteristics that often show up in Jacobite ballads, and that list seems comprehensive and useful. The ballads will be given a Marxist critical reading, with a focus on Finkelstein's ideas.

The first idea that Dixon raises attention to is something she calls the "Highland shift". She mentions that the Jacobites favoured and identified with the image of a Highlander, not as the caveman that the English propagated it to be, but as a virtuous national hero (9). This use and representation of an iconic Highland hero is something I would like to give further

examination.

The second category Dixon mentions is one of anti-Whiggery and xenophobia. Some of the Jacobite ballads are rather explicit in their hatred against their Whig opponents, and some go very far in insulting and eschewing everything Whig. Dixon also mentions that the same resistance was sung against everything English, and that this sentiment could also be summed up as xenophobic in general (34).

Dixon mentions the use of both religious symbols and historical and mythological symbols, and that these aid in obtaining a nostalgic, nationalist image in the songs (73). These two characteristics have in common that they are references to higher powers: something supernatural to aid in the human state of affairs.

This would leave us with three categories: Highland pride, hatred and xenophobia, and symbols of myth and religion to propel nationalism and nostalgia. I shall attempt to incorporate all of these features when selecting songs for close reading in this chapter. I will take one song that prominently features each of these categories, but most of them will display more characteristics as well.

The first song that I would like to raise attention to is *My Love he was a Higland Lad*. This song is a love song about a man who is described as a brave, good-hearted man. According to the introduction given in *Jacobite Songs and Ballads of Scotland* by Charles MacKay, this song mixes love and politics in order to create more interest in the latter (MacKay, 26). The song falls into the first category that I mentioned as the title and the opening lines immediately shoot for Highland pride. The reference to the Highlands makes the character described more heroic and appealing.

The song quickly takes on a political twist when the third stanza comes along. The lyrical focus turns to the king, or “the good king” (quoted in MacKay, 27), who was pushed from the throne. The rest of the song keeps this focus on the nation and the politics, and talks especially about the man from the first two stanzas in relation to the nation. “My love he stood for his true king / Till standing it could do nae mair” (quoted in MacKay, 27). The Highland hero is portrayed as loyal to the good and true king, and is given no further voice or personality. The last stanza does not even mention the Highland character, but is a hopeful message about the possible regrowth and expansion of Scotland.

This song introduces an exemplary Highland character: one that could be seen as a perfect and ideal Scotsman. That character is then silenced and presented as a loyal follower of the now-usurped true king. The fourth stanza is very explicit in just how loyal this character should be:

“But I wad rather see him roam
 An outcast on a foreign strand,
 And wi' his master beg his bread,
 Nae mair to see his native land,
 Than bow a hair o' his brave head
 To base usurper's tyrannye” (quoted in MacKay, 27)

The ideal Scotsman is presented as one who would never surrender to the new leaders and who would rather suffer. It is also interesting that this song is written from the perspective of the character's lover, who might even be a woman according to the introduction (MacKay, 26).

This is the central idea that the song puts forward: an ideal Scotsman is a Highland man who keeps his pride and would never surrender. The added perspective of a lover aids in the process of this idea as it may imply that there is a reward of love from a woman if one conforms to this idealistic image. The last stanzas focus on the possible flourishing of Scotland as a nation, which could be seen as the end goal of Scottish men conforming to the ideal.

This song seems to contain a number of ways in which it tries to describe and evoke change in the world. First and foremost, the song addresses that Scotland's monarchy has been overthrown and is now occupied by a different monarch who is compared to a tyrant. Secondly, it might be said that this song attempts to shape the hearts of men in Scotland. The poem uses love to invite the reader to become more like the ideal image of a Highland hero and to keep resisting the new monarchy. It is not a very direct proposition of reshaping the nation, but it does convey that longing sentiment for it.

Britons who dare Claim is the second song that I would like to discuss. The tone of this poem can be seen as xenophobic and dissatisfied with the fate of Scotland. It features many dissatisfactions with all sorts of groups and classes.

This song mentions the English claim to Scotland in the title (in MacKay, 148), but it also mentions a distaste for Whig intruders, as well as a reference to Dutch rulers (MacKay, 149). This latter reference may well be to Dutch-born William of Orange who came into the royal house after James Stuart was dethroned.

