Bachelor Thesis

Framing of Syrian immigrants before and after the Paris attacks

Roos Janssen, S4641930
Prof. Dr. Wilbert Spooren and Afrooz Rafiee

Words: 4.830

Abstract. *Frames on minorities is a widely discussed subject. Articles on refugees use more human interest frames whereas the frames on Muslims seem to change before and after key events. This research analysed a 63 article corpus from the Dutch newspapers the NRC and the Telegraaf before and after the Paris attacks. The aim was to find how Syrian refugees were framed before and after the attacks. The articles only mentioned the word Muslim or Islam in 4.7% of the articles (a). The Telegraaf reported more national news (b) and the human interest frame was, surprisingly, used more by the NRC (c). The responsibility frame increased in both newspapers after the attack (d). Lastly, Syrian immigrants were not linked to Islam (e). Most of the unexpected results seem to be due to the specific subject (refugees) and the difference in treatment of national and abroad news between the two newspapers.*

1. Introduction

In 2015 the biggest refugee population was Syrian mid 2015 estimations stated that there were 4.2 million refugees. The increase of asylum applications in the Netherlands grew immensely since 2014. (Centaal bureau voor de statistiek, [CBS], 2016; World data bank, 2016). The number of Syrian asylum applications in the Netherlands in 2014 (11.595) was at first comparable to the amount of Yugoslavian immigrants in 1994 (13.440) (CBS, 2016). The amount of Yugoslavian asylum seekers was easily doubled in 2015 with an amount of 27.710 Syrian refugees in the Netherlands (CBS, 2016). The OESD speaks of the biggest refugee crisis in Europe since the Second World War.

Due to this unforeseeable large group of people seeking refuge, the Dutch government finds themselves having problems to establish correct procedures and policies to deal with the high numbers of asylum seekers. This already resulted in media attention mid-1990 when the asylum seekers were mainly Yugoslavian (1993 to 1996).

The notable shift in media attention in this particular period of time resulted in several studies on framing (Yugoslavian) asylum seekers (D'Haenens & De Lange, 2001; Vliegenthart & Boomgaarden, 2007). Before going into further detail on minority frames it is vital to know what framing is first.

Framing

The exact definition of a frame has been a widely discussed topic. There has been a lot of criticism on how to measure framing and there seems to be inconsistency in

documenting it (Vliegenthart & van Zoonen, 2011; De Vreese, 2005; Entman, 1993). A well defined interpretation of framing for this research is made by Entman: 'To frame is to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation and/or treatment recommendation' (Entman, 1993, p. 52). This, however, does not clarify how a frame arises. De Vreese (2005) classified the process of framing into frame building and frame setting. Frame building, showing how a frame is established, is a process of constant interaction between journalists and elites. Frame setting refers to the interaction of the individual receiving the frame and the media, also know as frame locations.

Identifying a frame can be done through four different functions, and four different locations (Entman, 1993). The four functions consist out of the problem, cause, judgement and the remedy. The four locations are split up in the communicator, text, receiver and the culture. These methods make it surprisingly easier to identify and understand a frame.

The five vital pre-identified frames for this research are the responsibility frame, the human-interest frame, the conflict frame, the morality frame and the economic consequences frame (Neuman, Just & Crigler, 1992) *The responsibility* frame presents text in such a way that groups, people or governments are held responsible for the problem in question. The *human interest frame* shows the issue of a more emotional angle by personalizing it. *The conflict frame* seeks to show a conflict between two or more parties. The *morality frame* puts the issue in a moral or religious context. Finally, the *economic consequences frame* focuses on the economic impact of an issue. Semetko and Valkenburg (2000) have made the frames more tangible by setting up a list of 20 questions that can identify each frame. An example question for the human-interest frame is: "Does the story provide a human example or 'human face' on the issue?".

These frames can be found in news papers, television and other media. Frames do not differ much per medium (television or news articles) but whether the news outlet is serious or sensationalist. The serious news outlet mostly used the *responsibility* and *conflict frame* where the sensationalist news outlet mostly used the *human-interest frame* (Semetko & Valkenburg, 2000). Semetko and Valkenburg (2000) studied the Dutch national newspapers with the highest readership rates. The most sensationalist news paper was the Telegraaf and the most serious newspaper was the NRC.