“Foreigners rule the land” (quoted in MacKay, 148) might be the line to sum up this song's sentiment most efficiently. There is a strong distaste for anything that is not Scottish. Whigs, The Dutch, and the English all go under the moniker of foreigners in that line. It might be implied here that it really does not matter who those foreigners are: they will be frowned

upon as long as they are not natives of Scotland. There is also a strong emphasis on the homeland in this song in the form of “church, king, and laws” (quoted in MacKay, 149), as well as an emphasis on the true kingship of King James (in MacKay, 149). All of these things can be read as xenophobic: anything that is not Scottish should remain outside of Scotland, and the only true ruler that should be in Scotland is the original King James.

What lies at the heart of this song is truly a struggle of two parties. One party has taken over where the other one was, and the expelled party shows its grief and frustration with the new situation. One group of humans have been shaping the world to fit their needs at the cost of another group of humans. This is something that Finkelstein may have noticed about this song. The duped group, the Jacobites, lashes out at their oppressor, and instills a sense of separation. They want to make clear that they are not English, not Dutch, not Whig: only Scottish. This song captures a change and a frustrated call to reshape the world after it has been shaped by an invader.

The song *Now Charles asserts his Father's Right* is a song that features religious symbols, and comes a little later in the Jacobite wars, and it has a different tone entirely. According to the introduction given in *Jacobite Songs and Ballads of Scotland*, this song was written after the battle of Prestonpans (MacKay, 174), which was one of the first instances of conflict in the second Jacobite rising, also known as the forty-five. This song makes use of references to God, as well as references to Charles, the son of James Stuart, who was talked about previously.

We had seen previously that the second Jacobite rising was more successful, though ultimately unsuccessful, than the first one, partly due to Charles' presence. This song was written early on and seems to reflect the optimism that the Jacobites had in finally restoring Scotland as an independent nation. Lines such as “The Scots regain their ancient fame, And well their faith and valour show” (quoted in MacKay, 175) present us with a self-confidence and trust in the war that we have not seen previously.

Religion is present in this song as a vehicle for that confidence. The God of battle is mentioned, as well as a divine will for the Jacobites (in MacKay, 175). The ultimate goal here is to restore Scotland as it once was: a vision of the past restored. Jacobite nostalgia is combined with confidence and optimism, and this song may suggest that it is the will of higher powers that the nostalgic vision becomes reality once more. The introduction to this song suggests that this song is a document of the beginning of the second Jacobite rising and that the supporters of the armies display a large amount of trust in them.

Finkelstein's ideas may be very applicable here: this song is an optimistic shout for

change and a confidence that it may very well be possible. Even the Gods themselves seem to be on the side of the Jacobites in this song. The Jacobites hope to change their world, albeit back to a nostalgic vision of the past. The human needs that Finkelstein mentions can be seen here as the will to drive the oppressive government out of Scotland and to claim the land for the people that feel like they should rightfully own it.

These songs seem to have certain things in common. For one, they are all concerned with the change in monarchy. For the most part, this change is met with remorse and frustration, with the exception of *Now Charles asserts his Father's Right*, which conveys newly found courage and optimism right before a battle. This difference is negated in the sense that this new situation is always met with a will to resist it and a cry to change it back to the way it was, which is the second thing that seems to overarch these songs. Nationalism and nostalgia are two key terms here. There seems to be a sense of longing for a restoration of the monarchy to the way it was in the past. It could be through a call to divine intervention or a call to adhere to an ideal of a Highland hero: the methods are different but the end goal is the same. Lastly, these songs seem to convey a sense of resistance and opposition. The newly founded monarchy in Scotland is not met with enthusiasm, and is continually resisted. There is also a detachment from it, to the point where the Scottish seem to detach themselves from everything that is not Scottish, like in the song *Britons who Dare Claim*.

Finkelstein's notion of art being an account of people shaping the world to fit their needs is very much applicable in the context of these songs. They form a Marxist epitome of ideas about dissatisfaction and call out to restore the ancient ways of a nation. The social needs that Finkelstein mentions are apparent here: there is a social need to restore the monarchy of Scotland as it once was.

Chapter Four: Whig Ballads and their Satirical Camouflage

We have seen in the first chapter that the Jacobites may have been seen as outlaws and that their ballads lived underground, far from public publishing and availability. The Whig surveillance hovered over them, and they were careful not to let their ballads and ideas live out in the open. The first chapter also mentions the existence of Whig ballads that were made to counter the Jacobite ones, as well as James Hogg including some of those in his collection *Jacobite Reliques*. This chapter will aim at the examination of the form and content of these ballads from a Leninist Marxist critical point of view. It will also build largely from Corrinne Harol's ideas and observations, as she has provided an in-depth look at the characteristics and functions of Whig ballads.