Framing minorities

The five vital frames discussed earlier were also used to find framing on (Yugoslavian) immigrants in in regional newspaper articles. The local news articles were categorized by the period of time the asylum seekers centres were being opened in a particular region. The *human-interest frame* was strongest evident in all articles. Strikingly, the *human interest frame* was not always in favour of the minority group, in this case mostly Yugoslavian immigrants. Some news articles expressed negative emotions by reporting on resistance from the local population against the immigrant minority. The morality frame was not detected in any of the local newspapers and the other frames were identified but not profoundly (D'Haenens & De Lange, 2001). The corpus of D' Haenens and De Lange (2001) dated from 1993 to 1996, which overlapped with the Yugoslavian immigration peak in 1994. This could lead to the question: will the same identification of frames also apply to national news articles on the current Syrian immigration peak?

What the Yugoslavian asylum seekers have in common with the Syrians is that they were victim of a war in their own country and that they fled in great numbers (CBS, 2016). However, the Netherlands was somewhat involved in the Yugoslavian war in the 90's as the Bosnian-Serbs managed to occupy Srebrenica despite the presence of Dutch UN soldiers, as also stated by Vliegenthart and Boomgaarden (2007). Additionally, the use of media and frames could have changed between 1994 and 2015. Last, and most certainly not least, there was no specific religious matter attached to Yugoslavian asylum seekers, as they were a mix of more religions. Syrians are mainly Muslims (80%). The only Yugoslavian refugees known to be Muslim were Bosnian (40% of refugees); only 40% of the Bosnians are actually Muslim (CBS, 2016; The world fact book, 2016). Assumedly, only 16% of the mainstream immigrant was Muslim in the period D'Haenens and De Lange (2001) gathered their corpus. These factors could all influence the frame set upon the asylum seekers. Framing Muslims is a widely discussed subject that seems vital when studying the frame on the Syrian immigrants.

Research shows that Islam is framed differently in national news than it is in international/abroad news. One of the main findings is Islam within the Netherlands is not framed in a negative manner. Islam is nationally mostly associated with religion and politics. Per contra, Islam in abroad news is mainly linked to terrorism, politics and crime (D' Haenens & Bink, 2006). When looking at news articles on Islam in totality it is

mainly linked to terrorism (20%), Politics (16%) and, crime and violence (16%). The link to religion is only made in 20% of the articles (D'Haenens & Bink, 2006). Why would a religion be linked to negative subthemes so often? It stands to reason that negative news is known to be more newsworthy. Additionally, the corpus of the study dates from the same period as two mayor religious attacks in the western society took place: 9/11 and the murder on Theo van Gogh. Both attacks have been characterized as Islamic terrorism. These key events could influence framing Muslims in abroad news.

Key events

Study shows that key events, like terrorist attacks, influence framing of minorities in Dutch national newspapers. Vliegenthart and Boomgaarden (2007) researched how key events influenced the prominence of themes such as immigration and minorities. Three types of key events can be distinguished: institutional events, unpredicted events and deliberate events. The first category *institutional events* includes election campaigns and outcomes. Secondly, *unpredicted events* encompass key events like occupation of Srebrenica and the terrorist attack in the United States known as 9/11. Lastly the category *deliberate events* cover key events like a speech given by Pim Fortuyn, criticizing Islamic culture. *Deliberate events* hold the most permanent prominence in Dutch news. The *unpredicted* and *institutional events* show a more temporary trend the news prominence lasts for two months on average (Vliegenthart & Boomgaarden, 2007).

Notable examples of *unpredicted events* characterized as Islamic terrorism in the western civilization are: 9/11, the Theo van Gogh murder and the Paris attacks. The 9/11 attacks were prominent in the news for three months; thereafter news coverage inclined (Vliegenthart & Boomgaarden, 2007). The news prominence does not indicate how the five frames vital for the current study were used when framing Islam or the Muslim minorities. A research on the murder of Theo van Gogh, an *unpredicted event* in the Netherlands, showed that the *economic consequences frame* declined and use of *the morality*, and *responsibility frame* increased in Islam related articles after the attack (D'Haenens & Bink, 2006). D'Haenens and Bink (2006) did not explore if these frames are also used in articles on Muslim minorities rather than Islam related articles as a whole.

A more recent attack by an Islamic terrorist group was the Paris attack on November 13th, 2015. Some news articles have claimed that one of the terrorists was a

Syrian refugee. Because the Paris attacks are more recent, no studies were found that researched framing on these specific attacks. The aim of this study is to research frames used in articles on Syrian immigrants before and after the Paris attacks.

Research questions and hypotheses

The main research question for this research will be the following:

> *"How are Syrian immigrants framed in the NRC and the Telegraaf before and after the Paris attack?"*

Due to previous research one could expect three findings regarding the use of frames on Syrian refugees before and after the Paris attack.

Firstly, the prominence and the use of *the responsibility and the morality frame* in Islam related news articles will increase after the Paris attacks. This leads to the first hypothesis.

> H1. The use of the responsibility frame and the morality frame will increase after the attack.

Secondly, it is to be expected that a *human interest frame* will be used when reporting on high numbers of immigrants. This leads to the second hypothesis.

> H2. The human interest frame will be used most in all analysed articles.

Third and lastly, one could expect that the use of *the responsibility, conflict* and *the human interest frame* differs when analysing a sensationalist newspaper or a serious newspaper. This leads to the third hypothesis.

> H3. The NRC will use more responsibility and conflict frames while the Telegraaf will use more human interest frames.

However, it remains unknown if Syrian immigrants are linked to Islam or criminality. This leads to the sub question 1 and 2.

> SQ1. In how many news articles about Syrian immigrants is Islam mentioned?
>
> SQ2. In how many news articles about Syrian immigrants is terrorism, crime or violence mentioned?

Previous research also indicates that abroad or national news can influence the frames used. This leads us to sub question 3.

> SQ3. How does abroad or national news influence the frames used on Syrian immigrants?

2. Methods

Materials

This study was based on a corpus of news articles on Syrian immigrants dating from September 1 2015 to January 31 2016. The source for these articles were two newspapers: the NRC and the Telegraaf. The news articles were retrieved by googling a keyword in combination with the name of the newspaper (e.g. Syrian immigrants NRC). The Telegraaf has a sensationalist character and the NRC has a serious and sober character. A comparison was made before (*N*=32) and after (*N*=31) the Paris attacks the two newspapers. This resulted in a corpus consisting out of 63 news articles in a period of 4 months around the Paris attack.

Procedure

The articles have been selected through a stratified procedure. All news articles were about Syrian refugees or the current refugee crisis collected by keywords: *refugee crisis, Syrian, Syrian refugees, refugees, immigration or Syria*. The *Syrian* or *Syria* related keywords appeared in 91% of the NRC articles and in 46% of the Telegraaf articles. Over the total amount of articles 97% contained refugee related words. The articles had a maximum of 800 words. Feature articles, editorials, columns and opinion pieces were not included. The articles were first divided into three conditions (1) sensationalist or serious newspapers, (2) the period before or after the attack and (3) abroad, national or other news. The news articles were randomly picked after clustering them in conditions 1, 2 and 3.

A question sheet created by Semetko and Valkenburg (2000), aimed at identifying five frames, was used to answer the sub-questions and test all 3 hypotheses. A series of 20 yes or no questions were counted, reporting which frames were or were not used. The complete list of questions can be found in appendix 1.

The first and second sub-question focus on the relation to Islam and the relation to negative subthemes. The relation to Islam was measured through keywords: 'Islam' and 'Muslim'. The relation to negative subthemes was measured by answering the yes/no question: *Does this article include any form of crime, violence or terrorism?* With an additional yes/no question to verify if the act of crime has been executed by the minority group: *Was the crime executed by refugees?*

Method of analyses

An example of a small text in which a frame has been confirmed has been given below. Responsibility frame:

Q1. Does the story suggest that some level of government has the ability to alleviate the problem? Q3. Does the story suggest solution(s) to the problem/issue? *"The German minister of home affairs, Thomas de Mazière, recently announced that the identity and motives for asylum will be screened more thoroughly to prevent exploitation of this situation".* (NRC by Mathieu Peulen, 2015, September 25, my translation).