Whig songs are not as extensively researched as Jacobite songs, so their collections are also not as plentiful. Harol has provided the names of four of them and I ended up using one of those, namely *A Collection of State Songs*. I also used James Hogg's *Jacobite Reliques* to find Whig ballads. Hogg's trustworthiness had been put into question because of his inclusion of Whig ballads in his collection of Jacobite songs, but I deemed his appendix of Whig songs to be quite useful for this chapter. Whig songs are what this chapter calls for, after all.

Corrinne Harol mentions in her article that Whig ballads existed and that they had “an explicitly political or didactic function.” (583). The Whigs were aware of the power of the Jacobite songs: something that Pittock calls the “Jacobite code” (quoted in Harol, 583). She also mentions that these ballads were so cleverly put together according to the popular ballad format that the Jacobites employed that even people like James Hogg sometimes confused Whig songs for Jacobite ones (587). It seems that the ballad of the Whigs was so carefully constructed to mimic the Jacobite format that even avid collectors and literary figures could be deceived by their appearance. This will be the main focus of this chapter: how Whig ballads mimic and employ the Jacobite characteristics of a ballad, especially the ones that were determined in the previous chapter.

The first observation that became clear was that a number of these Whig ballads are set to the tune of another already existing ballad. One of the very first ballads that is presented in the Hanoverian collection *A Collection of State Songs*, for example, is called *To the Tune of, the King shall enjoy his own again. Since Hanover is come. The King shall enjoy his own again* was a ballad that was written slightly before the Jacobite wars began, but was later adapted by the Jacobites as it was so fitting in the ballad tradition. Another ballad later in *A Collection of State Songs* is also set to this same old tune. It confirms a part of the Whig tradition that Harol talks about in her article: the Whigs have used the format of Jacobite

ballads and tunes and rework them to convey their own sentiments (587). She did not mention that old tunes were literally used and adapted, but it does line up with her observation. The format of the Jacobite ballad is copied here, and the lyrics have been reworked entirely. One of the stanzas of *Since Hanover is Come* is provided here for a closer reading.

“But let them have their Song,
It can’t be very long
E’er the Name will be lost in the Nation;
For they have nothing but a Tune
To support the 10th of *June*,
And the Hopes of Restoration.” (“State Songs”, 4)

This stanza is especially interesting to look at. It seems that both the Jacobites and their ballad culture are directly mocked by this song. The stanza before this one talks about the possible return of “their King” (“State Songs”, 3), which could be an allusion to King James, who was talked about in the songs from the previous chapter as the one true king. This stanza may suggest that although the Jacobites are optimistic and hopeful in the restoration of the monarchy in Scotland as it once was, all they do is sing about it. The Jacobites are being accused of not taking any real action to realise what they want. They are portrayed as a hopeless group of rebels who will inevitably see their own demise. This image may be seen as very satirical. This Whig song actually claims that it is alright to let the Jacobites sing away (“State Songs”, 4). The song is not going to harm anyone and will not make any difference in the real world.

This image correlates with what Harol notices about the Jacobites. She argues that they are portrayed in their passivity, and even defined as such: “Whig ballads define the Jacobite as both passive and in the past.” (585). That passivity certainly surfaces in this song: the Jacobites are portrayed as a group that does nothing except for singing about a false hope that they have. This clashes with what Dixon has said about the Jacobites: they resisted oppression and were not inclined to just suffer defeat in such a passive way (2). To see the Jacobites portrayed as passive rebels who only sing about what they would like to do instead of taking up arms and actually doing contrasts sharply with the popular image that the Jacobites made for themselves and that survives to this day.

The second song that I would like to talk about is *Haste Over, Hanover, as Fast as you can Over*. This song is also set to a popular tune called *Lillibulero* but is not a parody of a Jacobite song. Instead this song seems to be a warning against a possible danger. The chorus to this song is quite telling for its own sentiment:

“Over, over, Hanover, over.

Haste, and assist our queen and our state ;

Haste over, Hanover, fast as you can over.

And put in your claim before 'tis too late.” (quoted in Hogg, 371).