Human interest frame:

Q7. Does the story employ adjectives or personal vignettes that generate feelings of outrage, empathy-caring, sympathy or compassion? *"I met a Syrian refugee who said: 'You are all afraid and have a frightful look in your eyes when you see us coming per boat. But crossing the sea is the fun part. Life in Syria is horrible'."* (NRC by Bastiaan Nagtegaal, 2016, January 28, my translation).

Conflict frame:

Q11. Does the story reflect disagreement between parties-individuals-groups-countries? *"The plan evoked a storm of criticism within and outside of Denmark. The shocked international media wrote: it is just like the Nazi's who took jewellery and gold from the Jews. Also the UNHCR, the fugitive department of the United Nations, criticized the government. It turns out that Swiss refugees are used to little else. Their money can easily be taken already."* (NRC by Maral Noshad Sharifi, January 18, 2016, my translation).

Morality frame:

Q17. Does the story offer specific social prescriptions about how to behave? *"Nevertheless, the link between this attack and the outflow of refugees should not be made directly, said Pieter Beverlander, professor international migration and ethnic relations at the institute for migrationstudies in Malmö."* (NRC by Floor Boon, October 21, 2015, my translation).

Economic frame:

Q19. Is there a mention of the costs/degree of expense involved? *"For the emergency aid to 1,5 million Syrian refugees in Lebanon, Jordan and Iraq, 350 million euro has been set aside. This is what the European Commission stated Tuesday."* (Telegraaf, December 1, 2015, my translation).

Crime: Does this article include any form of crime, violence or terrorism?

"Children fleeing to Europe by themselves get raped or forced into labour during their journey." (NRC by Maral Noshad Sharifi, November 6, 2015, my translation)

Crime by minority: Was the crime executed by refugees?

"The majority of these threats lead back to individuals and organisations where the current asylum seekers come from." (Telegraaf, October 12, 2015, my translation).

Statistical treatment

A Chi-square test has been used to search for the correlations between the dependent variables (frames used) and independent variables (NRC/Telegraaf, before/after attack and abroad/national article). A T-test has been used to test correlation between newspapers and the amount of words. The interrater reliability was tested through Cohen's Kappa for nominal results. The coding procedure has been done by two coders namely, the writer of this research and N. Babayigit who is a student in the same field of study. The second coder analysed 20% overlapping articles with the aim to ensure objective analyses. A total of 12 articles from the sample from each newspaper and timing (NRC before/after & Telegraaf before/after) were analysed. Thereafter she was instructed to answer all questions by looking at the actual words and sentences without looking at an underlying message. The results and differences of a first trial article were discussed after which the rest of the articles were coded by the second coder. The format can be found in appendix 2. The interrater reliability was satisfactory for the *human interest frame* ($\kappa = .75$, $p < .007$) and the *conflict frame* ($\kappa = .667$, $p < .014$), the *morality frame* ($\kappa = 1.00$, $p < .001$) and the *economic frame* ($\kappa = 1.00$, $p < .001$) were good. The *attribution of responsibility* showed a small coding difference and scored a little below satisfying interrater reliability ($\kappa = .67$, $p < .014$).

3. Results

There were a total of four significant findings in this study. The first two findings concerned the before mentioned hypotheses and will be explained below. The final two findings were not expected and will be mentioned at the end of the results section.

Table 1. Differences in frames per time frame (before or after the attack)

	Before		After		P
	Yes (std. res.)	No (std. res.)	Yes (std. res.)	No (std. res.)	(*Fisher 2-tailed*)
Responsibility frame	15 (1.1)	17 (-0.8)	7 (-1.2)	24 (0.9)	**.04**
Human interest frame	11 (-0.3)	21 (0.3)	13 (0.3)	18 (-0.3)	.54
Conflict frame	2 (-1.0)	30 (0.4)	6 (1.0)	25 (-0.4)	.12 *(.15)*
Morality frame	2 (0.4)	30 (-0.1)	1 (-0.4)	30 (0.1)	.58 *(1.00)*
Economic frame	2 (-1.2)	30 (0.5)	7 (1.2)	24 (-0.5)	.07
Islam or Muslim	2 (0.4)	30 (-0.1)	1 (-0.4)	30 (0.1)	.57 *(1.00)*
Crime general	10 (0.1)	22 (-0.1)	9 (-0.1)	22 (0.1)	.85
Crime by minority	7 (0.0)	25 (0.0)	7 (0.0)	24 (0.0)	.95
Frames per time	*20%*		*21%*		

> H1. The use of the *responsibility frame* and the *morality frame* will increase after the attack.