This song seems to refer to the house of Hanover, which was the house that king George was related to. This song talks about a possible threat to the monarchy in Scotland and calls the Hanoverian house to send their assistance so that this threat may be averted. The song mentions King James in the third stanza (Hogg, 370), which makes the threat that this song discusses a little bit more explicit: it may be said that the song warns for a possible Jacobite uprising.

This song is not subtle in its subject matter, but is subtle, again, in taking from the Jacobite format. The previous chapter talks about how the Jacobite songs call for a change in monarchy after another force has laid its claim on it. This other party is met with xenophobia and distrust. This Whig song also instills a sense of distance between the Hanoverian house and the evil, ever lurking Jacobites, and calls out to avert the danger and stop a change from happening. It may be said that the voice of this song is also given some distance from one particular group: it is sung from almost a neutral voice that is not part of any party whatsoever. But this voice does have a side that it takes, namely the Hanoverian side. Xenophobic distance and a call for action are both present in this song, but the side from which the voice comes is different.

The other thing that this song seems to copy and reverse is the heroism of the great Jacobite leaders and armies. We saw the greatness of Jacobite armies portrayed in *Now Charles asserts his Father's Right*, and that same greatness is now used here. However, the Hanoverian house is given this greatness, and not the Jacobites. Hanover is portrayed as a mythical savior that will make everything right again upon arrival.

The song that ironically will be discussed lastly is called *The First Psalm*. The title of this song was striking as it has a religious connotation. Religious and ancient mythical symbolism are things that the Jacobites employed in their song, so it is striking to see such a thing also surface in a Whig song. The tone of this song is set immediately in the first stanza:

The man is blest that hath not lent

To French pistols his ear,

Nor rais'd himself as traitors do,

Nor sat in trickster's chair” (quoted in Hogg, 396)

This song seems to combine a number of elements that we have seen in the previous

chapter on the Jacobite songs. First of all, this song is written like a psalm. The word of God is implied and it is used to describe what a man should do to be blessed by Him. The song goes on with metaphoric descriptions of what would make a man great. The metaphor of a resilient tree in a storm is used primarily. These descriptions amount to these lines, as a conclusion: “Therefore shall not the Jacobites / In judgment stand upright” (quoted in Hogg, 396). This is where the song gets to its point: the word of God is used to tell Jacobites that He is not on their side, and that they shall not win in this conflict. The last stanza mentions the Hanover house as an extra argument for the eventual demise of the Jacobites (Hogg, 397), which only adds to this heavy claim.

God is used by the Jacobites as a way to add optimism and confidence to the Jacobite cause. This trust in God is mechanically turned around in this song: it is written like an ancient psalm and slowly gets explicit in saying what God’s will is supposed to be. The song seems to make use of comparable religious symbols, but the goal for this song is to undermine the Jacobite cause, and especially their confidence in gaining something in this conflict.

If we look at the political function of these ballads, we notice that all of them revolve around mocking and undermining the Jacobites, as well as giving warnings about their presence. The ways in which this is achieved vary: Jacobite songs are rewritten in such a way that the Jacobite cause and their way of acting is satirized and belittled, the Jacobite songs’ format is used to copy their xenophobia and create a warning against them, and religious symbols are used as an argument that God is not on the Jacobite side in order to undermine their confidence. One of the keywords in this argument is reaction: the Whig ballads react to the Jacobite format and subvert it to fire back at them. It is a very precise form of constructing ballads, but effective nonetheless.

Lenin’s essay on Party literature provides tools to work with when looking at this side of the Jacobite wars. Lenin has argued for the fact that all literature in a nation “must become Party literature.” (quoted in Solomon, 180). His main argument is that literature is conceived within a society, and must therefore be integrated into that society. He talks about how all writing must be inserted into society like a cogwheel that helps society advance (quoted in Solomon, 180), and how writings like those in newspapers should for example become part of the Party goal and be placed under party control (quoted in Solomon, 180-181). George Steiner calls these Leninist notions “militant partiality” (307). If we translate this sentiment to what we have seen in this chapter, it may be said that the Whig ballads are aware and mechanical in recreating Jacobite characteristics and using it for their own ideas. The main goal seems to be to push the Jacobite cause down and away. It can be through satire, through

warnings and self-propaganda, or even through a reversal of Jacobite symbolism, but the end goal seems to be the same for all of the songs that we have seen in this chapter.