A chi-square test showed significant relation between the timing and the *responsibility frame* indicating a decrease of this exact frame ($\chi2$ (1) = 4.09, *p* = .04) as shown in table 1. There was no difference found before and after the attack in the use of any of the

other frames. One unexpected trend was that the *economic frame* seems to be increasing after the attack in both the NRC as the Telegraaf.

Table 2. Differences in frames per newspaper

	NRC			Telegraaf			P
	Yes (std. res.)	% within NRC	No (std. res.)	Yes (std. res.)	% within Tele.	No (std. res.)	(*Fisher 2-tailed*)
Responsibility frame	12 (0.2)	37.5%	20 (-0.2)	10 (0.2)	32.3%	21 (-0.2)	.66
Human interest frame	19 (2.0)	59.4%	13 (-1.5)	5 (-2.0)	16.1%	26 (1.6)	**.00**
Conflict frame	6 (1.0)	18.8%	26 (-0.4)	2 (-1.0)	6.5%	29 (0.4)	.14 *(.26)*
Morality frame	2 (0.4)	6.3%	30 (-0.1)	1 (-0.4)	3.2%	30 (0.1)	.57 *(1.00)*
Economic frame	4 (-0.3)	12.5%	28 (0.1)	5 (0.3)	16.1%	26 (-0.1)	.68 *(.73)*
Islam or Muslim	1 (-0.4)	3.1%	31 (0.1)	2 (0.4)	6.5%	32 (-0.1)	.54 *(.61)*
Crime general	12 (0.8)	37.5%	20 (-0.5)	7 (-0.8)	22.6%	24 (0.5)	.20
Crime by minority	8 (0.3)	25%	24 (-0.2)	6 (-0.3)	19.4%	25 (0.2)	.59
Frames per newspaper	*25%*			*15%*			

A chi-square test showed significant relation between the newspapers and the *human interest frame* ($\chi 2$ (1) = 12.49, *p* = .00). Analyses of the standardized residuals show that the *human interest frame* was used significantly more often in the serious NRC than in the sensationalist Telegraaf as shown in table 2. The *conflict frame* seemed to be used slightly more by the NRC than the Telegraaf. Table 2 also indicates that the total amount of frames (yes answers) found in the NRC is higher than in the Telegraaf.

The word 'Muslim' or 'Islam' was found in, three articles (4,7%). Nevertheless, there was no significant difference in timing or newspaper as shown in tables 1 and 2. Table 2 seems to reveal a slight difference between the amount of crime references between the

two newspapers. NRC seems to have reported a little more on crime. This was not recognized when looking at the amount of times the crime was committed by the minority group (asylum seekers). A total of 19 articles were found reporting on crime.

Table 3. The mean amount of words between the Telegraaf and the NRC

	NRC				Telegraaf				
			Range				Range		
	Mean	SD	Min.	Max.	Mean	SD	Min.	Max.	*P*
Amount of words	507	219	87	804	197	106	39	507	**.000**

A chi-square test showed significant relation between the newspapers and the deviation of abroad and national news ($\chi2$ (2) = 12.52, *p* = .002). There were significantly more national news articles in the Telegraaf than there were in the NRC as displayed in table 3.

Table 4. Amount of national and abroad news articles

	NRC			Telegraaf			
	National	Abroad	Other*	National	Abroad	Other*	*P*
Category difference	10	15	7	23	7	1	**.002**

An unexpected finding was explored through an independent samples T-test which showed a significant difference in the average amount of words between the two newspapers (t (45.11)=7.15, *P* = .000). As table 4 shows, the Telegraaf had significantly less words than the NRC.

4. Discussion

>*"How are Syrian immigrants framed in the NRC and the Telegraaf before and after the Paris attack?"*

This research question was to be answered by analyzing 63 articles from the NRC and the Telegraaf aiming to test three hypotheses and answer three sub-questions. The amount references to violence and Islam hardly changed before and after the attack. All hypotheses were rejected because they were not in line with the outcomes of this study.

H1. The use of the *responsibility frame* and the *morality frame* will increase after the attack.

SQ1. In how many news articles about Syrian immigrants is Islam mentioned? Firstly, D'Haenens and Bink (2006) showed that the *responsibility frame* and the *morality frame* would increase after the attack in Islam related articles. Contrarily, the *responsibility frame* decreased significantly in this research and the *morality frame* remained similar. This could be due to the fact that this expectation was based on the framing of a Muslim minority group. This study has shown that Syrian refugees were not linked to Islam which would explain the dissenting outcome. The first hypothesis was therefore rejected and the answer to SQ1 is three articles (4,7%). Research could further explore the impact of an attack on the use of frames on other Muslim minorities and exploring to what extent they are linked to Islam.

H2. The human interest frame will be used most in all analysed articles.

H3. The NRC will use more responsibility and conflict frames where the Telegraaf will use more human interest frames.

Secondly, the Telegraaf would have a higher use of the *human interest frame (*Semetko & Valkenburg, 2000). Nonetheless, this frame was found to be significantly higher in the NRC. The expectation was based on a general corpus simply measuring different news outlets. D'Haenens and De Lange (2001), however, predicted that the *human interest frame* would be used more in articles about refugees. Hypothesis 2 complies with the increasing use of the *human interest frame* in the NRC. Hypothesis 2 was, nevertheless, rejected because the Telegraaf used the *responsibility frame* more than the *human interest frame.* Hypothesis three was not assumed either due to the significant before mentioned difference between the two news papers. Another possible explanation could be the higher total amount of frames found in the NRC. Which could also be a result of the significant difference in text length between articles gathered from the two newspapers. It would be interesting to study if this difference in text lengths applies to all categories in the NRC and the Telegraaf and, consequently, leads to more frames in all categories as well.

SQ2. In how many news articles about Syrian immigrants is terrorism, crime or violence mentioned?

SQ3. How does abroad or national news influence the frames used on Syrian immigrants?

Thirdly, the significant difference in abroad news and national news between the NRC and the Telegraaf was not expected or researched before. A corollary of this would be the, non-significant, higher number of crime references in the NRC. As mentioned in the literature review, abroad news is linked to crime more often than national news (D'Haenens & Bink, 2006). A total of 19 articles (30%) showed reference to general crime. This difference can also be explained in part that Syrian immigrants are war refugees, it stands to reason that articles on fleeing war refugees include more crime.

A fourth, unexpected, finding was the difference in text length between the articles from the two newspapers. The random observation was measured and resulted in a significant higher amount of words in the NRC than in the Telegraaf. This could influence outcomes like the amount of frames occurring in a text.

Limitations

The limitations to this research were mostly connected to the planning and limited amount of time. The initial plan was to gather a higher amount of articles, the corpus was quite small which could have influenced the results. The intercoder reliability was a little below satisfying for the responsibility frame, a small coding difference has a big impact on these outcomes due to the low amount of articles. Thereby, the limitation of the amount of words was too broad which resulted in a significant difference in text length. A last side note to this research was that the keywords were expanded to find more articles, which resulted in 91% of NRC's articles to contain the word 'Syrian' and only 46% of Telegraaf's articles. The focus of this study was Syrian immigrants and the ideal situation would have been for all articles to contain a Syrian and a refugee related word. The time frame indicates that the majority of the refugee population is Syrian and the vast majority of the articles contain a refugee related word. Regretfully it was not feasible to find a vast majority of Telegraaf's articles containing Syria related words.

Implications

The key strengths of the present study were that Syrian immigrants are not linked to the Islam, NRC reports more abroad news than the Telegraaf and that the human interest frame seems to be dominant when the articles in the corpus are about

refugees. This study could prove to be particularly valuable to research on framing Muslim minorities, framing refugees and comparing the sensationalist and serious newspapers in the before mentioned contexts. This study had also shown that there seem to be more differences between the NRC and the Telegraaf then the sensationalist and serious character. This information could be useful when comparing these newspapers.