If we take Harol's observations about Whig balladry into account, it may become clear that Whig ballads were part of the party's goals and ideas. They were mechanically integrated to support the party and were published into society with a specific goal in mind. These ballads may very well be seen as an example something that Lenin had in mind when he talks about literature: the format and goal of these ballads seems to be wholly in support of a party, or even more so against the opposing party. We may conclude that the Whig ballads had a party-oriented goal that is in line with Leninist Marxist literary criticism.

A last piece to the argument needs to be presented before moving on to the conclusion of this thesis. The distinction between Finkelstein's ideas on the one hand and Lenin's ideas on the other lies in the action against the reaction. The Jacobite ballads were the action: they came from a place of social dissatisfaction and called out to reshape the world back to a nostalgic past. The Whig ballads, on the other hand, reacted to these statements, and broke them down much more mechanically. The argument here is that Jacobite ballads came from the minds of people who were unhappy with the world, and that Whig ballads came from a collective mind of a party who simply wanted to protect themselves against a threat. This is the argument for why Finkelstein's notions are a better fit for the Jacobite ballads, and that the Leninist arguments are better suited for the Whig ballads. This thesis argues that the dichotomy between these ballads revolves around action versus reaction, passion versus militant precision, form versus satire, and Finkelstein versus Lenin. The clashes between both the ballads and the theories are placed in line with one another here.

Conclusion

The Jacobites were seen as the outlaws during the time of the wars. Their ideas circulated in printed form but lived under the radar, and a surfacing of these ideas could supposedly lead to death penalties. However, their ballads do not feature the same level of carefulness: they are very passionate in their calls to restoring the monarchy back to the way it used to be in the past. They employ a variety of different stylistic symbols to instill these sentiments into their ballads, like the ideal image of a Highland hero, a strong sense of xenophobia and distinction between Scotland and the rest of the world, as well as religious and mythical symbols to claim that divine intervention will help the Jacobites on their way to victory.

These calls and claims were mechanically met and reversed by the Whigs on the other side of the argument. The Whig ballads use the same tunes and structures with rewritten lyrics to satirise the Jacobites in order to belittle them and their cause. They also feature more plain warnings against the possible threat of the Jacobites and calls to the Hanoverian house to ensure that the threat does not get out of hands. The last thing that was present in Whig ballads is that they also use religious symbols, but to their own advantage. They subvert the claim that the Jacobites have a God on their side, as God is actually on the Whig side.

What we see is that the Jacobite ballads call for action and revolution, whereas the Whig ballads react to this statement by pushing Jacobite sentiments down and away, using their own formats and symbols in the process. The oppositional parties do not only fight in the real world, but also in song. The advance is made by the Jacobites, and the counterattack seems to come from the Whigs. The Jacobites trying to push forward and the Whigs pushing them back with their own weapons can be seen as a Marxist struggle of two classes.

Finkelstein argues that art, and specifically song, is an epitome of humans shaping the world to their needs. What we see here is two groups of humans who have very much conflicting ideas about the world and they both try to get their world to what they want. The Jacobites have the most passionate calls for change that comes from a place of nostalgia. The Whigs have what they want, and try to keep it that way by subverting their one and only threat to the loss of this situation.

The Jacobite ballads seem to fall in line with Marxist ideas, specifically those of Sidney Finkelstein. These ballads may be seen as an account of wanting and trying to change the world back to the way it used to be. The confidence in *Now Charles asserts his Father's Right* is especially telling of this theory: the Jacobites have faith that God will aid them in their quest for the restoration of the Monarchy.

The Whig songs are very much mechanical in the copying of Jacobite formats and

sentiments in order to use them against the Jacobites. Lenin has argued for a full partiality in literature, and this may very well be the case here. The Whig party, specifically the Hanoverian house, is supported in the ballads, and the Jacobites are pushed down and away. All of this is done to keep the Whigs in office: the only goals of Whig songs is ensuring that the Whigs maintain their position and making sure that the only real threat to that loses its confidence.

It is striking that George Steiner noted the contrast between Marxist criticism on the one hand and Leninist calls for full partiality on the other. It may be argued that this contrast is also reflected in these ballad wars. Leninist extreme and mechanical partiality is on the Whig side, whereas Finkelstein's passionate documents for the change instilled upon the world are presented on the Jacobite side.

The Jacobite ballads have been collected and researched by many people, but the Whig ballads have been given less attention in the past, as Harol has pointed out. Harol argues that the Jacobite identity is mutually constructed by both the Jacobite ballads and the Whig ballads, as they both rely on the same principles in their songs. While this is true, this thesis argues more in favour of a reflection of a conflict in these ballads rather than a mutual shaping into a similar direction. It defines Jacobite and Whig ballads more in terms of action and reaction against each other.