For future research it might be interesting to look into the titles of the Telegraaf. Throughout the entire corpus the Telegraaf used that could embark fear by using selective facts. It was not always possible to capture these underlying messages with the current frame analyses. Examples of these titles are: "How many people have to be harboured by your government?", "Masses of refugees are impossible to harbour" (Telegraaf, 2015, November 5, my translation) and "Another million of Syrians are likely to come to Europe." (Telegraaf, 2015, September 11, my translation). More broadly, research is needed to determine if these titles can be analysed through a frame.

Secondly, it would also be interesting to verify if the Telegraaf also reports on national news more often than the NRC does in a different setting. Further study with more focus on the difference in text length and use of frames between the NRC and the Telegraaf could also be recommended.

A final interesting fact would be to explore if the use of the *human interest frame* occurs in more studies concerning refugees to verify if this is a dominant assumption one can make when studying frames applied on refugee related articles. In other words, refugee related articles seem to use the *human interest frame* regardless of the differences between sensationalist and serious newspapers.

5. Appendices

Appendix 1 (Semetko & Valkenburg, 2000, p.100).
Frame 1: Attribution of responsibility
1. Does the story suggest that some level of government has the ability to alleviate the problem?
2. Does the story suggest that some level of government is responsible for the issue/problem?
3. Does the story suggest solution(s) to the problem/issue?
4. Does the story suggest that an individual (or group of people in society) is responsible for the issue-problem?

5. Does the story suggest the problem requires urgent action?

Frame 2: Human interest frame
6. Does the story provide a human example or "human face" on the issue?
7. Does the story employ adjectives or personal vignettes that generate feelings of outrage, empathy-caring, sympathy or compassion?
8. Does the story emphasize how individuals and groups are affected by the issue/problem?
9. Does the story go into private or personal lives of the actors?
10. Does the story contain visual information that might generate feelings of outrage, empathy-caring, sympathy or compassion?

Frame 3: Conflict frame
11. Does the story reflect disagreement between parties-individuals-groups-countries?
12. Does one party-individual-group-country reproach another?
13. Does the story refer to two sides or to more than two sides of the problem or issue?
14. Does the story refer to winners and losers?

Frame 4: Morality frame
15. Does the story contain any moral message?
16. Does the story make reference to morality, God, and other religious tenets?
17. Does the story offer specific social prescriptions about how to behave?

Frame 5: Economic frame
18. Is there a mention of financial losses or gains now or in the future?
19. Is there a mention of the costs/degree of expense involved?
20. Is there a reference to economic consequences of pursuing or not pursuing a course of action?

Appendix 2 Intercoder reliability test.

Frame 1: Attribution of responsibility
1. Does the story suggest that some level of government has the ability to alleviate the problem?
2. Does the story suggest that some level of government is responsible for the issue/problem?
3. Does the story suggest solution(s) to the problem/issue?
4. Does the story suggest that an individual (or group of people in society) is responsible for the issue-problem?
5. Does the story suggest the problem requires urgent action?

Frame 2: Human interest frame
6. Does the story provide a human example or "human face" on the issue?
7. Does the story employ adjectives or personal vignettes that generate feelings of outrage, empathy-caring, sympathy or compassion?
8. Does the story emphasize how individuals and groups are affected by the issue/problem?
9. Does the story go into private or personal lives of the actors?
10. Does the story contain visual information that might generate feelings of outrage, empathy-caring, sympathy or compassion?

Frame 3: Conflict frame
11. Does the story reflect disagreement between parties-individuals-groups-countries?
12. Does one party-individual-group-country reproach another?
13. Does the story refer to two sides or to more than two sides of the problem or issue?
14. Does the story refer to winners and losers?

Frame 4: Morality frame
15. Does the story contain any moral message?
16. Does the story make reference to morality, God, and other religious tenets?
17. Does the story offer specific social prescriptions about how to behave?

Frame 5: Economic frame
18. Is there a mention of financial losses or gains now or in the future?
19. Is there a mention of the costs/degree of expense involved?
20. Is there a reference to economic consequences of pursuing or not pursuing a course of action?

Extra Frame
21. Is Islam or Muslim mentionned in this article?
22. Does this article include any form of crime, violence or terrorism linked to Islam or Muslims?
23. Does the article mention Syrians or arabs?
24. Does the article mention Assylumseeker, fugitive or immigrant?
25. Was violence executed by minority? (perpetrators)

Instruction for second coder: Necla Babayigit

Type the number 1 when frame is observed and type nothing when frame is not observed.

Q	NRC before			NRC after			Telegraaf before			Telegraaf after		
	1	2	3	1	2	3	1	2	3	1	2	3
Q1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q6	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q7	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q8	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q9	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q11	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q12	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q13	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q14	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q15	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q16	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q17	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q18	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q19	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q20	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q21	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q22	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q23	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q24	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Q25	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

6. References

Centraal bureau voor de statistiek (27-02-2016). *Asielverzoeken op nationaliteit vanaf 1975 tot 2015* [database]. Den haag/Heerlen: CBS. Consulted on 03-03-2016 statline.cbs.nl – asielverzoeken

D'Haenens, L & Bink, S. (2006). Islam in de Nederlandse media: Focus op het Algemeen Dagblad. *Tijdschrift voor Communicatie Wetenschap, 4,* 351-367.

D'Haenens, L & De Lange, M. (2001). Framing of asylum seekers in Dutch regional newspapers. *Media, Culture & Society, 23,* 847-860.

De Vreese, C. H. (2005). News framing: Theory and typology. *Information Design Journal + Document Design, 13*(1), 51-62.

Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Towards clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication, 43* (4), 51-58.

Neuman, W., Just, M., & Crigler, A. (1992). *Common Knowledge.* Chicago: Chicago Press.

Semetko, H. A., & Valkenburg, P. M. (2000). Framing European politics: A content analysis of press and television news*. Journal of Communication, 50*(2), 93-109.

The world fact book (15-03-2016). *Bosnia and Herzegovina* [database]*.* Washington: Central Intelligence Agency. Consulted on 07-03-2016. Cia.gov – worldfactbook Bosnia and Herzegovina

Vliegenthart, R. & Boomgaarden, H.G. (2007). Real world indicators and the coverage of immigration and the integration of minorities in Dutch newspapers. *European Journal of Communication*, *23*(3), 293–314.

Vliegenthart, R. & van Zoonen, L. (2011). Power to the frame: Bringing sociology back to frame analysis. *European Journal of Communication*, *26*(2), 101–115.

World data bank (2015). *Refugee population by country or territory of origin* 2014 [database]. Consulted on 10-03-2016. Data.worldbank.org – refugee population

7. Source list

NRC by Bastiaan Nagtegaal (2016, January 28). *Kijken: het leven van de vluchtelingen op Lesbos.* Retrieved from www.nrc.nl.

NRC by Floor Boon (October 21, 2015) *Premier 'trots' op asielhulp, ook na moord met zwaard.* Retrieved from www.nrc.nl.

NRC by Maral Noshad Sharifi (November 6, 2015) *In Zwitserland moeten migranten al betalen.* Retrieved from www.nrc.nl.

NRC by Maral Noshad Sharifi, (January 18, 2016). *Jong en alleen op de vlucht. En dan de verkeerde tegenkomen.* Retrieved from www.nrc.nl.

Telegraaf. (2015, September 11). *Mogelijk nog miljoenen Syriers naar Europa.* Retrieved from www.Telegraaf.nl.

Telegraaf (2015, October 12) *Joodse organisaties bezorgd over noodopvang.* Retrieved from www.Telegraaf.nl.

Telegraaf. (2015, November 5). *Hoeveel mensen moet uw gemeente nog een plek geven?* Retrieved from www.Telegraaf.nl.

Telegraaf. (2015, November 5). *Massa vluchtelingen niet te huisvesten.* Retrieved from www.Telegraaf.nl.

Telegraaf (2015, December 1) *350 miljoen voor Syrische vluchtelingen.* Retrieved from www.Telegraaf.nl.