Finkelstein's Marxist ideas have added greatly to this research. Not only is he a music theorist who favours the format of the popular ballad, he is also a Marxist critic who understands the social implications and dynamics of literature. I have not seen his ideas in the context of Jacobite research, but the connection between his ideas and the Jacobite ballads seems like a perfect fit. Likewise, the contrast with Leninist ideas that seem to follow the Whig ballads is strikingly in line with the conflict that the ballads themselves represent.

My research question was stated as follows: how do Whig ballads relate to Jacobite ballads, and how is conflict between parties represented in these two types of ballads? A definite answer to this question is that Whig ballads reacted to Jacobite ballads by copying their formats and symbols, and attempted to push back that potential wave of rebelliousness that the Jacobites sing about themselves. The conflict between the two parties surfaces in the form of these ballads, and takes place in the form of action from the Jacobites and reaction from the Whigs. Theories by Sidney Finkelstein and Lenin aid in support of this claim.

What this research hopes to achieve is a more fair look at Whig ballads in comparison to Jacobite ballads. The Jacobite ballads have been given plenty of attention by researchers and collectors alike, but the Whig ballads much less so. This thesis wanted to give more

attention to the Whig ballads: they were hidden in appendices and did not have the same popularity among researchers as Jacobite ballads did. To see how these ballads influenced each other and reacted to each other, both just as ballads and in their social context, is exactly what this research tried to achieve.

Further research into these topics could feature much larger corpus analysis of large collections of ballads in the context of Marxist theories. The scope of this thesis does not allow for research that is that substantial and I have attempted to explain my compromises in my research by looking for specific features in songs based on earlier research. This was also done to enable close reading of specific ballads, so that slightly deeper discussion can still take place. Many projects, like Dixon's, only mentions song names and briefly goes into their content, which is something this thesis set out to avoid. Unfortunately there are still more songs and more facets to this argument that are left unexplored, but that could still be done by examining and categorising more ballads from more collections.

Bibliography

- A Collection of State Songs*. London, 1716. Web. 15 June 2017.
- Barry, Peter. *Beginning Theory*. 1995. Manchester UP, 2009. Print.
- Dixon, Megyn. *National Song: Scottish Jacobite Ballads and the Shaping of Scottish National Identity*. Indiana U Pennsylvania, 2007. Knowledge Repository UP. Web. 9 Feb. 2017.
- “Donald MacGillavry, The Genius Hoax.” *Reasonable Conversation*. Reasonable Conversation, 9 Aug. 2012. Web. 9 Feb. 2017.
- Eagleton, Terry. *Marxism and Literary Criticism*. Methuen & Co LTD, 1976. Web. 14 June 2017.
- Harol, Corrinne. “Whig Ballads and the Past Passive Jacobites.” *Journal for Eighteenth Century Studies* 35.4 (2012). Web. 15 June 2017.
- Finkelstein, Sidney. “Art as Humanizer.” *Marxism and Art: Essays Classic and Contemporary*, edited by Maynard Solomon, Wayne State UP, 1979, pp. 277-280. Web. 15 June 2017.
- Friz, Paul S. “The Anti-Jacobite Intelligence System of the English Ministers, 1715-1745.” *The Historical Journal* 16.2 (1973), pp. 265-289. Web. 15 June 2017.
- Hogg, James. *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland*. Edinburgh, 1817. Archive.org. Web. 9 Feb. 2017.
- MacColl, Ewan. *Songs of Two Rebellions*. Folkways Records, 1981. Web. 14 June 2017.
- MacKay, Charles, editor. *Jacobite Songs and Ballads of Scotland*. Glasgow UP, 1861. Web. 15 June 2017.
- Snyder, Franklyn Bliss. “Stuart and Jacobite Lyrics.” *The Journal of English and Germanic Philology* 13.2 (1914): 259-280. University of Illinois Press. Web. 1 Mar. 2017.
- Steele, Margaret. “Anti-Jacobite Pamphleteering, 1701-1720.” *The Scottish Historical Review* 60.170 (1981): 140-155. Edinburgh UP. Web. 22 Feb. 2017.
- Steiner, George. *Language and Silence*. Atheneum, 1986. Web. 14 June 2017.